The future of Welsh-speaking communities: a summary of responses to the call for evidence

May 2023

Arad Research 8 Columbus Walk Brigantine Place Cardiff / Caerdydd CF10 4SD 029 2044 0552 www.aradresearch.com



Content

1.	Intr	oduction	. 3
1	.1	The Responses	3
1	.2	Fundamental principles	4
2.	Puk	olic policy and Areas of Special Linguistic Significance	. 8
2	2.1	The principle of varying public policy in different communities	8
	2.2	Areas of Special Linguistic Significance	9
2	2.3	Language planning body	
2	2.4	Strengthening Welsh Language Standards as a tool to support language planning	
3.	Edu	ucation policy1	
3	3.1	Welsh language transmission within the family	17
3	3.2	Early years	
3	3.3	Welsh in Education Strategic Plans (WESPs)	
3	3.4	Extending opportunities for latecomers to acquire the language	
3	3.5	Categorisation of schools	20
3	3.6	Further and vocational education	22
3	3.7	Higher education	23
4.	Agı	ricultural and land use policy2	24
4	l.1	Supporting smaller farms and family farms	24
4	1.2	Forestry Policy	
4	1.3	Conservation and biodiversity	25
5.	Reg	generation and economic development policy areas	26
5	5.1	Expansion and funding of the ARFOR Scheme	26
	5.2	Welsh as an essential skill in public institutions	
5	5.3	Labour market strategy	
5	5.4	Reforming procurement arrangements	29
5	5.5	Targeting support towards Welsh-medium organisations and businesses	30
5	5.6	Tourism	
	5.7	Infrastructure in Welsh-speaking communities	
	5.8	The foundational economy	
6.	Coi	mmunity development policy	38
6	6.1	Services and support for community groups and initiatives	38
6	5.2	Providing opportunities for socialising	
6	6.3	Community Assets	43
7.	Tov	wn and country planning4	45
7	'.1	Town and country planning background and context	45
	7.2	A call for clearer guidance and better data and evidence	
8.	Ηοι	using policyusing policy	
	3.1	Ensuring a strong voice for the housing sector when planning strategic interventions	
	3.2	Ensuring more affordable housing for local people	
	3.3	Second homes	
		uality and Diversity	



1. Introduction

This report presents the findings of a call for evidence aimed at gathering information, ideas and views on ways to strengthen Welsh-speaking communities. The Commission for Welsh-speaking Communities (the Commission) launched the call for evidence to support its work in developing recommendations to submit to the Welsh Government.

The focus of this call for evidence was to gather responses and comments in relation to strengthening Welsh-speaking communities in Wales. Respondents were given the opportunity to comment online, by post and by email.

1.1 The Responses

Number of responses

The call was launched on 8November 2022, with a closing date for receipt of responses and evidence of 13 January 2023. In total, **179 responses were submitted**, with the majority of these respondents using the online form (124). Others provided responses in other formats (55 responses). Some followed the eighteen-question structure (set out below), but most used an open-ended approach, typically providing longer answers. Of these 55 responses, 42 were submissions by organisations, with 13 responses from individuals.

The form of the responses

Respondents were free to present evidence or views about any issue they considered relevant to Welsh-speaking communities. However, as there are certain matters of particular interest to the Commission, a series of questions was prepared to assist respondents, as can be seen in the box below. Although the guide for respondents specified 18 questions, not all respondents adhered to that template and there were many that overlapped and covered several themes or policy areas. Responses from organisations tended to be broader than the set of 18 questions.

Questions to support responses to the call for evidence.

Responding to recent changes

Question 1: What steps should be taken in order to strengthen Welsh-speaking communities (or the
Welsh language in Welsh-speaking communities) as a consequence of any of these developments?
[i.e. leaving the European Union, the effects of COVID-19, new social practices (such as working from
home), the energy and cost of living crises.]

Targeting support

- Question 2: How can we provide support effectively for Welsh-speaking communities?
- Question 3: How can we use regional or local policies in order to strengthen Welsh-speaking communities?
- Question 4: What role should local government have in strengthening Welsh-speaking communities?

Policy areas

In the following areas, what policies should be introduced in order to strengthen Welsh-speaking communities?

- Question 5: Regeneration
- Question 6: Education



- Question 7: Agriculture / Land Use
- Question 8: Town and Country Planning
- Question 9: Community Development
- Question 10: Economic Development
- Question 11: Housing
- Question 12: Any other field

Direct language policy

- Question 13: How effective is direct language policy in Welsh-speaking communities?
- Question 14: How can we strengthen direct language policy in Welsh-speaking communities?

Strengthening Welsh-speaking communities in harmony with other Welsh Government policies

- Question 15: How can we strengthen Welsh-speaking communities in a way that intersects with some of the Welsh Government's other objectives?
- Question 16: How can we strengthen Welsh-speaking communities in accordance with the Well-being of Future Generations Act?

Young people and young families in Welsh-speaking communities

• Question 17: How can we ensure a better age balance in Welsh-speaking communities, creating a situation in which more young people and young families live there?

Equality and diversity

 Question 18: How can we strengthen Welsh-speaking communities in a way that promotes equality and diversity?

This report does not follow the precise structure of the questions above, principally due to overlap and repetition in responses received. Chapters covering policy areas are structured as follows:

- Public policy and Areas of Special Linguistic Significance
- Education
- Agriculture
- Regeneration and economic development
- Community development
- Planning and housing policy
- Equality and diversity

Some of the proposals and quotations from organisations are attributed to specific organisations where permission has been requested, while proposals and quotations from individuals are anonymised in this report.

1.2 Fundamental principles

A focus on specific and actionable ideas and proposals

In preparing this report, guidance was given to record 'actual' and 'actionable' ideas in responses to the call for evidence. In selecting which ideas and proposals to include in this report, consideration was given to a range of criteria, including relevance, clarity, and the extent to which the proposals recommended specific courses of action. A number of responses



outlined the changes respondents wished to see and descriptions of the desired results but without including specific measures or proposals to support those goals.

We have tended to omit contributions or points that only describe desired aspirations or impacts, prioritising proposals that describe specific actions to support and strengthen Welsh-speaking communities. It should be noted, however, that all responses have been read and considered.

The purpose of this report is to present the ideas and evidence gathered, without rigorously checking for accuracy. Any explanatory notes are brief and are set out where considered necessary.

The report does not aim to record every idea and comment presented through the call for evidence. However, we are confident that we have recorded the most prominent ideas and proposals that merit the Commission's attention.

Support for the principle of strengthening communities

Responses recognised the importance of building strong, resilient and sustainable communities, and the need to tackle the challenges that prevent Welsh-speaking communities from thriving. The evidence presented offers ideas on how to improve the social, economic, and environmental well-being of communities, with a focus on long-term sustainability. The responses also highlight interest among organisations and individuals throughout Wales to contribute to policy making in this area – with many indicating their willingness to support and contribute to the Commission's continued work.

Social justice

The responses drew attention to the challenges that communities face, including poverty, inequality, social exclusion, and environmental degradation, and the need to tackle these challenges through policy interventions. Indeed, many responses framed their ideas and comments in the context of social justice, equity and equality. Responses indicated significant concern about inequity in Welsh-speaking communities and the need to tackle this through public policy. Respondents noted that strengthening Welsh-speaking communities should be about improving the well-being of the whole community but also about promoting equity and social justice within and between communities.

