



Welsh Government

Consultation – summary of responses to Careers and work- related Experience (CWRE) Guidance

Analysis of consultation responses on additional guidance for the Curriculum for Wales

Final Version, January 2022

Analysis of Consultation Responses on Additional Guidance for the Curriculum for Wales: CWRE

Nick Miller, Kerry KilBride, Dr Nick Morgan, Jessica Mann, Sophie Wheeler / Miller Research (UK) Ltd.
Heledd Bebb / Old Bell 3



For further information please contact:

Nick Miller

nick@miller-research.co.uk

Pen-y-Wyrlod, Llanvetherine, Abergavenny, Monmouthshire, NP7 8RG, UK

www.miller-research.co.uk | 01873 851880 | Twitter: @miller_research

Table of contents

Table of contents	iii
1. Introduction	v
2. Overview of Responses	7
3. Additional Curriculum Guidance for CWRE: Consultation Questions 1-12	9
Question 1: <i>Is the published Curriculum for Wales guidance and this draft Curriculum for Wales guidance for Careers and Work-Related Experiences (CWRE) clearly aligned?</i>	9
Question 2: <i>Does this draft guidance for CWRE sufficiently cater for the needs of all learners from the age of 3 to 16, including those who have additional learning needs when planning, designing, and delivering the curriculum and assessment in schools and other settings?</i>	10
Question 3: <i>Does this draft guidance contextualise the CWRE learning to help schools and other settings when planning, designing, and implementing curriculum and assessment for learners?</i>	11
Question 4: <i>Does this draft guidance provide clear information outlining who should be responsible for different aspects of the design and implementation of CWRE learning in the curriculum in schools and other settings?</i>	13
Question 6: <i>Which aspects, if any, of this guidance do you feel are most helpful?</i>	15
Question 7: <i>Are there any aspects of this guidance that you feel are too prescriptive?</i>	16
Question 8: <i>Are there any aspects of this guidance that you feel are not detailed enough?</i>	18
Question 9: <i>Do you have any further points to make specifically in relation to this draft Curriculum for Wales guidance for CWRE or is there any additional information that you think should be included?</i>	22

Question 10: <i>We would like to know your views on the effects that the draft Curriculum for Wales guidance for CWRE would have on the Welsh language, specifically on: - opportunities for people to use Welsh - treating the Welsh language no less favourably than the English language.</i>	24
Question 11: <i>Please also explain how you believe the draft Curriculum for Wales guidance for CWRE could be formulated or changed so as to have: -positive effects or increased positive effects on opportunities for people to use the Welsh language and on treating the Welsh language no less favourably than the English language -no adverse effects on opportunities for people to use the Welsh language and on treating the Welsh language no less favourably than the English language.</i>	26
Additional comments	27
4. Additional Responses.....	31
5. Consultation Workshops	42

1. Introduction

- 1.1 The Curriculum for Wales Framework was published on the 28th of January 2020 which included the Curriculum for Wales guidance for schools, settings, and other practitioners involved in designing a curriculum. Careers and Work Related Experience (CWRE) was included as a cross-cutting element across the new Curriculum for Wales, applicable for learners from the ages of 3 to 16. Before its publication, the Framework was subject to a broad and extensive consultation. This feedback signaled the specific additional guidance that schools and other educational settings would require in order to successfully design the new curriculum. One of these additional guidance was required for CWRE.
- 1.2 In alignment with the principle underpinning the Curriculum for Wales, guidance documents intentionally avoid prescribing curriculum delivery, providing schools and settings with agency in designing and delivering the curriculum.
- 1.3 The additional guidance for CWRE aims to inspire learners at the earliest ages to develop an understanding of the purpose of work in life for both themselves and society as a whole, guiding and supporting them through the process of securing practical work experience towards the end of secondary school.
- 1.4 The eight-week consultation on draft additional guidance for CWRE was issued in May 2021 seeking views from schools and closed on 16 July. The consultation phase forms part of the co-construction process and provides a vital opportunity for all practitioners and other stakeholders to provide input supporting the development of the guidance.
- 1.5 Miller Research, in conjunction with Old Bell 3, was commissioned to undertake an independent consultation analysis, consisting of workshop consultations with stakeholders, and the dissemination of written responses to the additional guidance.

- 1.6 During the consultation period, a series of six workshops were held, which were open to a wide range of practitioners and stakeholders. These took place between the 16th of June and the 8th of July. The workshops were themed, with specific workshops offered to different stakeholder groups, such as employers, secondary school practitioners and stakeholders, primary school practitioners and stakeholders. Specific workshops were held as well for Careers Wales, career specialized practitioners, local authority and regional consortia representatives. A catch-all session was also held, open to everyone to attend.
- 1.7 Responses to the consultation and the input to these workshops were independently analysed and summarised to form the basis of this report. This report is divided into two sections. The first provides the analysis of the written responses to the consultation. The second provided an analysis of the consultation workshops.
- 1.8 The guidance on CWRE will be embedded into the Curriculum for Wales guidance. References to the CWRE guidance should read as references to the Curriculum for Wales sections which refer to CWRE. References to CWRE will feature in sections of the guidance that covers 'Designing your curriculum', each of the 'Areas of Learning and Experience' (under the cross-curriculum themes for that Area) and 'Curriculum for Wales: summary of proposed legislation'.

2. Overview of Responses

- 2.1 The consultation for the additional guidance on CWRE within the new Curriculum for Wales received a total of 48 substantive responses.
- 2.2 The questionnaire's design employed a combination of both open and closed questions, allowing space for respondents to provide detailed feedback, and raise any questions or relevant concerns.
- 2.3 Of the 48 total responses, 44 responses were submitted in English, and 4 responses were submitted in Welsh. In addition to the survey, further written responses were submitted on behalf of the following key stakeholders: Careers Wales, NASUWT Cymru, Learning Disability Wales, the Wales Trades Union Congress (TUC), UNISON Cymru, and the National Deaf Children's Society Cymru.
- 2.4 The majority of survey respondents had an occupational role within or related to the education sector, with 35 responding on behalf of schools/settings/organisations, and 9 responding as individuals. Respondents represented a range of groups including public sector bodies, local authorities, further education institutions, regional consortia, and employers. Of the responses, a relatively small proportion were from education practitioners, with 9 from mainstream school practitioners, and 1 from a practitioner in a special school. There were 7 responses from professional bodies or interest groups.
- 2.5 The common theme within the responses reflected a consensus surrounding the importance of CWRE in developing well-rounded learners, equipped for the world of work. Positive comments were received both from written responses to the consultation and from workshop participants as to the importance that careers and work-related experiences is afforded within the new curriculum through this additional guidance. A number of respondents and workshop participants particularly noted the significance of the guidance in terms of improving social mobility, providing consideration for skills such as entrepreneurship, and making a positive contribution to the labour market. The principal concerns raised by respondents to the

consultation and workshop participants related to the practicality of implementing the CWRE guidance within the Curriculum for Wales using the resources that education settings currently have available.

3. Additional Curriculum Guidance for CWRE: Consultation Questions 1-12

3.1 This section provides a chronological breakdown of responses across each question of the survey. Responses have been analysed to gain a sense of overall sentiment, key themes, and areas of concern and contestation.

Question 1: *Is the published Curriculum for Wales guidance and this draft Curriculum for Wales guidance for Careers and Work-Related Experiences (CWRE) clearly aligned?*

3.2 In total, 38 respondents agreed that the documents are well aligned, with 6 respondents citing factors such as an emphasis on ‘clear links’ to the Curriculum for Wales and the four purposes as proof of alignment. Conversely, 8 respondents did not agree, and 2 did not answer. The responses reflect a strong agreement that both documents are aligned and work effectively in conjunction with one another. The response to this question largely aligned with the feedback received from participants of the CWRE consultation workshops, which were also positive on the alignment.

3.3 Other respondents highlighted the manner in which the CWRE guidance matches the ethos of the broader Curriculum for Wales guidance, allowing educational settings to play a direct role in the management and creation of their own curriculum. Positive feedback surrounding this point included:- ‘*The draft guidance reinforces the Curriculum for Wales, highlighting the responsibility of all schools and settings to design their curriculum with CWRE as a cross cutting theme,*’ and ‘*This guidance provides enough autonomy to schools and settings to design their own curriculum.*’

3.4 Of the respondents that answered ‘no’, a central area of concern revolved around the lack of sufficient information on how a non-maintained setting can apply the guidance. Other reasons included a lack of consideration of alignment and coherence between the guidance the education system as a whole.