The importance of social class

A number noted that there is a link between social class and the use of the Welsh language in some parts of Wales, and that there are 'signs that the language group is dividing along class lines' with the language shift occurring more rapidly in the working class than in the middle class. It was suggested that activity needs to be rooted in the community, ensuring that actions in favour of the Welsh language reflect the needs and ideals of everyone, from all social backgrounds.

¹ 'arwyddion bod y grŵp iaith yn ymrannu ar hyd llinellau dosbarth'



-

Well-being of Future Generations Act

A number of respondents referred to the Well-being of Future Generations Act, noting the need for policy decisions and the implementation of public policy to emulate the principles of the Act. The need to ensure the well-being of the Welsh language was identified as a core consideration 'when making cultural, social, environmental and economic decisions' (Ceredigion County Council).² This was echoed by several individuals and bodies. While there are duties on public bodies under the provisions of the Act to assess the effects of policy decisions on the Welsh language, it was suggested that 'bodies need more guidance on how to do this effectively and practically' (Cyngor Gwynedd).³

Holistic action

A number of respondents highlighted the need for holistic action across the various public policy areas. Referring to the fact that the Welsh language is a community language that is part of all aspects of life within communities, it was emphasised that any interventions needed to cover various areas of public policy in a comprehensive and overarching way.

Calls for more funding to support schemes within Welsh-speaking communities

Several respondents expressed concern about the lack of core funding that local authorities, other public bodies and community organisations have to spend on schemes to support the Welsh language. Although grant funding is available for local projects and interventions, it was emphasised that this method of funding does not allow organisations to invest in long-term plans to strengthen the language. The availability of financial support is a crucial context for all of the proposals presented in this report and is clearly an issue that respondents from a wide range of organisations are concerned about.

'The [Welsh Language] Standards Framework has provided a clear path in terms of how the Council and other public organisations should plan their services in Welsh, and make it easier for people to use the Welsh language in their daily lives. However, any policy is dependent on the action plan; and investment is needed in order to implement that plan, that is to say that people and resources are needed in order to operate. The Welsh Government has not provided any supplementary funding to ensure that Local Authorities are able to realise the policies above [to support the Welsh language]' (Ceredigion County Council).⁴

⁴ 'Mae'r Fframwaith Safonau, wedi darparu llwybr clir o ran sut dylai'r Cyngor a sefydliadau cyhoeddus eraill fynd ati i gynllunio'u gwasanaethau yn Gymraeg, a'i gwneud yn haws i bobl ddefnyddio'r Gymraeg yn eu bywydau bod dydd. Fodd bynnag, mae unrhyw bolisi yn ddibynnol ar y cynllun gweithredu; ac er mwyn gweithredu'r cynllun hwnnw mae'n rhaid cael buddsoddiad, hynny yw bod yn rhaid cael pobl ac adnoddau er mwyn gweithredu. Nid yw Llywodraeth Cymru wedi darparu unrhyw gyllid atodol ar gyfer sicrhau bod Awdurdodau Lleol yn medru gwireddu'r polisïau uchod [i gefnogi'r Gymraeg]'



6

² 'wrth wneud penderfyniadau diwylliannol, cymdeithasol, amgylcheddol ac economaidd.'

³ 'angen mwy o arweiniad ar gyrff ar sut i wneud hyn yn effeithiol ac ymarferol'

The need for further research in the field moving forward

Another common theme among respondents is the need for further research. Some respondents expressed their desire for further and ongoing research and analysis into the current situation of the language, including research into its social use within communities.



2. Public policy and Areas of Special Linguistic Significance

There was no specific question in relation to varying public policy in different geographical areas, nor on the concept of establishing Areas of Special Linguistic Significance. However, these issues were regularly highlighted across the responses, from both individuals and organisations.

2.1 The principle of varying public policy in different communities

The principle of designating a special status for specific linguistic areas was presented as a basis for varying public policy. The rationale for this, as stated by several respondents, is that Welsh-speaking communities have special linguistic and cultural significance and value, and that this value should be protected and reinforced when formulating and implementing public policy across a range of areas. There was support, therefore, for the concept of varying public policy in Wales to reflect local needs while supporting the Welsh language.

Proposal 1: Varying public policy to reflect the needs of Welsh-speaking communities

'By treating Wales as one linguistic unit, official policies over the years have failed to recognise the diversity between different parts of Wales. The inevitable result of this was that the specific needs of communities whose main language was Welsh were not given due attention.'

'Trwy drin Cymru fel un uned ieithyddol, mae polisïau swyddogol ar hyd y blynyddoedd wedi methu â chydnabod yr amrywiaethau rhwng gwahanol rannau o Gymru. Canlyniad anochel hyn oedd nad oedd anghenion penodol cymunedau a oedd â'r Gymraeg yn brif iaith iddynt yn cael y sylw dyladwy.'

Source: Mentrau laith Cymru

'[There is] a need to consider certain areas as linguistically sensitive and linguistically important, varying policy, planning and action based on that.'

'[Mae] angen ystyried rhai ardaloedd yn sensitif yn ieithyddol a phwysig yn ieithyddol gan amrywio polisi, cynllunio a gweithredu ar sail hynny.'

Source: laith Cyf

'Give a special designation of "linguistic sensitivity" to Welsh-speaking communities and create specific policies for those areas, the national/Wales-wide systems that have been in place have not worked - see the 2021 census results - so we must differentiate.'

'Rhoi dynodiad arbennig "sensitifrwydd ieithyddol" i gymunedau Cymraeg a chreu polisïau penodol i'r ardaloedd hynny, nid yw'r systemau cenedlaethol/ Cymru gyfan sydd wedi bodoli wedi gweithio - gweler canlyniadau cyfrifiad 2021- felly rhaid gwahaniaethu.'

Source: Hunaniaith

'Whilst recognising the key role of a robust policy framework, resilient national, regional and county-wide strategies and significant public resources in language policy and planning, we take this opportunity to highlight one specific point – namely that there is a need to empower and facilitate Welsh-speaking communities to act in favour of the Welsh language in their own right and ability.'



'Tra'n cydnabod rhan allweddol fframwaith polisi cadarn, strategaethau cenedlaethol, rhanbarthol a sirol cydnerth ac adnoddau cyhoeddus sylweddol mewn polisi a chynllunio iaith, cymerwn y cyfle hwn i danlinellu un pwynt penodol – sef bod angen grymuso a hwyluso cymunedau Cymraeg i weithredu o blaid y Gymraeg yn eu rhinwedd a'u gallu eu hunain.' Source: laith Cyf

Respondents underlined the need for clarity and care when interpreting/defining Welsh-speaking communities. Contributors emphasised the need to consider the 'networked' nature of communities and the danger of looking at communities through too narrow a geographical lens. It was proposed that the Commission needs to:

'recognise and draw up policy recommendations that respond to the fact that people do not live, work and socialise in one place or community, and the way individuals' work and social practices on a day-to-day basis affect a range of activity and where people use language. It would be beneficial to try and pay more attention to the networks and activities in which individuals within the areas in question participate on a day-to-day basis. This could ultimately affect the Commission's recommendations, in terms of the extent of where stronger public policies should be implemented to support linguistic sustainability.' (Aberystwyth University)⁵

2.2 Areas of Special Linguistic Significance

Reflecting views similar to those presented above, some argued that special areas should be established where variations to public policy could come into effect.