- 3.5 One respondent also felt that the guidance did not engage enough with the Wellbeing of Future Generations Act, especially given the climate emergency is the biggest challenge facing society. Another respondent commented that wider consideration on helping to develop 'ethically informed citizens' was 'missing'. The participant felt that framing the guidance in such a way that acknowledges how different the world will be for young people in the future is important contextually.
- 3.6 Finally, 3 respondents made comments surrounding a lack of clarity and specificity within the guidance. Descriptions included 'vague' and 'generalised' links to the Four Purposes and Area of Learning Experience (AOLE). These present a contrasting viewpoint to responses that felt that the guidance was sufficiently non-prescriptive, highlighting the differences of interpretation of the guidance and its detail.

Question 2: Does this draft guidance for CWRE sufficiently cater for the needs of all learners from the age of 3 to 16, including those who have additional learning needs when planning, designing, and delivering the curriculum and assessment in schools and other settings?

- 3.7 This question received mixed responses, with a total of 29 'yes' responses. In all, 17 respondents stated 'no', that it does not cater for all learners.
- 3.8 Of the 'yes' responses, 4 respondents indicated that the guidance is a positive start as it includes all learners, but emphasised that there is still work to be done.
- 3.9 There were some responses who expressed that the guidance is described as 'high level' and therefore not detailed enough when it comes to specific learners with Additional Learning Needs. Around 12 respondents made comments citing their concern that the guidance is not applicable to *all* learners.

- 3.10 Another common theme in the responses was the need for more specifically tailored resources for primary and pre-school settings, given these settings have not delivered CWRE as part of the curriculum. Responses also suggested that certain aspects of the language within the guidance have the potential to be 'limiting', for example, the reference to fostering 'realism of future possibilities', which was viewed as restrictive in tone.
- 3.11 Respondents also highlighted an opportunity to support bilingualism in English-medium settings through CWRE resources provided in both languages. One respondent viewed this as being supportive to the wider goals of CWRE in strengthening young people's access to work and employability in Wales.
- 3.12 Finally, respondents also suggested that the guidance needs to do more for learners who do not 'fit in' with the traditional curriculum. In order to truly cater to all learners, this also requires a detailed approach for those who do not follow the mainstream academic pathway. To address this issue, another respondent recommended that there should be more coverage and information on vocational pathways within the guidance.
- 3.13 Overall, the written responses to the consultation largely matched the positive sentiment expressed within the consultation workshops in relation to this question.

Question 3: Does this draft guidance contextualise the CWRE learning to help schools and other settings when planning, designing, and implementing curriculum and assessment for learners?

- 3.14 Of the total responses, 31 respondents 'yes' and 17 answered 'no'.
- 3.15 For those who agreed, a number of positive comments were provided, with one respondent pleased at the inclusion of a glossary. Other respondents were pleased with the structure of the document and the information on who should be supporting its development.

- 3.16 Another respondent agreed that the guidance does contextualise and enable schools to begin planning their curriculum. However, they felt that the guidance is 'weaker' at providing information on *how* practitioners can implement the curriculum and assessment practices. This point is a common theme across the consultation questions focussing on the 'how' and the practicalities of achieving successful CWRE provision which meet all of the aims outlined in the guidance.
- 3.17 There was a particular area of concern expressed by a small number of respondents with contextualisation surrounding learners with additional needs. One participant explained that context can be essential for learners outside of mainstream settings or with complex needs. In these instances, organising and facilitating work related experiences can pose a great deal of additional challenges for all involved. Greater consideration of the range of situations that may occur, and how to overcome these obstacles, would be welcomed by practitioners.
- 3.18 One respondent who responded with a 'no' emphasised a specific area, understanding 'labour market intelligence', would require professional learning and training for teachers. Greater contextualisation was also sought in terms of demonstrating how skills and knowledge can be developed through the world of work, and how the successful implementation of CWRE can achieve this.
- 3.19 As with the consultation workshops, most respondents to the online consultation responded positively to this question, however, few respondents that answered 'yes' left comments to elaborate. As a result, a greater number of positive comments were collected on this question from the workshops. More critical comments were received from written responses than from workshop participants, which reflects the different nature of both means of collecting feedback, with the written responses allowing more opportunity for considered reflection and critique.

Question 4: Does this draft guidance provide clear information outlining who should be responsible for different aspects of the design and implementation of CWRE learning in the curriculum in schools and other settings?

- 3.20 This question provides a far stronger agreement in terms of response, with 33 respondents answering 'yes'. Of the remaining respondents, 12 responded 'no', whilst 3 respondents declined to give a 'yes' or 'no' answer.
- 3.21 Those who agreed that the information is clear provided further elaboration on their answers such as: '*The document does give good indications of who is responsible in different contexts, we welcome that it identifies those with overall and individual responsibility for success*'.
- 3.22 In terms of providing direction for *who* is responsible for the different aspects of implementing CWRE learning, the issues that respondents raised include a lack of clarity in detailing the roles of partners within the process. One participant outlined a range of partners that could be given greater consideration in the document, such as employers from 'anchor industries', as well as SMEs and regional learning/skills partnerships.
- 3.23 The lack of attention to the role that higher and further education institutions may also play in helping to deliver and facilitate the CWRE guidance was also mentioned here, with the respondent feeling that these areas have been largely neglected by the draft guidance due to the focus on learners aged 3-16.
- 3.24 One respondent felt that given the guidance focusses rightly on learners aged 3-16, there needs to be more attention on the parts that higher and FE institutions can play in helping to deliver the CWRE guidance.
- 3.25 Generally, written responses to the consultation and workshop participants both reflected positively on this question, with some suggestions and minor criticisms made through both formats.

Question 5: Does this draft guidance support and help schools and other settings to integrate CWRE learning when planning, designing, and implementing curriculum and assessment for learners?

- 3.26 Responses to this question were far more mixed than previous questions. In total, 23 respondents answered 'yes', with 22 respondents responding 'no'. There were 3 respondents that chose not to give a clear 'yes' or 'no' response.
- 3.27 Positive feedback on the guidance included the recognition that CWRE should not be a 'stand-alone' part of a school's curriculum: *'It makes clear the responsibility of all staff to integrate CWRE into their planning and teaching.'* However, the respondent further emphasised the importance of practitioners having a sufficient understanding of employers' needs and demands in the future, suggesting that further information on this could be a useful resource for practitioners.
- 3.28 Other positive comments included:- *'There are sections that look at skills, AOLE's and the different stakeholders with a role to play in the development of the CWRE. These all help to showcase to schools how the CWRE curriculum developed for their setting should be integrated in their overall curriculum'*. In addition to these comments, 3 other 'yes' respondents elaborated that the guidance is seen as relevant and helpful to secondary school settings.
- 3.29 Central issues revolve around the perception that pre-secondary school settings have been somewhat overlooked. In terms of the practicalities of practitioners delivering CWRE in these settings, one participant expressed the feeling that they were *'Personally struggling to see opportunities for the youngest pupils to develop in this area'*.
- 3.30 Questions also remain surrounding 'how' the guidance can be implemented on a practical level. Respondents described the guidance as a 'big picture' overview, with aspects of implementation and assessment 'not being fleshed out enough'. In terms of

implementation, it was suggested that potential barriers have not been fully considered, such as issues that some settings could face if they are located in an area with limited opportunity or engagement with agencies and employers.

3.31 Respondents suggested a number of further elements which would be welcomed to provide the level of support that they are seeking. Regarding these suggestions, it should be noted that it is not within the remit of the guidance to go into great detail on, for example, pupil progression or professional learning. These include:

- A framework to help teachers plan learner's progression.
- Clear references to development pathways
- A focus on a set standards to ensure a level playing field for all learners
- Consideration for schools of larger and varying sizes, and therefore challenges to overcome in terms of resourcing and provision
- Greater detail in terms of professional learning to support schools

3.32 There were similarities between the feedback given by respondents and workshop participants, with mixed views expressed on this question. A common theme of criticisms and concerns from each group centred around the need for greater detail and clarity on a range of areas.

Question 6: Which aspects, if any, of this guidance do you feel are most helpful?

3.33 Question 6 posed an open question and asked respondents to detail any elements of the guidance that they found to be helpful. Twenty-seven responses were given to this question in all. Eleven respondents chose to leave this question blank.

3.34 On the whole, respondents shared a positive sentiment towards the ambition of the guidance and its key aims. Respondents welcomed

the fact that this is now statutory guidance across ages 3-16, with recognition that it *'clearly sets the tone of the change and what is being aimed for'* in the Curriculum for Wales.

- 3.35 There was also positive feedback surrounding the guidance's sections on learning, aligning the curriculum, and the steps which provide direction for planning and designing the curriculum. One participant recognised the importance of the document in communicating what is expected to be delivered beyond the scope academic qualifications – citing this as a vital aspect for progression to the world of work and to gaining general life-skills.
- 3.36 Other respondents welcomed the acknowledgement of the range of different sectors that young people may aspire to work within, or find opportunities in, including sectors with a focus on sustainability. The forward thinking of 'green jobs' as a growing area of opportunity was specifically emphasised for demonstrating an awareness of the rapidly changing employment market.

Question 7: Are there any aspects of this guidance that you feel are too prescriptive?

- 3.37 Overall, the majority of respondents found the guidance not too prescriptive, with 38 responses answering 'no' and only 6 respondents answering 'yes'.
- 3.38 Of those who felt the guidance had gotten the balance right, key responses included:-
- 'About right' for secondary schools
 - The 'essence' of the document is not too prescriptive
 - "Provides sufficient flexibility for schools"
 - "It is clear that it is the school's responsibility under the new curriculum, to provide a CWRE curriculum that is bespoke to its learners."

3.39 However, some respondents who agree that the guidance is not too prescriptive expressed concerns that the guidance is not detailed enough. It should be noted that the guidance document intentionally avoids prescribing curriculum delivery, and that education practitioners constituted a relatively small proportion of the respondents (10 out of 48). Responses that found the guidance document not detailed enough stated the following:

- Is “too broad, generalised, and aimed at older children”
- Is “too light” for primary and specialist school settings
- “Would benefit from having ‘real school’ case studies and exemplars to strengthen it, without adding unwanted granularity”
- Needs to be clearer on the role of external agencies such as Careers Wales as “they provide the current links to employers and expertise on areas such as career guidance and work experience.”

3.40 Two responses expressed concerns that the guidance was too prescriptive in certain areas and highlighted the potential negative implications that this could have on teacher workload, the ability of schools to respond flexibly to their needs, and the extent to which the guidance reduces prescription and promoted agency. These responses included the following:-

- AOLE descriptions: “could be reduced and improved to avoid superficial treatment by schools and to meet increased curriculum demands. Should also be less specific to the skills required and more specific to occupations which require those skills”
- “Not enough stress on modern foreign languages, only growing importance of communication in Welsh is stressed.”

Other concerns noted in relation to this question were as follows:

- Need to go beyond Careers Wales toward a list of “approved providers” to provide greater flexibility for schools and draw upon a diversity of organisations.
- “There are a number of third sector, employer representative organisations etc who can offer considerable help and support to curriculum planners – they should feel empowered to engage new stakeholders as well as the familiar.”
- Expressed concern from a Mainstream school practitioner that the additional guidance is ‘overloading the curriculum’ and that teachers will not have the capacity to implement the guidance alongside their existing workload.

Question 8: Are there any aspects of this guidance that you feel are not detailed enough?

- 3.41 The majority of respondents agreed that there are aspects of the guidance provided which are not detailed enough, with 30 responses answering ‘yes’ to this statement and 15 answering ‘no’. As stated above, the intention of the guidance document is to avoid prescription and provide practitioners with agency in designing and delivering the curriculum. Therefore, some requests for more detail throughout the consultation questions do not align with the principle of the guidance.
- 3.42 A number of areas where the guidance could benefit from further detail were highlighted. This included more explicit alignment of the additional CWRE guidance with existing Welsh Government priorities and initiatives including: the Well-being of Future Generations Act (2015), achieving climate change goals, increasing diversity, and preparing young people for the future needs of the economy and the ‘new world’ of work. In addition, it was felt by respondents that CWRE needed to be more consistent with the new curriculum including the use of progression steps to distinguish the needs of younger pupils from older ones and facilitate measurement of progress in this area.

- 3.43 A number of respondents highlighted the need for additional detail to ensure that the CWRE guidance was a practical and useful guide for practitioners in designing the CWRE aspect into their curriculum. To this end, inclusion of case studies and examples of best of practice were recommended. Careers Wales and Welsh Government are working to develop resources in preparation for the rollout of the Curriculum for Wales.
- 3.44 Respondents also suggested that a list of ‘approved’ organisations could be provided, which could be utilised as additional resources in this area. One respondent highlighted the “Go Construct – ‘Experience, Educate and Engage” initiative utilized by the construction industry to raise awareness, as an example of best practice in this area. It was felt by respondents that additional exemplars and case studies could give practitioners the confidence they need to implement CWRE guidance to support their curriculum planning.
- 3.45 This need was expected to be particularly strong amongst primary school practitioners, who have had less experience of engaging with CWRE historically. In addition, one respondent felt that greater clarity could have been provided on the role played by key stakeholders such as regional education consortia and further education providers in implementation of CWRE.
- 3.46 Another area where respondents felt more detail could have been included was in addressing the diversity of needs across learners. It was felt that CWRE would need to cover a diverse range of learners depending on the educational setting in which CWRE is delivered, the age of the learner and range of additional challenges they may face. These include, but are not limited to, additional learning needs, having English as a second language, free school meals eligibility and being a young person not in education, employment or training. For specialist settings, it was suggested that useful forms of support could include relevant, up to date, labour market information and a work search platform which includes opportunities appropriate to the

learner's qualification level, which may be lower than levels typically achieved in a mainstream setting. Respondents highlighted the need for CWRE guidance to be appropriate and tailored to the needs of the learner, ensuring that throughout the process the voice of the individual learner is heard.

- 3.47 Respondents recognised the key role that Careers Wales already plays in the area of delivering CWRE in schools, with one respondent stating that “the support of Careers Wales will be vital and without it many schools would find it difficult to provide the learners with sufficient opportunities.” However, respondents also felt that, due to resource constraints, there was the need to go beyond Careers Wales in delivering CWRE with a list of approved resources being highlighted as potentially useful.
- 3.48 One respondent highlighted Construction Industry Training Board (CITB) research on recruitment in the construction sector. The research suggested that formal careers guidance and advice was less of a determining factor in career choice when compared to less formal methods such as internet research, personal networks, social media, and teachers. From these findings, the respondent suggested that embedding CWRE throughout the curriculum across all subjects is the best approach to providing young people with better access to information about opportunities.
- 3.49 Regarding arranging work related experiences for learners, Careers Wales was once again acknowledged as an important source of support for schools, utilising their expertise in this area and acting as brokers between employers and schools in the process of organising work experience placements. As a result, respondents felt the need for greater detail and clarity over how Careers Wales would continue to support in this area as it is acknowledged that without their support, schools would struggle to arrange appropriate work placements, particularly in more rural settings with fewer local employers.

- 3.50 Respondents were also concerned with how schools would be able to measure progress achieved through implementing CWRE, as well as whether and how this progress would be subject to external evaluation. Evaluation of the outcomes of CWRE delivery within the curriculum should be based on the impact on pupils' learning and progress.
- 3.51 Multiple respondents suggested that progress ought to be benchmarked to assess which schools are achieving well in this area. Respondents highlighted the Gatsby model as a robust measure of progress in this area which could be useful for benchmarking. One respondent highlighted the need for development goals to assess progress in this area such as a 'phased process' for introducing CWRE topics across the curriculum and 'professional learning' for practitioners.
- 3.52 In addition to areas that respondents highlighted as potentially benefiting from further detail, respondents also raised a number of questions they felt had not been sufficiently addressed by the existing guidance including:
- Who will fund members of the profession to undertake placements with local businesses?
 - What standards will be expected?
 - Who will support schools to adapt to the change?
 - Who assesses the impact?
 - What stakeholders should be involved in the development of the curriculum?
 - How will local, regional, and national priorities will be factored in?
 - How will the needs of different sectors of the economy be catered for?
 - What scope there is for specialisation?
 - How are schools going to be held to account and by what criteria are they going to be evaluated?