Several organisations suggested that the lack of agreed recognition or understanding of which areas of Wales are considered Welsh-speaking communities is an 'obvious policy gap.' Several respondents highlighted the fact that there are arrangements in other policy areas that designate areas of significance (e.g. environment, heritage). It was noted that the model could lead to securing funding, setting guidance/requirements in relation to planning issues, and targeting interventions.

Proposal 2: Establishing Areas of Special Linguistic Significance

'We would suggest that the Welsh language constitutes an ecosystem that needs to be protected and developed. One can compare this with the existing legislative system to protect the environment and areas of ecological significance. The benefits of operating in this manner might include:

- better consideration of the impact of decisions made by public bodies on the use of and approach to the Welsh language in communities, and
- strengthening duties around gathering evidence as a robust basis for decision making.'

'Byddem yn awgrymu bod y Gymraeg gyfystyr ag ecosystem sydd angen ei hamddiffyn a'i datblygu. Cymharer â'r gyfundrefn ddeddfwriaethol sy'n bodoli eisoes i warchod yr

⁵ '[Angen i'r Comisiwn] gydnabod a llunio argymhellion polisi sy'n ymateb i'r modd nad yw pobl yn byw, yn gweithio ac yn cymdeithasu mewn un man neu gymuned, a'r modd mae arferion gwaith a chymdeithasol unigolion o ddydd i ddydd ar draws ardaloedd ehangach gan effeithio ar ystod o weithgaredd a ble mae pobl yn defnyddio iaith. Byddai'n fuddiol ceisio rhoi mwy o sylw i'r rhwydweithiau a'r gweithgareddau mae unigolion o fewn yr ardaloedd dan sylw yn cymryd rhan ynddynt o ddydd i ddydd. Gallai hyn effeithio yn y pendraw ar argymhellion y Comisiwn, o ran hyd a lled ble y dylid gweithredu polisïau cyhoeddus cryfach i gefnogi cynaladwyedd ieithyddol.'



9

amgylchedd ac ardaloedd o arwyddocâd ecolegol. Gall fanteision gweithredu yn y modd hwn gynnwys:

- gwell ystyriaeth o effaith penderfyniadau cyrff cyhoeddus ar ddefnydd ac ymdriniaeth o'r Gymraeg mewn cymunedau, a
- cryfhau dyletswyddau o gylch casglu tystiolaeth fel sylfaen gadarn i wneud penderfyniadau.'

Source: Anglesey County Council

'If areas of linguistic sensitivity cannot be identified and policies strengthened within them, there will be no hope of keeping Welsh as a living language.'

'Os na ellir dynodi ardaloedd o sensitifrwydd ieithyddol a chryfhau polisïau oddi mewn iddynt, ni fydd gobaith cadw'r Gymraeg yn iaith fyw.'

Source: Hawl i Fyw Adra

Various models or methods have been proposed for the designation of Areas of Special Linguistic Significance. Below is an example of one broad model presented as a basis for targeting support for Welsh-speaking communities. Several responses referred to the need to grade Areas of Special Linguistic Designations and vary the support/regime to reflect the different percentages of Welsh speakers within communities.

'We need to define in detail what is meant by a "Welsh-speaking community", including "percentage of Welsh speakers" and "geographical linguistic community". We believe that we now need a threshold below 70% with the disappearance of 70%+ Welsh-speaking wards/communities in Carmarthenshire and Ceredigion and a threshold below 50% cumulatively county-wide. Our opinion is that Welsh-speaking communities need to be defined as those where 40%+ can speak Welsh. However, we need categories of areas of linguistic significance with the most thorough protection/monitoring in communities of 60%+ Welsh speakers (namely Gwynedd, Anglesey and the Uwch Aled area in Conwy). We assume that what's being considered here is communities or electoral divisions rather than wider areas such as Dwyfor or entire counties. It is therefore necessary to look at the percentages of electoral divisions throughout Wales in the first place and propose that we recommend graded designations of Areas of Linguistic Significance such as the following:

Category 1 Highest: (i) 70%+, and (ii) 60%-69%

Category 2 Intermediate: 40-59%Category 3 Foundation: 26-39%Category 4 Baseline: 0-25%

These areas would have a higher status of protection for the language in all types of town and country planning developments, with greater weighting being used by Local Authority planning officers and language officer on linguistic impact assessments or Welsh language statements.'

'Mae angen diffinio'n fanwl beth a olygir wrth "gymuned Gymraeg", gan gynnwys "canran o siaradwyr Cymraeg" a "chymuned ieithyddol ddaearyddol". Credwn fod angen trothwy is na 70% bellach gyda diflaniad wardiau/cymunedau 70%+ o siaradwyr Cymraeg yn Sir Gâr a Cheredigion a throthwy o dan 50% yn sirol gronnus. Ein barn yw bod angen diffinio cymunedau Cymraeg fel rhai lle mae 40%+ yn gallu siarad Cymraeg. Ond eto i gyd, mae angen categorïau o ardaloedd o arwyddocâd ieithyddol gyda'r warchodaeth/monitro mwyaf trylwyr mewn cymunedau 60%+ o siaradwyr Cymraeg (sef Gwynedd, Ynys Môn ac ardal Uwch-Aled yng Nghonwy). Casglwn ni mai cymunedau neu adrannau etholiadol sydd mewn



golwg yma yn hytrach nag ardaloedd ehangach megis Dwyfor neu siroedd cyfan. Mae angen felly edrych ar ganrannau adrannau etholiadol ledled Cymru yn y lle cyntaf a chynnig ein bod ni'n argymell graddoli dynodiadau Ardaloedd o Arwyddocâd leithyddol tebyg i'r canlynol:

• Categori 1 Uchaf: (i) 70%+, a (ii) 60%-69%

Categori 2 Canolig: 40-59%
Categori 3 Sylfaenol: 26-39%
Categori 4 Gwaelodlin: 0-25%

Byddai i'r ardaloedd hyn statws uwch o warchodaeth i'r iaith mewn pob math o ddatblygiadau cynllunio gwlad a thref, gyda phwysoliad uwch yn cael ei gymryd gan swyddogion cynllunio a swyddog iaith Awdurdod Lleol ar asesiadau effaith ieithyddol neu ddatganiadau iaith.'

Source: Dyfodol i'r laith

'From a housing and planning perspective, the ideas to create areas of linguistic sensitivity are to be welcomed with the need for policies to be different where there is a high density of Welsh speakers. Economically, an emphasis on the foundational economy would be key in Welsh-speaking communities – that is, an emphasis on the small and medium-sized businesses and social enterprises that provide those essential services to residents.'

'O safbwynt tai a chynllunio, mae'r syniadau i greu ardaloedd o sensitifrwydd ieithyddol i'w groesawu gyda angen i bolisïau fod yn wahanol ble mae dwysedd uchel o siaradwyr Cymraeg. Yn economaidd, byddai pwyslais ar yr economi sylfaenol yn allweddol mewn cymunedau Cymraeg – hynny yw, pwyslais ar y busnesau bach a chanolig a'r mentrau cymdeithasol sy'n darparu'r gwasanaethau hanfodol yna i drigolion.'

Source: Partneriaeth Ogwen

A Welsh language development path across all areas of Wales

Cymdeithas yr laith presented another proposal, suggesting that support should be based on the concept of a Welsh language continuum.

'We recommend the establishment of a Welsh Language Development Path which will include all areas of Wales with the aim of strengthening the position of the Welsh language in all parts of the country. The long-term goal in all parts of Wales is to reach a position where Welsh will be the main community language. The concept of the pathway (or continuum) has been used in education and can benefit from considering good practice in that area. In establishing such a route, the following are suggested as principles for the new guidelines.

- (i) Including a list of fundamental issues affecting the Welsh language that should be addressed in all parts of Wales.
- (ii) Establishing different linguistic categories in various areas, and tailoring education policies, administrative language, projects, housing and planning according to these linguistic categories. Rather than two categories ('sensitive' or not), there should be at least three or four categories with all areas of the country being categorised, considering the Welsh language on various scales.
- (iii) There may be suggestions as to how to determine these areas, but flexibility would be required, such as choosing between numbers (which may be more relevant within urban areas) and percentages as a criterion in determining the position of a community on the path.
- (iv) The Welsh Language Commissioner should be given a clear role in advising planning authorities in terms of how to categorise communities. The Commissioner should also have a role in approving self-assessments and monitoring progress.'
- 'Argymhellwn sefydlu Llwybr Datblygu'r Gymraeg a fydd yn cynnwys pob ardal o Gymru ac yn anelu at gryfhau sefyllfa'r Gymraeg ym mhob rhan o'r wlad. Y nod hir dymor ym mhob



rhan o Gymru yw cyrraedd sefyllfa lle mai'r Gymraeg fydd y brif iaith gymunedol. Mae cysyniad y llwybr (neu continwwm) yn un sydd wedi'i ddefnyddio ym maes addysg a gellir elwa o arfer da yn y maes hwnnw. Wrth sefydlu llwybr o'r fath, awgrymir defnyddio'r canlynol fel egwyddorion ar gyfer y canllawiau newydd.

- (i) Cynnwys rhestr o faterion sylfaenol sy'n effeithio ar y Gymraeg y dylid mynd i'r afael â nhw ym mhob rhan o Gymru.
- (ii) Sefydlu gwahanol gategorïau ieithyddol mewn amrywiaeth feysydd, a theilwra polisïau addysg, iaith weinyddol, prosiectau, tai a chynllunio yn ôl y categorïau ieithyddol hyn. Yn hytrach na dau gategori ('sensitif' neu beidio), dylai fod, o leiaf, dri neu bedwar categori y mae'n rhaid i bob ardal o'r wlad fod yn rhan ohono, gan roi ystyriaeth i'r Gymraeg ar wahanol raddfeydd.
- (iii) Gall fod awgrymiadau o ran sut i bennu'r ardaloedd hyn, ond byddai'n rhaid rhoi hyblygrwydd, megis dewis rhwng niferoedd (a all fod yn fwy perthnasol o fewn ardaloedd trefol) a chanrannau fel maen prawf o ran penderfynu lle mae cymuned yn eistedd o fewn y llwybr.
- (iv) Dylai fod rôl glir gan Gomisiynydd y Gymraeg i roi cyngor i awdurdodau cynllunio o ran sut i gategoreiddio cymunedau. Dylai hefyd fod rôl gan y Comisiynydd o ran cymeradwyo'r hunan-asesiadau a monitro'r cynnydd.'

Source: Cymdeithas yr laith Gymraeg

2.3 Language planning body

Related to the issues above, points were raised by respondents regarding the need for an entity to lead or coordinate policy in Welsh-speaking areas. Ideas were presented for different possible models including establishing a 'unit' within the Welsh Government to lead the work and/or give responsibilities and functions to an arm's length body. One respondent noted that several steps should be considered as part of the process, starting with the establishment of a 'division of the Welsh Government at the outset [in order to implement policies compatible with the prosperity of Welsh communities] considering the suitability of developing an official body at arm's length from the government in due course' (Mentrau laith Cymru).⁶

Proposal 3: Developing a language planning body

'From encouraging the development of planning and regional policies to promoting the Welsh language, a key question is who would be responsible for coordinating the work... Two obvious options would be to establish a specific team within the Welsh Government to lead the work within "Welsh-speaking communities", a team that would be located in the areas where Welsh is strong. The other option would be to establish a regional language planning agency.'

'O annog datblygu cynllunio a pholisïau rhanbarthol i hyrwyddo'r Gymraeg, cwestiwn allweddol yw pwy fyddai'n gyfrifol am gydlynu'r gwaith ... Dau opsiwn amlwg fyddai sefydlu tîm penodol o fewn Llywodraeth Cymru i arwain ar y gwaith o fewn "cymunedau Cymraeg", tîm fyddai wedi ei leoli yn y cadarnleoedd. Yr opsiwn arall fyddai sefydlu asiantaeth gynllunio iaith rhanbarthol.'

Source: Aberystwyth University

'In order to provide support and develop policies for Welsh-speaking communities, it is clear that a type of governance structure will be necessary.

⁶ 'is-adran o Lywodraeth Cymru ar y cychwyn [er mwyn gweithredu polisïau cydnaws â ffyniant cymunedau Cymraeg] gan ystyried addasrwydd datblygu corff swyddogol hyd braich o'r llywodraeth maes o law'



_

- We believe that leadership must come from the Government in the first place. As an
 initial step, a division should be designated with appointed officers in order to
 demonstrate clearly that it is serious about the work.
- An arm's-length body similar to the Welsh Language Board could also be considered, or using management elements of bodies such as national parks or Areas of Outstanding Natural Beauty as possible models.'

'Er mwyn darparu'r gefnogaeth a datblygu'r polisïau ar gyfer cymunedau Cymraeg, mae'n amlwg y bydd yn rhaid wrth fath o strwythur lywodraethu.

- Credwn fod yn rhaid i'r arweiniad ddod gan y Llywodraeth yn y lle cyntaf. Fel cam cychwynnol, dylid dynodi is-adran ac iddi swyddogion penodedig er mwyn dangos yn glir ei bod o ddifrif ynghylch y gwaith.
- Gellid hefyd ystyried corff hyd-braich tebyg i Fwrdd yr laith Gymraeg, neu ddefnyddio elfennau o reolaeth cyrff fel parciau cenedlaethol neu Ardaloedd o Harddwch Naturiol Eithriadol fel modelau posibl.'

Source: Mentrau laith Cymru

'We suggest the Government establishes a Policy Group, to ensure that experts in specific policy areas negotiate with language planners, to ensure that clauses regarding the use of the Welsh language are part of any new Welsh Government policy.'

'Rydym yn awgrymu bod y Llywodraeth yn sefydlu Grŵp Polisi, er mwyn sicrhau bod arbenigwyr mewn meysydd polisi penodol yn cyd-drafod gyda chynllunwyr iaith, er mwyn sicrhau bod cymalau ynghylch defnydd y Gymraeg yn rhan o unrhyw bolisi newydd gan Lywodraeth Cymru.'