- Who is going to perform evaluations and what authority will they have?

Question 9: *Do you have any further points to make specifically in relation to this draft Curriculum for Wales guidance for CWRE or is there any additional information that you think should be included?*

- 3.53 The majority of responses to this question identified opportunities for additional information to be included in the proposed CWRE guidance.
- 3.54 A majority of responses suggested the guidance could benefit from inclusion of additional information such as:
- How CWRE will address a diversity of learner needs including learners 'not suited' to school, learners in non-maintained settings and learners of varying age groups. In non-maintained educational settings, one respondent recommended that CWRE needs a greater inclusion of holistic and relevant examples to improve engagement such as learning through stories, role play, visits, and visitors. In addition, it is recognised that needs of learners will vary with age and so the use of an age-appropriate progression table, similar to that included in the Relationships and Sexuality Education guidance, may be beneficial in ensuring CWRE is delivered and measured through age-appropriate stages.
 - Recognition of the importance of key skills development: including social entrepreneurship and digital skills, and how these can be utilised to address key social and environmental challenges e.g., climate change. In addition, it is felt that greater emphasis could be placed on the role of extracurricular activities in developing key skills and employability.
 - How ongoing work experience challenges will be addressed: including high insurance costs, reprioritisation by schools, lack

of ownership, and lack of resources. One respondent felt a minimum work experience requirement could be set for each learner in order to address 'historical underperformance' in this area.

- Raising awareness of the benefits of CWRE: respondents felt that in order for CWRE to be successful key partners including schools, parents, carers, and learners would need a better understanding of the importance of CWRE for improving attainment, employability, and wages. In addition, one respondent highlighted how businesses may need a better understanding of how engaging with CWRE benefits their business and the wider business community in order to be engaged in delivering CWRE support in schools.
- Improving awareness of opportunities and resources: respondents felt that the benefits of the CWRE guidance could be improved through further emphasis on the opportunities provided by FE colleges, international language study, Welsh language study, and more in-depth engagement with employers e.g., visits and field trips. In addition, one respondent highlighted that it may be beneficial for schools to have access to a comprehensive list of organisations from which support and guidance can be accessed to enable greater flexibility for schools in implementing CWRE guidance.

3.55 In addition, a number of respondents felt that the guidance could be improved through providing greater clarity on the following areas:

- Defining expectations and ownership for schools and curriculum leads as CWRE is not a mandated area
- How schools will be measured and monitored at every level to ensure effective progress
- How curriculum planning will be continuously evaluated and improved
- How schools can involve employers, regional consortia, and other key stakeholders in the process of co-creation.

3.56 One respondent found the level of detail contained in the proposed CWRE guidance sufficient, with one respondent stating that the “guidance is deliberately written at a high level and provides a good overview and understanding of what CWRE is, as well as how it can be contextualised within the Curriculum for Wales.”

Question 10: We would like to know your views on the effects that the draft Curriculum for Wales guidance for CWRE would have on the Welsh language, specifically on:

- opportunities for people to use Welsh**
- treating the Welsh language no less favourably than the English language.**

3.57 In all, 27 respondents did not disclose whether they expected the introduction of CWRE guidance may and impact on the Welsh language or the parity of treatment between Welsh and English. Twenty-one respondents provided feedback on this question.

3.58 A number of responses recognised and highlighted the importance of utilising the CWRE guidance to promote the Welsh language stating that:

- “I see the CWRE as additional learning in order to match the employment needs with better equipped students when they leave education. Learning the Welsh language is part and parcel of everyday life in Wales.”
- CWRE needs to look outward to Welsh Language opportunities in ‘industry, business and Welsh speaking communities.’
- “We are pleased to see reference and importance of learners being ‘aware of the increasing demand for Welsh in the workplace, as Wales works towards the target of a million Welsh speakers by 2050.”

3.59 Two respondents believed that the proposed guidance would not negatively impact the Welsh language, or would have a ‘neutral effect’ on the Welsh language.

3.60 The majority of comments made by respondents to this question highlighted opportunities which could be exploited to promote a positive effective on the Welsh language. Opportunities to develop greater opportunities to positively impact the Welsh language included:

- More explicit reference to the need to embed the Welsh language in CWRE
- Assurance of same time access to bilingual CWRE resources including during delivery of training and courses
- Potential to utilise an immersion approach to Welsh delivery of CWRE resources
- Highlighting to learners the benefits of learning the Welsh language to improve employability
- Highlighting to employers the benefits of promoting Welsh language careers and employing Welsh language speakers
- Greater scoping of the availability of Welsh language employers to deliver support to schools
- Greater engagement of Welsh language employers in Welsh language only events
- Greater engagement of schools with bilingual providers of employment support and guidance
- Guidance to learners of how to identify Welsh language employers when searching for jobs
- Utilising specific, up to date examples of a variety of companies which utilise the Welsh language so learners can see the benefit of Welsh language learning for their career development
- Potential to utilise a more localised approach to integrating Welsh language opportunities into careers advice
- Potential to seek input from Welsh language specialists including the Welsh National College (Y Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol) and Welsh language employers

- Need for engagement of Welsh speaking businesses in English medium schools as well as Welsh medium schools to ensure greater access to and awareness of Welsh speaking businesses.

3.61 A minority of respondents felt that the CWRE guidance is sufficient in its treatment of the Welsh Language stating that:

- “We believe that this document supports the Government ambition to ensure there are one million Welsh speakers by 2050.”
- “The new curriculum does give opportunities for schools to fully implement the Welsh language according to their needs.”
- “This guidance would continue to promote the use of Welsh Language and widen the opportunities for people to use Welsh.”

3.62 The consultation responses provided significantly more detail and commentary on the impact of the effect that the guidance will have on the Welsh language than was collected through the workshops, with few workshop participants providing thoughts. Those that did comment on this question generally felt there were no specific issues.

Question 11: Please also explain how you believe the draft Curriculum for Wales guidance for CWRE could be formulated or changed so as to have:

- positive effects or increased positive effects on opportunities for people to use the Welsh language and on treating the Welsh language no less favourably than the English language***
- no adverse effects on opportunities for people to use the Welsh language and on treating the Welsh language no less favourably than the English language.***

3.63 The majority of respondents did not have any additional comments in response to this question. Eleven respondents provided comments, with three further respondents referring only to their answers to the

previous question (“see previous answer,” or “see the answer to question 10”).

- 3.64 A number of responses highlighted the importance of integration of the Welsh language into CWRE guidance in order to “open the walls between schools and Welsh language employers and professionals.”
- 3.65 Some of the opportunities highlighted by respondents to improve opportunities for using the Welsh language included:-
- The opportunity to include the Welsh language in each Area of Learning and Experience in the new curriculum not just within the Languages, Literacy and Communication AOLE
 - The encouragement of better connections between schools and Welsh language employers and professionals
 - Recognising the need for bilingual access to careers resources and highlighting the resources already available from Careers Wales
 - Encouraging English medium schools to support learners to develop their Welsh language skills through CWRE
 - Highlighting the demand for Welsh within the workplace and the associated career benefits to learners
 - Highlighting the benefits of learning Welsh from an early age.

Additional comments

- 3.66 Respondents were asked to report any issues they were concerned with regarding the CWRE guidance that were not specifically addressed throughout the previous questions.
- 3.67 The majority of respondents indicated they had no additional issues to raise with regards to the CWRE guidance.
- 3.68 Some respondents used this opportunity to highlight areas where additional detail may be needed including:
- Implementation in primary settings which have less experience of implementing CWRE related support and programmes

- Age-appropriate implementation and monitoring of CWRE progression
 - How CWRE can be tailored to accommodate a diversity of individual learner needs.
- 3.69 One respondent highlighted the need for a greater focus on how schools can provide additional support at key decision milestones including Year 9 and Year 11 to ensure learners are making an informed choice about their progression. The respondent stated the following: “If the focus is too concentrated on what schools should provide to groups or cohorts of learners, the needs of individual learners risk being lost.”
- 3.70 Another respondent stated the need for the guidance to include greater clarity over relationship of CWRE to the non-maintained curriculum.
- 3.71 Respondents also highlighted the need for CWRE to explicitly address how it fits in with the following Welsh Government priority areas:
- Well-being and Future Generations Act (2015)
 - Environmental challenges
 - Entrepreneurship
 - Social Mobility
 - Deprivation.
- 3.72 Some respondents raised concerns that the guidance lacked some of the key detail included in the new curriculum and as a result respondents felt the guidance was a ‘bolt on’. One such area highlighted by respondents included explicit reference to the non-maintained curriculum in Wales, which it was felt was needed to ensure equality of status between both curricula and clarify the relationship between CWRE and the non-maintained curriculum.
- 3.73 It was also felt by respondents that the guidance was too focussed on the needs of older children and as a result lacked specific guidance to

support addressing CWRE needs in younger children in a way which is age appropriate.