Source: Ceredigion County Council

Possible functions of a new body

A few responses went further, suggesting a name for the body and compiling a list of possible functions for an entity or 'authority':

'Establishing a Welsh-speaking Communities Development Authority, a body with the objective of maintaining, reinforcing and creating Welsh-speaking domains/areas... It would be responsible for the following:

- a. Providing expert advice and guidance on language planning to the Welsh Government and local authorities.
- b. Providing subsidies and specialist advice to support the development of Welsh language businesses and potential Welsh-speaking entrepreneurs.
- c. Contribute to the process of formulating and applying national and regional economic strategy and policies in accordance with the principle that the well-being and prosperity of Welsh as a community language is an essential precondition.
- d. Formulating and implementing a strategy to promote the use of the Welsh language through sophisticated methods that have proven successful in comparable situations in other countries.

Support a varied programme of leisure activities through the medium of Welsh for children and young people in the community through Mentrau laith, the Urdd, Young Farmers Clubs, sports clubs and entertainment organisers.'

'Sefydlu Awdurdod Datblygu Cymunedau Cymraeg, corff a fyddai â'r amcan o gynnal, atgyfnerthu a chreu peuoedd cwbl Gymraeg... Byddai'n gyfrifol am y canlynol:



- a. Rhoi cyngor ac arweiniad arbenigol ar gynllunio iaith i Lywodraeth Cymru ac i'r awdurdodau lleol.
- b. Darparu cymorthdaliadau a chyngor arbenigol i gefnogi datblygiad busnesau Cymraeg a darpar-fentergarwyr Cymraeg.
- c. Cyfrannu yn y broses o lunio a chymhwyso strategaeth a pholisïau economaidd cenedlaethol a rhanbarthol yn unol â'r egwyddor fod lles a ffyniant y Gymraeg fel iaith gymunedol yn rhagamod hanfodol.
- ch. Llunio a gweithredu strategaeth hybu defnydd o'r Gymraeg drwy ddulliau soffistigedig sydd wedi profi'n llwyddiannus mewn sefyllfaoedd cymharol mewn gwledydd eraill.

Cefnogi rhaglen o weithgareddau hamdden amrywiol trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg ar gyfer plant a phobl ifanc yn y gymuned drwy'r Mentrau Iaith, yr Urdd, Clybiau Ffermwyr Ifanc, clybiau chwaraeon a threfnwyr adloniant.'

Source: Cylch yr laith

Opinion among respondents was mixed in relation to the possible role of local authorities under any new language planning arrangements. Some respondents suggested that 'county councils should be encouraged to appoint officers with specific responsibility for ensuring that all their policies are compatible with the well-being of Welsh-speaking communities.' However, other respondents indicated that they were not in favour of giving language planning functions to local authorities and that action should be taken through the Welsh Government or an agency accountable to the Welsh Government. More specifically, one individual believed there is 'not much history and understanding of the field of "language planning" within local authorities, and they are unlikely to develop a significant "language planning" role and activity unless there is a mix of enforcement and financial incentive from the Welsh Government to do so.'8

When discussing the concept of establishing a national body, one respondent referred to the need to ensure that matters relating to the Welsh language and planning for the protection of Welsh-speaking communities are not considered the responsibility of one sole body. Carmarthenshire County Council's response indicated that 'there has been a tendency to leave the Welsh language to the Welsh Language Commissioner and that there is very little planning and understanding in terms of Welsh-speaking communities within the work and output of the office of the Future Generations Commissioner.'9 Their response went on to call for assurance that 'an understanding of the unique requirements of Welsh-speaking communities exists within all Welsh national institutions and agencies.'10

^{10 &#}x27;dealltwriaeth o ofynion unigryw cymunedau Cymraeg yn bodoli o fewn holl sefydliadau ac asiantaethau cenedlaethol Cymru.'



_

⁷ 'annog cynghorau [sir] i benodi swyddogion ac iddynt gyfrifoldeb penodol dros sicrhau bod eu holl bolisïau yn gydnaws â llesiant cymunedau Cymraeg.'

⁸ 'nad oes llawer o hanes a dealltwriaeth o'r maes 'cynllunio iaith' o fewn awdurdodau lleol, a maent yn annhebyg o ddatblygu rôl a gweithgaredd 'cynllunio iaith' sylweddol oni bai bod cymysgedd o orfodaeth a cymhelliant ariannol gan [Lywodraeth Cymru] i wneud hynny.'

⁹ 'tueddiad wedi bod i adael y Gymraeg i'r Comisiynydd laith Gymraeg a bach iawn o gynllunio a dealltwriaeth o ran cymunedau Cymraeg [sydd] o fewn gwaith ac allbwn swyddfa'r Comisiynydd Cenedlaethau'r Dyfodol.'

2.4 Strengthening Welsh Language Standards as a tool to support language planning

Following on from the points in the previous subsection on the functions of local authorities in strengthening and maintaining Welsh-speaking communities, the responses referred to the current regulatory context where authorities are 'subject to Welsh language standards, ... including a category of specific standards relating to the promotion of the Welsh language' (Welsh Language Commissioner). In its response, the Welsh Language Commissioner referred to requiring local authorities to include a target for increasing or maintaining the number of Welsh speakers in their areas within their Welsh language promotion strategies every 5 years.

However, some respondents highlighted the need for stronger arrangements (and appropriate funding) in order to support local authority activities in relation to the Standards.

'Local Authorities are expected to contribute to the work through their Welsh language Promotion Strategies (a requirement of Standard 145/146). A more coordinated approach is needed to oversee the support and budget available to implement these plans locally, in order to be able to invest in technology and resources that can make a difference to the use of the Welsh language.'

'Mae disgwyl i Awdurdodau Lleol gyfrannu at y gwaith drwy eu Strategaethau Hybu'r Gymraeg (gofyniad Safon 145/146). Mae angen trefn fwy cydlynus ar gyfer y gefnogaeth a'r gyllideb sydd ar gael ar gyfer gweithredu'r cynlluniau hyn yn lleol, er mwyn medru buddsoddi mewn technoleg ac adnoddau a all wneud gwahaniaeth i ddefnydd y Gymraeg.'

Source: Ceredigion County Council

In its response, the Welsh Language Commissioner referred to policy making standards, which place a duty on local authorities to consider the impact of policy on the Welsh language. It was noted that there were several publications that the Commission should consider:

- Policy Making Standards: Creating opportunities for persons to use the Welsh language and treating the Welsh language no less favourably than the English language (Welsh Language Commissioner, 2020)
- Promotion standards: assessing the achievement of the 5-year strategies Effective practice guidance document (Welsh Language Commissioner, 2021)

The Commissioner referred to indicators within these documents for 'measuring the impact of the promotion strategies and reference to research and information relevant to the work of the Commission.'12

When discussing the implementation of the policy making standards, some respondents believed there is a 'fundamental weakness' in the current arrangements which can be traced back to the provisions of the Welsh Language Measure. A comparison was made with the situation in the field of planning where local authorities have a duty to consider the impact of planning decisions on the environment.

Proposal 4: Consider changing the Standards to be statutory duties

^{13 &#}x27;gwendid sylfaenol'



1

¹¹ 'ddarostyngedig i safonau'r Gymraeg, ...gan gynnwys dosbarth o safonau penodol yn ymwneud â hybu'r Gymraeg'

¹² 'mesur traweffaith y strategaethau hybu a chyfeiriad at ymchwil a gwybodaeth berthnasol i waith y Comisiwn.'

"...there is a fundamental difference between the two types of duty in terms of what happens if the authority does not comply with the duty in question. If an authority fails to comply with its duty in relation to the impact of a planning decision on the environment, a request can be made for a judicial review of that failure. By doing so, the court can, in an appropriate case, prohibit the authority from proceeding with its decision until it has carried out the appropriate consultation and/or considered the appropriate matters. However, if an authority fails to adhere to its duty under the policy standards in terms of impact on the Welsh language, a request for a judicial review does not seem to be an option at present. The only possible course of action for a member of the public in these circumstances is to make a complaint to the Commissioner. The Commissioner has no powers to do anything other than carry out an investigation and, if they find that there has been a breach of the standards, impose a sanction. Unlike the courts, the Commissioner has no power to prevent a local authority from proceeding with its policy or plans until the authority has done what is required under the standards. The authority can therefore proceed without carrying out a thorough consultation, or without any consultation, or without considering the impact on the Welsh language. The Ysgol Felindre case can be referred to as an example of this. There is scope to strengthen the system by changing the policy standards to become statutory duties, so that they cannot be avoided. Doing so would also encourage local authorities to take their responsibility towards protecting and maintaining Welsh-speaking communities more seriously.'

'...mae gwahaniaeth sylfaenol rhwng y ddau fath o ddyletswydd yn yr hyn sydd yn digwydd os nad yw'r awdurdod yn cadw at y dyletswydd dan sylw. Os yw awdurdod yn methu â chadw at ei ddyletswydd o ran effaith penderfyniad cynllunio ar yr amgylchedd, fe ellir gwneud cais am adolygiad barnwrol o'r methiant hwnnw. O wneud hynny, gall y llys, mewn achos priodol, wahardd yr awdurdod rhag bwrw mlaen gyda'i benderfyniad hyd nes ei fod wedi cynnal yr ymgynghoriad priodol a/neu ystyried y materion priodol. Os yw awdurdod yn methu â chadw at ei ddyletswydd dan y safonau polisi o ran effaith ar y Gymraeg, fodd bynnag, nid yw cais am adolygiad barnwrol fel pe bai'n opsiwn ar hyn o bryd. Yr unig gam posib i aelod o'r cyhoedd yn yr amgylchiadau hyn yw gwneud cwyn i'r Comisiynydd. Nid oes pwerau gan y Comisiynydd i wneud dim ond cynnal ymchwiliad ac, os yw'n canfod y bu torri ar y safonau. osod sancsiwn. Yn wahanol i'r llysoedd, does gan y Comisiynydd ddim grym i atal awdurdod lleol rhag bwrw mlaen a'i bolisi neu ei gynlluniau hyd nes bo'r awdurdod wedi gwneud yr hyn sy'n ofynnol dan y safonau. Mae modd felly i'r awdurdod fwrw mlaen heb gynnal ymgynghoriad trylwyr, neu o gwbl, neu heb ystyried yr effaith ar y Gymraeg. Gellir cyfeirio at achos Ysgol Felindre fel enghraifft o hyn. Mae lle i gryfhau'r drefn drwy newid y safonau polisi i fod yn ddyletswyddau statudol, fel na bo modd eu hosgoi. Byddai hynny hefyd yn annog awdurdodau lleol i gymryd eu cyfrifoldeb tuag at ddiogelu a chynnal cymunedau Cymraeg yn fwy o ddifri.'

Source: Aberystwyth University



3. Education policy

This chapter on the education policy area presents proposals in relation to:

- Welsh language transmission within the family:
- Early years;
- Immersion of latecomers:
- Categorisation of schools;
- Secondary education;
- Funding higher education and
- Further education.

3.1 Welsh language transmission within the family

Respondents referred to the importance of language transmission within the home, noting that this plays a vital role as a first step in the journey of transmitting the Welsh language to the next generation. Although not related to education as such, some respondents emphasised that tackling transmission rates was an urgent matter. We need 'interventions at a specialist level, coming from several directions,' suggested Menter Môn, as 'data [national and data local to Anglesey] show that the rates are worsening quickly and we therefore believe that there is no time to try and understand the situation completely before taking action' (Menter Môn).¹⁴ Mudiad Meithrin also emphasised the need to 'encourage and support parents, families and early years practitioners' and noted that, although plans already exist, all interventions 'are not being implemented to their full potential for financial reasons.'15

3.2 Early years

Many of the respondents expressed a desire for sufficient Welsh-medium pre-school places, specifically more Welsh-medium childcare and the aspiration to have a cylch meithrin on the site of every Welsh-medium primary school. However, these ideas were conveyed as aspirations rather than specific proposals. There were some specific proposals regarding activity that could support an increase in Welsh-medium pre-school provision.

Proposal 5: Supporting Welsh-medium childcare and early years provision

'We need permanent national campaigns to promote and champion Welsh-medium childcare and education to parents and families. Government marketing campaigns which educate the population carry a unique status which is different from promotion and championing efforts which are dependent on the cooperation of various grassroots movements and organisations....Mudiad Meithrin would like to see an intensive campaign to reach parents

^{15 &#}x27;[angen] [c]alonogi a chefnogi rhieni, teuluoedd ac ymarferwyr blynyddoedd cynnar'; 'yn cael eu gweithredu i'w llawn botensial a hyn am resymau ariannol.'



^{14 &#}x27;ymyraethau ar lefel arbenigol, sy'n dod o sawl cyfeiriad [gan fod] data [cenedlaethol a lleol i Fôn] yn dangos bod y cyfraddau yn gwaethygu'n gyflym a chredwn felly nad oes amser i geisio deall y sefyllfa yn gyfan gwbl cyn gweithredu.'

directly to promote Welsh language childcare and education for everyone in Wales. Current promotion and championing efforts are indirect and dependent on the cooperation of various movements and organisations that are trying to promote their own (other) specific services. The Welsh Government should continue to develop this work.'

'Mae angen ymgyrchoedd cenedlaethol parhaol i hybu a hyrwyddo gofal plant ag addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg i rieni a theuluoedd. Mae ymgyrchoedd marchnata llywodraethol sydd yn addysgu'r boblogaeth yn cario statws unigryw sydd yn wahanol i ymdrechion hybu a hyrwyddo sydd yn ddibynnol ar gydweithrediad amryw o fudiadau a sefydliadau llawr gwlad....Hoffai Mudiad Meithrin weld ymgyrch ddwys i gyrraedd rhieni yn uniongyrchol i hyrwyddo gofal plant ac addysg Gymraeg i bawb yng Nghymru. Mae'r ymdrechion hybu a hyrwyddo presennol yn anuniongyrchol ac yn ddibynnol ar gydweithrediad amryw o fudiadau a sefydliadau sydd yn ceisio hybu eu gwasanaethau (eraill) penodol eu hunain. Dylai Llywodraeth Cymru barhau a datblygu'r gwaith hwn.'