- 3.74 One respondent highlighted the need for CWRE guidance to explicitly address challenging stereotypes in early years settings to add further benefit to introducing CWRE at a young age and linking with other key concepts in the curriculum such as equality, rights, and ethics.
- 3.75 Respondents also highlighted the need for greater practicality of CWRE guidance in order for the guidance to be 'internalised' in the classroom. Opportunities for improving the practicality of the guidance included use of exemplars and case studies of CWRE implementation in a variety of school settings so that schools can learn from best practice in this area. One respondent also highlighted that the inclusion of infographics and pictures in the document may support and encourage practitioners to design the curriculum.
- 3.76 Respondents also acknowledged that as the employment landscape is continually changing, so the CWRE guidance should be regularly reviewed in order to remain relevant to the needs of the labour market. In addition, it was felt that this regular review would need to include continual consultation with schools as key stakeholders in the delivery of CWRE guidance.
- 3.77 One respondent highlighted the potential to establish a nation-wide network which would engage schools throughout the year and support them with the delivery of CWRE in the new curriculum. It is noted that this would be particularly useful for primary schools who have less experience of implementing CWRE than secondary schools.
- 3.78 Multiple respondents highlighted the need for benchmarking amongst schools to ensure that CWRE was having an impact in schools. It was suggested that one model which could be used in the benchmarking of schools was the Gatsby benchmark. In addition, respondents recognised the importance of progress being monitored in CWRE implementation across schools in Wales. One respondent suggested that CWRE could be added to the list of areas Estyn inspects in order

to measure progress, facilitate learning from best practise and identifying underperforming areas which could be improved through the provision of additional advice and support.

- 3.79 Respondents acknowledged that whilst employers are eager to deliver CWRE sessions at schools, there is the need for a third party to broker the relationship between employers and schools as schools often lack the time, resources, and awareness of local employers to approach them. The role that Careers Wales has historically played in this space was acknowledged, however concerns were raised by one respondent about the level of resourcing provided to Careers Wales in order to deliver support.
- 3.80 One respondent suggested that one way to partially address this issue would be to have a comprehensive “list of approved suppliers” to include a wider range of organisations which can provide support so that practitioners can have a greater awareness of the support that is available and ensure that the support sourced by schools is of good quality.
- 3.81 Another respondent highlighted the importance of engagement between schools and employers through “building long-term, sustainable, mutually beneficial relationships” where employers are able to recognise the importance of CWRE to their work and schools have a clear idea of what they want to get out of the relationship with the employer. The respondent highlighted the Welsh Valleys Engineering Project Employer Engagement strand as an example of good practise in facilitating relationships in this area.
- 3.82 The need for schools to establish greater linkages with local further education and training providers in their area was raised, with this being highlighted as fundamental to the promotion of careers pathways, particularly at an earlier stage of schooling where currently these linkages are less common.
- 3.83 One respondent also raised some specific comments regarding the wording of the guidance, raising concerns with the use of the terms

‘risk’, ‘risk take’ and risk taking’, suggesting instead that these terms be replaced with more clearly positive terms such as ‘bold’ or ‘innovative.’

- 3.84 Finally, one respondent raised a concern that a number of consultations on curriculum reforms in Wales were issued simultaneously and some organisations felt that they did not have enough time to respond sufficiently stating that “The sheer volume of consultations on the curriculum reforms and the deadline of July 16, has meant that there has been insufficient time and scope to fully consult on these important documents.”

4. Additional Responses

- 4.1 In addition to the completed, individual survey responses, the consultation also received six responses on behalf of integral organisations with significant relevance to the delivery of CWRE. Responses were submitted by the following groups: Careers Wales, UNISON, Learning Disability Wales, NASUWT (The Teacher’s Union), the TUC, and the National Deaf Children’s Society Cymru.

4.2 These responses are covered in further detail below. Given the range of organisations involved, and the changes taking place in education – constructive criticism was to be expected. It should be noted however, that some of the issues raised through the additional responses fall outside of the remit of the CWRE consultation process. Though the sentiment of their concerns are acknowledged it is important to recognise that comments in this context, can only be addressed in relation to the additional guidance document and what this hopes to achieve.

Careers Wales

4.3 Careers Wales reflected largely positively on the CWRE guidance, stating that it aligns with the wider Curriculum for Wales guidance, highlighting the responsibility of schools and settings to design their curriculum with CWRE as a cross cutting theme. Some of the issues raised by Careers Wales fell outside of the remit of the CWRE consultation process and have been omitted here.

4.4 Careers Wales recognises that the guidance is high level and not explicit in “how to” plan, design, and deliver CWRE. The response described the guidance as weaker with regards to providing information around how practitioners could implement CWRE within the curriculum. It notes the need for additional content to be provided to practitioners.

4.5 Careers Wales therefore state that the guidance will need to be enhanced by good practice examples from schools and settings, and additional Professional Learning resources for practitioners. The former would ideally take the form of video-based good practice examples in order to highlight good work being undertaken in a variety of schools and settings and with a wide range of learners.

4.6 Careers Wales state their desire to continue working closely with Welsh Government in order to provide this additional support through, for example, a suite of digital Professional Learning resources aimed

at practitioners, which Careers Wales will take forward and placed on the Welsh Government's digital platform 'Hwb'. Careers Wales is keen to continue working with the Welsh Government in order to provide support to schools and their practitioners in implementing the Curriculum for Wales.

UNISON Cymru

- 4.7 As a trade union representing careers advisors, UNISON Cymru welcomes the recognition of Careers Wales as an expert partner throughout the CWRE guidance. They emphasise the significant role that Careers Wales play in supporting young people to make decisions at key points in their lives. As part of this, UNISON Cymru highlight the important work that Careers Wales staff have done in supporting young people during a particularly challenging time – in providing support and assistance for those who are unemployed, recent school leavers, those furloughed, and those made redundant as a result of Covid-19.
- 4.8 UNISON Cymru raises concerns about the levels of resourcing for Careers Wales in order for it to continue its excellent work.
- 4.9 UNISON Cymru draws attention to the lack of consideration given to the inclusion of the work of unions and employment rights within the CWRE guidance.
- 4.10 Expanding on the lack of information and consideration afforded to employment rights, UNISON Cymru suggest that the following extracts from the consultation guidance have the potential to provide a natural link to educating learners on trade unions and their historic achievements:
- Careers and work-related experience (CWRE), p.7 “CWRE should inspire learners to develop an understanding of the purpose of work in life for themselves and society as a whole.”

- CWRE, fig.1 schools should consider following in designing CWRE in their curriculum – political factors and historical factors.
- CWRE, p.11 Equalities and unions “Through a broad range of authentic experiences, learners develop an understanding of the importance employers place on a diverse and inclusive workforce. Learning about stereotypes and being able to challenge them enhances awareness of the learners’ rights in the world of work.”
- CWRE, p.11 history of the world of work.
- CWRE, p.11 “Develop an understanding of employment rights.”
- CWRE, p.12 “As learners’ communications skills mature, they can become more aware of their rights in the world of work and more confident in challenging negative behaviour.”

4.11 Both of the central concerns raised by UNISON Cymru have echoed issues raised by other respondents to the consultation in the wider pool of responses. The issue of funding and resource provision, as well the issue of providing detailed contextual and historic information on the changing labour market are all common areas that respondents have requested further consideration towards.