Source: Mudiad Meithrin

'Where Welsh in Education Strategic Plans identify schools that will move along a language continuum, a timetable should be provided for that, collaborating with Mudiad Meithrin to develop a nearby Cylch Meithrin.'

'Lle mae'r CSGA'n adnabod ysgolion fydd yn symud ar hyd continwwm iaith, dylid rhoi amserlen ar hynny a chydweithio gyda Mudiad Meithrin i ddatblygu Cylch Meithrin cyfagos.'

Source: Mudiad Meithrin

'Funding nursery classes within all Welsh-medium schools could be considered' [and] 'Ensure consistency in linguistic expectation in terms of non-maintained childcare provision. Mudiad Meithrin and [Early Years Wales] need to focus on the role of language acquisition rather than being inspected like nursery classes in schools.'

'Gellid ystyried cyllido dosbarthiadau meithrin o fewn pob ysgol cyfrwng Cymraeg' [a] 'Cysoni'r disgwyliad ieithyddol o ran darpariaeth gofal plant nas gynhelir. [Mae] Mudiad Meithrin a [Blynyddoedd Cynnar Cymru] angen canolbwyntio ar rôl caffael iaith yn hytrach na cael eu harolygu fel dosbarthiadau meithrin mewn ysgolion.'

Source: Ceredigion County Council

'It is essential that there is a consistent effort, to ensure that Flying Start practitioners are aware of and encourage the use of Welsh with babies and their parents. Work is already underway between Local Authorities and us as a Menter laith to ensure this, but we believe that a clear, stronger strategy is needed, on a national level.'

'Mae'n hanfodol bod yma ymdrech gyson, i sicrhau bod ymarferwyr Dechrau'n Deg yn ymwybodol ac yn annog defnyddio'r Gymraeg gyda babanod a'u rhieni. Mae gwaith yn digwydd eisoes rhwng yr Awdurdodau Lleol a ni fel Menter laith i sicrhau hyn, ond credwn bod angen strategaeth clir, cryfach, a hynny yn genedlaethol.'

Source: Menter Môn



3.3 Welsh in Education Strategic Plans (WESPs)

Several respondents felt that it was necessary to strengthen the status of Welsh in Education Strategic Plans. A need to connect WESPs with local authorities' wider areas of work was identified – linking these strategies with the five-year strategies for promoting the Welsh language but also local development plans and other plans that influence decisions across a range of policy areas.

Proposal 6: Strengthening Welsh in Education Strategic Plans and increasing the capacity and understanding of local authorities

'Empower the WESP at Welsh Government level and establish regional/local bodies that would demand compliance.'

'Grymuso'r CSGA ar lefel Llywodraeth Cymru a sefydlu cyrff rhanbarthol/lleol a fyddai'n mynnu cydymffurfiaeth.'

Source: UCAC

'It continues to disappoint us how little awareness there is within some local authorities about this strategy beyond the education department and sometimes officers who aren't necessarily involved with implementing the plan..... And so, as part of this process, it is necessary to look in more detail at the status of this strategy within the local authorities in question and how it connects to all aspects of local authorities' work.'

'Daw'n siom i ni o hyd cyn lleied o ymwybyddiaeth sydd mewn rhai awdurdodau lleol am y strategaeth yma y tu hwnt i'r adran addysg ac weithiau swyddogion sydd ddim o reidrwydd yn ymwneud â gwireddu'r cynllun.... Ac felly mae angen, yn ystod y broses hon, edrych yn fanylach ar statws y strategaeth hon o fewn yr awdurdodau lleol dan sylw a sut y mae'n cydblethu drwy holl agweddau gwaith yr awdurdodau lleol.'

Source: RhAG

Inclusion of provisions within the new Welsh Language Education Act which are relevant to Welsh in Education Strategic Plans which 'set targets for each authority so that all children receive Welsh-medium education by 2050.'

Cynnwys darpariaethau o fewn Deddf Addysg Gymraeg newydd sy'n berthnasol i Gynlluniau Strategol y Gymraeg mewn Addysg sy'n 'gosod targedau ar bob awdurdod fel bod pob plentyn yn derbyn addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg erbyn 2050.'

Source: Cymdeithas yr Iaith Gymraeg

3.4 Extending opportunities for latecomers to acquire the language

A significant number of respondents highlighted the need to ensure opportunities for children of families who move to Welsh communities to be able to acquire the language and access routes to Welsh-medium education. Recognising that provision is available in a number of immersion centres across Welsh-speaking communities, the need was identified to extend and promote the provision from early years to secondary education, giving consideration to targeting provision more widely than solely for latecomers.



Proposal 7: Extending opportunities for latecomers and other children to acquire the language

'Following Anglesey's example by placing additional emphasis on introducing the Welsh language and immersing children in the language during the early years.'

'Dilyn esiampl Môn trwy osod pwyslais ychwanegol ar gyflwyno'r Gymraeg a throchi plant yn yr iaith yn ystod y blynyddoedd cynnar.'

Source: Anglesey County Council

'Funding and establishing immersion / accelerated centres in every secondary school.' 'Ariannu a sefydlu canolfannau trochi/carlam ymhob ysgol uwchradd.'

It was suggested that education grant funding might be linked with provision for latecomers, and the aspirations of Welsh in Education Strategic Plans 'rewarding vision and the impact of actions.'

('gan wobrwyo gweledigaeth ac effaith gweithredoedd.')

Source: Ceredigion County Council

'Alongside proposals to extend provision for latecomers and immersion schemes, respondents identified the need to ensure that professional learning opportunities and Continuous Learning Development are available to embed understanding of immersion strategies within the education workforce in Wales.'

'Law yn llaw gyda chynigion i ymestyn darpariaeth i hwyrddyfodiaid a chynlluniau trochi, nododd ymatebwyr yr angen i sicrhau bod cyfleoedd dysgu proffesiynol a Datblygiad Dysgu Parhaol ar gael i wreiddio dealltwriaeth o strategaethau trochi ymysg y gweithlu addysg yng Nghymru.'

Source: Ceredigion County Council

3.5 Categorisation of schools

Respondents suggested that the current school categorisation arrangements have weakened Welsh language provision compared to previous arrangements. A number of respondents referred to the need to encourage schools to move along the language continuum. However, several organisations presented more concrete proposals suggesting reform of the categorisation system and the introduction of more progressive school policies at local authority level in order to protect and develop Welsh-medium education.

Proposal 8: Reforming county council education policies and school categorisation

'Primary education through the medium of Welsh only in specific local authorities e.g. Anglesey, Gwynedd, Ceredigion, Carmarthenshire and in specific areas within other local authorities, ensuring immersion provision for latecomers.'

'Addysg gynradd drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg yn unig mewn awdurdodau lleol penodol e.e. Môn, Gwynedd, Ceredigion, Sir Gâr ac mewn ardaloedd penodol o fewn awdurdodau lleol eraill, gan sicrhau darpariaeth drochi i hwyrddyfodiaid.'

Source: UCAC



'All primary and secondary education should be offered in Welsh, and only in Welsh, in schools in these areas.'