Learning Disability Wales

4.12 For Learning Disability Wales, many of the concerns that they raised apply to the CWRE guidance. However, other key points fall outside of the remit of the CWRE consultation process. The key areas of contestation included the capability of the guidance to apply to *all* learners, the lack of further consideration of the barriers facing pupils with additional learning needs (ALN) when facilitating CWRE, and the lack of wider contextualisation of the difficulties that employers create for disabled people in the workplace.

4.13 They conclude that an understanding of disability issues must be integrated into the CWRE teaching in order to overcome the issues of

inequality and feelings of inadequacy that learning disabled pupils often experience. Learning Disability Wales emphasises the right for people with learning disabilities to participate fully in society, which can only be achieved if they are afforded equal access to CWRE. In order to commit to this, it is indicated that additional support may be needed (particularly on an individual level) through the assistance of a trained advisor.

- 4.14 The response from Learning Disability Wales also suggests that a more holistic approach may be necessary in order to overcome these issues and deliver CWRE in a fully inclusive manner. Comments were made more specifically about pupils knowing their employment rights. They emphasise the fact that disabled learners must be informed that they have the right for reasonable adjustments to be made in order ‘to ensure jobs are made to fit them.’ Learning Disability Wales suggests a number of areas for Careers Wales to work with existing stakeholders to engage a wider range of voices, ensuring there is sufficient support for learners with ALN.
- 4.15 In terms of additional practical measures, Learning Disability Wales recommends that more organisations should be obligated to enable students to have work related experiences. These should include Third Sector organisations, particularly those that offer support to disabled people in the workplace. To enable the appropriate level of support, the issue of funding has also been raised. Learning Disability Wales reports that in their expertise, funding is needed for the facilitation of job coaching, as well as to allow for travel. Observably, there are a number of rural areas in Wales which pose geographic barriers to gaining work related experiences.
- 4.16 Learning Disability Wales urges Welsh Government to ‘*look specifically into supported employment and how it can be integrated into the curriculum to make sure that young people with learning disabilities get a fair shot*’. Supported employment agencies can offer the necessary, specialist support, and Learning Disability Wales also

welcomes collaboration with NHS Wales to ensure that meaningful opportunities can be offered for pupils with ALN.

4.17 Finally, Learning Disability Wales also proposes a small number of concrete changes made to the guidance, which will allow for better consideration of pupils with ALN. These are detailed as follows:

- **Page 5** - "Applying these skills to their own career pathway supports learners to better understand the correlation between risk and reward, and how this impacts their experience of the world of work". The use of "risk" is unclear here. Maybe it would be more appropriate to encourage students to grow and move out of their comfort zone.
- The definition of **personal effectiveness** needs to be widened and needs to be more person focused. In the experience of our project delivery partners, people with learning disabilities understanding their own skills and how to improve their personal effectiveness in an appropriate and inclusive way is vital in succeeding in the workplace. The guidance should thus reflect a more person-centred approach.
- **Page 5: Numeracy** - This could be more concrete in what "applying numeracy skills" actually means.
- **Page 9: Vision** - The guidance says that "Schools and settings should establish their vision to support progression in CWRE learning. This should include key priorities for learning, career planning, successful transitions, and engagement beyond the school or setting." The Welsh Government should be more prescriptive in what this vision should be, making it clear that schools are expected to work towards this vision and create opportunities for all learners. Schools should also have to outline their vision on how to support students with additional learning needs specifically. There could be a need for development goals, such as a phased process for introducing CWRE topics across the curriculum and professional learning for practitioners.

- **Page 10: Evaluation** - The section on evaluation is not concrete enough, with too little information on how schools are going to be held to account and by what criteria are they going to be evaluated? Furthermore, it is not clear who is going to perform evaluations and what authority they will have.

NASUWT Cymru – The Teacher’s Union

4.18 The response from NASUWT presents a number of concerns which are applicable to the CWRE guidance in question, and which sought to address further concerns on behalf of the teaching profession. It is acknowledged that many of the concerns are valid, but fall outside of the remit of the CWRE consultation process.

4.19 The full response document spans across a range of issues, for the purpose of summarisation these are grouped in this section where possible. The opening to the statement comprises of a list of general comments on the additional guidance, which are shared below. NASUWT states that in order to secure high outcomes for all children, action is needed to:

- Provide a broad, balanced, and relevant curriculum experience fit for the 21st century
- Ensure parity of esteem between academic and vocational pathways and the cognitive, emotional, cultural, creative, ethical, and social dimensions of learning
- Require all state-funded schools and colleges to work together to secure a comprehensive curriculum entitlement for all 14- to 19-year-olds
- Equip children and young people to be research-driven problem solvers
- Extend entitlements for all children and young people to high quality academic and vocational education, coupled with

equality of access to high-quality, practical, hands-on, work-based learning opportunities

- Refocus the accountability system to reflect and support the expectation that all young people should remain in education and training until the age of 18.

4.20 The purpose for NASUWT in sharing these general comments/criteria is principally to demonstrate the gap between the level of provision that they believe should be delivered, and the curriculum framework as it stands. From the perspective of NASUWT, *'the current curriculum framework does not meet these important tests.'*

4.21 With further regards to the specific context of CWRE guidance, NASUWT recognises a need for the guidance to also become statutory for organisations like Careers Wales. They highlight the need for 'cross-organisational compliance' in order to achieve mutual understanding of responsibilities in the process of curriculum development and implementation.

4.22 NASUWT also calls for an increase and enhancement of example sharing within the guidance – a sentiment echoed by other respondents, particularly from primary setting practitioners. To illustrate this, they refer to the point on 'providing opportunities for learners to be creative through play-based and authentic experiences.' These may feel like abstract references without the companion of understandable suggestions and examples.

The requirement for the inclusion of parents and carers in the process of supporting CWRE learning is also questioned, with a request made for practical examples so that schools have sufficient understanding of expectations.

National Deaf Children's Society Cymru

4.23 The National Deaf Children's Society submitted a short response statement, primarily welcoming the references made within the

guidance to diverse role models and to making work experience more accessible for pupils with ALN.

- 4.24 Given longstanding myths and misunderstandings surrounding the capability of pupils with ALN, the National Deaf Children's Society praises the CWRE guidance for demonstrating some consideration towards this.
- 4.25 To build on the guidance, the Society recommends clear signposting to organisations such as theirs, in order to support and assist with the facilitation of CWRE for pupils with ALN, and to promote the understanding of these issues.
- 4.26 Principally, the Society recommends that the guidance 'goes further' in its coverage of issues such as disability rights in employment, such as the Access to Work scheme and the right to reasonable adjustments. These comments reinforce those made through the other organisation statements – emphasising the importance of communicating employment rights to ensure equal opportunities for young people.

Wales TUC

- 4.27 The Wales TUC expressed an explicit concern regarding the lack of information in the guidance on working rights and the role of trade unions in a guidance document covering careers and work-related experiences.
- 4.28 The TUC response highlights the fact that around 400,000 people are trade union members in Wales, meaning that an understanding of trade unions has direct relevance to a significant portion of the adult population.
- 4.29 Crucially, the TUC states that failing to inform young people about their working rights, and indeed their legal rights, makes them vulnerable to exploitation by employers.

- 4.30 The response also identifies the inconsistency between the messaging in this national curriculum document, and other Government priorities. They noted: *‘it is also incongruous for a government that is committed to social partnership (and recognises that joining a trade union is the best way to protect your rights at work) to draft such a critical document in this way.’*
- 4.31 The TUC stresses the prevalence of exploitation in Wales’s labour market as a central reason for the need to develop informed citizens who are equipped to address rights violations. To add context to this, the response details a number of common forms of labour abuse which are most likely to occur in low-waged jobs. These include:
- False self-employment (offloading risks & employment responsibilities such as sick pay through false self-employment status)
 - Earnings (withholding earnings including holiday pay & overtime pay)
 - Agency labour and umbrella companies (denying workers their holiday entitlements, charging workers for their holiday time).
 - Poor health and safety standards (health risks are high and construction workers are 4x more likely to suffer a fatal accident than workers across all other industries)
- 4.32 To demonstrate the prevalence of these issues, the TUC response cites a figure put forward by the Low Pay Commission, estimating that around 300,000 workers were paid below legal minimum rates last year.
- 4.33 In addition to this, the TUC response suggests that these issues have a particular relevance to young people, given that underpayment is common at entry level – where young people are just starting out in the world of work and trying to gain experience. Clear examples of this include underpaid apprenticeships, unpaid trial shifts (particularly in the hospitality sector), and internships. The TUC highlights that one in three apprentices are estimated to receive illegal pay. If young

citizens are not informed about these issues, it becomes easier for bad practice employers and agency companies to take advantage of their lack of experience.

4.34 The TUC response points to a number of benefits that providing this information can have, including workers securing better pay, terms and conditions, and safer working environments. The TUC cites the following direct quote from Welsh Government's Fair Work Commission recommending that: *'Welsh Government takes all measures possible within its sphere of competence to support and promote trade unions and collective bargaining'*. They conclude that *'omitting trade unions from the entire CWRE curriculum rejects both this recommendation and the role of universal labour rights'*.

4.35 The TUC would like to assist with 'urgently redressing this', and offer their support and resources to ensure that the guidance is developed and taken forward in social partnership to align with the Fair Work agenda.

5. Consultation Workshops

5.1 This chapter sets out the findings of six workshops held between the 16th of June 2021 to the 8th of July 2021 (see Table 1). The workshops were attended by 80 contributors representing all the key target groups.

Table 1 – Dates of workshops and target groups

	Date	Target group	Attendance
1	Wednesday 16 June	Primary school settings	10
2	Thursday 17 June	Employers	12
3	Wednesday 23 June	Stakeholders – Careers Wales, local authorities, Regional Consortia etc.	23
4	Thursday 1 July	Secondary school settings	11
5	Tuesday 6 July	PRUs/EOTAS	7
6	Thursday 8 July	All target groups	16

Many of the responses that were received in the workshops contradicted written responses received formally through the CWRE consultation. These workshops helped to balance these responses and provided more detail as to the areas to focus on for refining the CWRE guidance. The Welsh Government, working closely with the CWRE practitioner group considered both formal responses to the CWRE consultation as well as the outputs of these workshops together to refine the CWRE guidance.

Question 1

Is the published Curriculum for Wales guidance and this draft Curriculum for Wales guidance for Careers and Work-related Experiences (CWRE) clearly aligned?

- 5.2 Contributors **welcomed the specific guidance for CWRE**: ‘the guidance is amazing’, ‘the guidance is really comprehensive’.
- 5.3 Contributors felt that the **draft CWRE guidance aligned with the published Curriculum for Wales guidance** particularly in terms of its vision for a curriculum that is about raising aspirations and broadening horizons.
- 5.4 **Consistent terminology was being used throughout** both the draft CWRE guidance and the Curriculum for Wales guidance although employers and those with less direct knowledge of the new Curriculum for Wales tended to find it slightly ‘terminology heavy’ and thus welcomed the clear glossary.
- 5.5 Contributors acknowledged that there was always tension between what is included in statutory guidance whilst still allowing freedom for different settings to adapt and interpret the guidance in a way that was fit for purpose. Contributors felt that the **draft CWRE guidance had the balance broadly right**.
- 5.6 Contributors noted that the draft CWRE guidance **links well with the aims of the Wellbeing of Future Generations Act**.

Question 2

Does this draft guidance for CWRE sufficiently cater for the needs of all learners from the age of 3 to 16 including those who have additional learning needs when planning, designing, and delivering the curriculum and assessment in schools and other settings?

- 5.7 The fact that the draft guidance covers learners from the age of 3 to 16 was well-received across all workshop contributors. The **introduction of CWRE from early-years settings was welcomed** and the content deemed ‘exciting for primary’.
- 5.8 Similarly, within secondary school settings, contributors welcomed the references to CWRE in Year 7-9.

- 5.9 In general, contributors praised how the **draft guidance document provided flexibility** particularly for PRUs and special schools and ALN pupils but there were suggestions that as such settings tend to follow a more skills-based curriculum, this could be better reflected in the draft guidance and that differentiation made clearer.
- 5.10 Some contributors from primary and secondary schools would welcome **more content and clarity around progression steps** with expectations for the continuum of learning expressed in the guidance although others felt that the guidance went as far as it could on this matter: 'as a 3-16 school I can see the whole progression'.
- 5.11 Due to CWRE being something new to most primary school settings, practitioners and employers alike were keen for more clarity: 'what is the expectation for primary compared to secondary?', particular in relation to the career planning and management aspects of CWRE.

Question 3

Does this draft guidance contextualise the CWRE learning to help schools and other settings when planning, designing, and implementing curriculum and assessment for learners?

- 5.12 Contributors discussed in detail how the draft guidance contextualised the CWRE learning to skills and to areas of learning.
- 5.13 In terms of **contextualising skills through CWRE**, comments from contributors included:
- the **skills integral to the four purposes can easily be integrated into wider learning** e.g., teamwork skills, thinking creatively, demonstrating leadership
 - the key messages in the draft guidance about developing **career-ready attitudes and behaviours** was particularly well-regarded.

- the skills integral to the four purposes were all key **employability skills** welcomed by employers as having a more central role in the curriculum for CWRE.
- employers in particular liked the **focus on ‘entrepreneurship’** in its widest sense – i.e., including ‘thinking entrepreneurially.
- the **cross-cutting skills of numeracy and literacy were outlined clearly** and covered well.
- the **focus on digital literacy was particularly welcomed** by employers.
- CWRE in the context of skills was particularly important for some settings (PRU and EOTAS providers particularly) in getting learners ready for the world of work).

5.14 In terms of **contextualising Areas of Learning and Experience** and CWRE, contributors commented that:

- CWRE fits very nicely with AoLEs throughout this section of the draft guidance with the **AoLE descriptors providing sufficient detail.**
- the draft guidance clearly sets out how CWRE should be contextualised across all the AoLEs – ‘previous careers education has always been an add-on but in this guidance it is totally embedded in AoLE – it can apply within every classroom quite freely’.
- some contributors felt that this aspect of the guidance felt a little formulaic and repeated key themes already in the Curriculum for Wales guidance.

Question 4

Does this draft guidance provide clear information outlining who should be responsible for different aspects of the design and implementation of CWRE learning in the curriculum in schools and other settings?

- 5.15 Overall, this section of the draft CWRE guidance was praised, particularly for its **'whole school' approach** and focus on involving parents, carers, charities, and communities in CWRE learning.
- 5.16 Contributors stressed the importance of ensuring that CWRE learning was **embedded in School Improvement Plans** so that the approach was reviewed and evaluated fully.
- 5.17 There was much debate in all workshops about **accountability for CWRE learning** in various settings and the pros and cons of identifying an individual to lead or champion CWRE. Views were mixed, particularly from primary settings, with many feeling that the guidance should explicitly allocate the role to a member of SMT. In secondary school settings it was felt that curriculum leaders were already well-placed to take ownership of CWRE learning. In the main, it was agreed that accountability for CWRE learning should not be prescribed to one individual as it would differ according to setting.
- 5.18 In terms of steps for designing CWRE in the curriculum, several specific comments were made about the steps outlined in the guidance:
- **Step 1: Review CWRE in the curriculum** - several contributors felt that this section would benefit from more clarity in terms of 'who' should be part of this review process, with a suggestion that a process to map or track CWRE in the curriculum could be introduced in this section of the guidance.
 - **Step 2: Establishing a vision for CWRE** – this step was broadly welcomed but contributors questioned whether some the key priorities that 'should' be included here such as 'career planning' was appropriate across all settings (for example it might not be appropriate for early years primary school settings) and therefore more flexible language could be used.
 - **Step 3: Resources and support for CWRE provision** - whilst this step referred generally to the resources and support available for CWRE provision, contributors called for Careers

Wales' role to be made more explicit and for increased signposting to the support available to be included here. In this respect, it was suggested that the guidance should be a 'live' document that could be adapted regularly. Employers were keen to engage with schools and other settings but were not clear about how this could be achieved. Similarly, several settings (particularly primary schools) were unsure about how they should go about the resources available and how they could access them and would welcome clarity on this. Other contributors commented that more clarity in terms of how parents and carers could support CWRE would be welcomed in the guidance here.

- **Step 4: Outlining CWRE provision** - this step did not receive many comments and was broadly agreeable.
- **Step 5: Evaluating CWRE provision** – contributors identified this step as one of crucial importance which could be strengthened to ensure that it was clear from the guidance that there was an expectation on settings to evaluate their approach to CWRE learning regularly. In particular, contributors called for a simple evaluation framework which they could evaluate against that would allow for the demonstration of progress in terms of learners' skills and knowledge. In addition, the role of pupil voice was deemed to be crucial as the best way of evaluating whether the CWRE provision being provided responded to the needs of the individual learner.

5.19 Contributors welcomed the section of the draft guidance on **labour market information (LMI)** and felt that it was important for CWRE learning to take this into account so that the curriculum **reflected the local economy and the opportunities available locally**. However, alongside this, it was felt that practitioners would need to be informed and provided with this LMI knowledge regularly, via Professional Learning opportunities.

Question 5

Does this draft guidance support and help schools and other settings to integrate CWRE learning when planning, designing, and implementing curriculum and assessment for learners?

- 5.20 Contributors felt that the draft CWRE guidance was helpful in providing the necessary support and help to enable schools and other settings approach their planning and designing of CWRE learning in the curriculum.
- 5.21 Contributors liked the section in the guidance that referred to the wide range of contributors to effective CWRE and welcomed the fact that **governors and senior leadership were seen as playing a key role**. Some contributors felt that the role of CWRE leaders in settings other than secondary schools needed to be more clearly defined and some questioned whether this should be a defined role in all settings or not.
- 5.22 Contributors were **pleased to see Careers Wales mentioned explicitly** in the guidance, but several contributors requested further clarity on their exact role and capacity to support settings other than secondary schools.
- 5.23 The section on parents and carers was also welcomed, but some felt that parental capability (in terms of knowledge of opportunities) should be supported by resources and online materials.
- 5.24 It was **widely praised that FEIs and HEIs were mentioned** in this section, but it was felt that the current wording was slightly narrow. Whilst references to apprenticeships and traineeships was welcomed and deemed an important inclusion to the guidance, several contributors felt that there needed to be **more references to general vocational education** too. Some contributors felt that HEIs were often given too much focus by schools and that the opportunities available via FEIs needed to be focussed upon more specifically and in more detail.

- 5.25 All contributor groups, but employers particularly, **welcomed the section on employer engagement**. Collaboration with employers was seen as a key element of CWRE learning and there was a call for the draft guidance to balance between the need for schools and settings to present local opportunities available whilst also broadening the horizons of learners to opportunities available further afield.
- 5.26 Furthermore, contributors felt that the guidance could be more explicit in terms of how schools and settings could **access employers and who was responsible for brokering these partnerships** (i.e., was this a role for individual schools, LAs, Careers Wales or whether a portal needed to be developed).
- 5.27 Contributors felt that the roles of local authorities and regional consortia in supporting CWRE learning could be more detailed in the draft guidance and their important role could be strengthened.

Question 6

Which aspects of this guidance do you feel are particularly helpful?

- 5.28 Several contributors liked the introductory section of the guidance and felt that it provided a **strong and succinct explanation** as to the purpose and importance of CWRE learning within the Curriculum for Wales.
- 5.29 Contributors commented that the **visual representation** used in the draft guidance was particularly useful in understanding how the draft CWRE guidance fit with the Curriculum for Wales and called for more visual charts throughout the report. It was noted that a chart to demonstrate how CWRE could be contextualised within AoLEs and skills would help improve understanding.
- 5.30 The sections providing **descriptors of CWRE learning in relation to skills and AoLEs** were set out in a way that was clear and pitched in a way that could be relevant to most settings.

- 5.31 Contributors felt that the **glossary section of the draft guidance was helpful** and of particular use to those less familiar with the Curriculum for Wales and CWRE learning.

Question 7

Are there aspects of this guidance which you feel could be improved?

- 5.32 Contributors felt that care should be taken over the use of 'should' and 'could' throughout the document. There was recognition of the legal meaning of the various terms but some contributors from primary, PRUs and special school settings were keen to ensure that the draft guidance was written in a way that ensure that every 'should' was relevant and possible to achieve in all settings.
- 5.33 Contributors would also like to see the **pupil voice more prominent** across the draft guidance as CWRE is a very individualised matter that needs to reflect the needs and interests of the individual child.
- 5.34 Contributors also suggested that the guidance could refer to **opportunities for schools to work in clusters in their implementation of CWRE**, and that this sharing of approaches was particularly important in terms of progression from Year 6 to Year 7 and offered secondary schools opportunities to work with primary schools within their clusters in the delivery of CWRE learning.
- 5.35 The guidance was felt by some to be overly focused on secondary school settings and what could be delivered there. Contributors would welcome more information on how CWRE could be delivered in other settings, particularly primary. However, there was recognition that this was not necessarily something that could be included in a statutory guidance document and might need to be realised in associated resources.
- 5.36 Contributors called for a quality assurance list of organisations that could work with schools and a menu of the services from which they could choose.

- 5.37 The **importance of Professional Learning in relation to CWRE learning** was raised often during the workshops and contributors called for the guidance to provide more information on this element and what it should look like in order to educate practitioners about various sectors, career opportunities and career routes. Support and training for practitioners and governors was deemed important, particularly as the CWRE guidance was statutory and thus would be monitored and evaluated by Estyn in due course as a result.

Question 8

What additional information should be included in the guidance for CWRE?

- 5.38 Workshop contributors did not suggest much in addition to the existing content of the draft guidance for CWRE that has not already been mentioned in previous questions.
- 5.39 Some contributors pointed to the need for **parity of opportunity** and that different regions of Wales would inevitably have access to employers in some key sectors over others. As a result, it was felt that the guidance needed to reflect the importance of **interactive provision** so that digital resources and solutions could be provided to those who could not access certain employers or sectors locally.
- 5.40 Contributors also regularly requested that **more resources, signposting, and guidance on 'how' to implement CWRE learning** was needed alongside the CWRE guidance. This is covered in more detail under Question 10.

Question 9

What impacts will this guidance have on the Welsh language?

- 5.41 Very few comments were raised at the workshops in relation to the Welsh language. Contributors generally felt that there were no

specific issues or impacts (positive or negative) on the Welsh language.

- 5.42 Contributors were pleased to see that the guidance referred to the **importance of Welsh language in careers** and welcomed the fact that the draft guidance **encouraged the promotion of Welsh language skills**.

Question 10

Other comments

- 5.43 In addition to comments in relation to the draft guidance itself, other key issues in relation to CWRE were raised by workshop contributors in relation to professional learning in particular, including:
- whilst the draft guidance clearly sets out the ‘what’, all settings (but primary in particular) would welcome supporting resources to support with the ‘how’.
 - best practice examples of ‘what good looks’ like, shared on HWB would be useful.
 - case studies that included examples of where CWRE is already successfully embedded in the curriculum and case studies from a range of different settings would be well-received.
 - Professional Learning resources – particularly digital ones, available on the HWB were also called for.
- 5.44 Careers Wales is developing a range of resources that will support schools and settings in their delivery of CWRE in the Curriculum for Wales including the new CWRE toolkit.
- 5.45 During the workshops, references were made to several CWRE related programmes or resources already available that could help schools and settings in their delivery of the draft CWRE guidance requirements. These included:

- The Skills Builder Partnership¹ Programme.
- Open your Eyes Week² (Cardiff Commitment).
- NatWest ‘Career Sense’³ (and other entrepreneurship and financial literacy programmes).
- Into Film Cymru⁴ resources.

5.46 The **Big Ideas Wales** model for delivery of entrepreneurship education was highlighted as a model that should be replicated for CWRE, particularly as a way of enabling schools and settings to access employers.

5.47 Other comments were made during the workshops of relevance to CWRE learning (if not the draft guidance itself) including that recognition was needed that employers and sectors can often provide a wide-range of opportunities and that practitioners needed to be educated and made aware of this. For example, whilst the media sector provides obvious opportunities for drama and media students (e.g., actors) it also employs technicians, electricians, researchers, art directors etc.

5.48 Similarly, employers were keen to convey that key employment sectors are often overlooked or seen as more suitable for less academically able learners, yet could provide very well-paid opportunities and strong career progression and opportunities (e.g. construction, mechanical engineering).

¹ www.skillsbuilder.org

² <https://cardiffcommitment.co.uk/open-your-eyes-week/>

³ <https://www.mycareersense.com/>

⁴ <https://www.intofilm.org/cymru>