'Dylai holl addysg gynradd ac uwchradd gael ei gynnig yn Gymraeg, a Chymraeg yn unig, yn ysgolion yr ardaloedd hyn.'

Source: Individual respondent

'Arrangements and a timetable should be set to move all schools in Gwynedd and Anglesey to be Welsh-medium schools (3P) and a large proportion of schools in Ceredigion and Carmarthenshire. Announcing this intention clearly would be one step forward, and then direct action is needed which would probably begin with primary schools, turning schools into Welsh-medium schools at pace. It therefore follows that no further teachers or assistants should be appointed to any school in the four counties without Welsh skills relevant to the job. By adopting Welsh-medium education, it would be possible to communicate clearly to all who come to live in the area that the language of education in the area is Welsh.

Two categories are needed for schools where 100% of pupils follow courses through the medium of Welsh:

Category 1A: Schools where 100% of pupils follow more or less 100% of the subjects in Welsh and Welsh is the general language of school-wide activities and extracurricular activities.

Category 1B: Schools where 100% of pupils follow 80% of the subjects in Welsh and Welsh is the general language of school-wide activities and extracurricular activities.

There can then be variations on Category 2, to include 'bilingual' schools and some current 'dual stream' schools, e.g.

Category 2A: Schools where 60% of pupils follow at least 70% of subjects in Welsh Category 2B: Schools where 40% of pupils follow at least 60% of subjects in Welsh

Category 2C: Weaker variations

Category 3: Schools that begin to introduce some subjects in Welsh to all pupils.'

'Dylid gosod trefn ac amserlen i symud pob ysgol yn siroedd Gwynedd ac Ynys Môn i fod yn ysgolion Cymraeg (3P) a chyfran helaeth o ysgolion yn siroedd Ceredigion a Chaerfyrddin. Byddai cyhoeddi'r bwriad yn glir yn un cam ymlaen, ac wedyn mae angen gweithredu uniongyrchol sydd yn ôl pob tebyg yn cychwyn gydag ysgolion cynradd i droi ysgolion yn ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg rhag blaen. Mae'n dilyn wrth reswm felly na ddylid penodi unrhyw athrawon neu gynorthwywyr pellach i unrhyw ysgol yn y pedair sir heb sgiliau Cymraeg perthnasol i'r swydd. O fabwysiadu'r drefn o Addysg Gymraeg, byddai modd cyfathrebu yn glir i bawb sy'n dod i fyw i'r ardal mai iaith addysg yr ardal yw'r Gymraeg.

Mae angen 2 gategori i ysgolion lle mae 100% o'r disgyblion yn dilyn cyrsiau trwy'r Gymraeg:

Categori 1A: Ysgolion lle mae 100% o'r disgyblion yn dilyn fwy neu lai 100% o'r pynciau trwy'r Gymraeg a'r Gymraeg yw iaith gyffredin gweithgareddau ysgol-gyfan a gweithgareddau allgyrsiol.

Categori 1B: Ysgolion lle mae 100% o'r disgyblion yn dilyn 80%+ o'r pynciau trwy'r Gymraeg a'r Gymraeg yw iaith gyffredin gweithgareddau ysgol-gyfan a gweithgareddau allgyrsiol.

Yna gellir cael amrywiadau ar Gategori 2, i gynnwys ysgolion 'dwyieithog' a rhai 'dwy ffrwd' presennol, e.e.

Categori 2A: Ysgolion 60% o'r disgyblion yn dilyn o leiaf 70% o bynciau trwy'r Gymraeg

Categori 2B: Ysgolion 40% o'r disgyblion yn dilyn o leiaf 60% o bynciau trwy'r Gymraeg

Categori 2C: Amrywiadau gwannach

Categori 3: Ysgolion lle y dechreuir cyflwyno rhai pynciau trwy'r Gymraeg i bob disgybl.'

Source: Dyfodol i'r laith



'Setting targets for schools to provide more high profile academic subjects in Welsh and normalise the studying of these subjects through the medium of Welsh.'

'Gosod targedau ar gyfer ysgolion i ddarparu mwy o bynciau academaidd statws uchel drwy'r Gymraeg a normaleiddio astudio'r pynciau hyn drwy'r Gymraeg.'

Source: Aberystwyth University

3.6 Further and vocational education

Respondents highlighted the need to strengthen the provision of further education courses and modules through the medium of Welsh. It was suggested that a number of young people from Welsh-speaking backgrounds choose not to follow further education through the medium of Welsh even though they are likely to continue to live and work in the area/county. This includes young people who are following courses in key occupations such as care, childcare, health, and public services.

Proposal 9: Extending Welsh-medium vocational courses, and supporting oral skills through these courses

'Ensuring that there are opportunities for an individual to follow relevant and meaningful vocational courses through the medium of Welsh, together with opportunities for current members of the workforce to develop and strengthen their Welsh language skills. We suggest that it should be required that the oral assessment element of these vocational courses is conducted in Welsh to ensure that new members of the workforce have the necessary basic skills.'

'Sicrhau bod yna gyfleoedd i unigolyn ddilyn cyrsiau galwedigaethol perthnasol ac ystyrlon trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, ar y cyd gyda chyfleoedd i aelodau presennol y gweithlu i ddatblygu ac i gryfhau eu sgiliau Cymraeg. Awgrymwn y dylid mynnu fod elfen asesiad llafar y cyrsiau galwedigaethol hyn yn digwydd yn Gymraeg er mwyn sicrhau bod gan aelodau newydd o'r gweithlu'r sgiliau sylfaenol angenrheidiol.'

Source: Mudiad Meithrin

'Considering the decrease in the number of speakers aged 18-24, there needs to be a greater emphasis on vocational education and creating Welsh-medium work opportunities. Developing a Welsh-medium apprenticeship scheme would be beneficial, giving Welsh speakers and learners the opportunity to gain intensive work experience in social enterprises or businesses where Welsh is a strong administrative language. The Gwynedd Social Enterprise Network is the perfect partner to pilot this type of scheme and the "Slate, Coal and Countryside" scheme is a model that has already been successful.'

'O ystyried y cwymp mewn siaradwyr 18-24 oed, mae angen pwyslais mwy ar addysg alwedigaethol a chreu cyfleoedd gwaith cyfrwng Cymraeg. Byddai datblygu cynllun prentisiaethau Cymraeg yn fanteisiol gan roi cyfle i siaradwyr Cymraeg a dysgwyr gael profiad gwaith dwys mewn mentrau cymdeithasol neu fusnesau ble mae'r Gymraeg yn iaith weinyddol gadarn. Mae Rhwydwaith Mentrau Cymdeithasol Gwynedd yn bartner perffaith i beilota'r math yma o gynllun a mae cynllun "Llechi, Glo a Chefn Gwlad" yn fodel sydd eisoes wedi llwyddo.'

Source: Partneriaeth Ogwen



'More investment is needed in Welsh-medium professional educational courses in Further Education Colleges, Higher Education and Universities, where there is a shortage of expertise locally.'

'Mae angen mwy o fuddsoddiad mewn cyrsiau addysgol proffesiynol cyfrwng Cymraeg mewn Colegau Addysg Bellach, Addysg Uwch a Phrifysgolion, lle mae prinder arbenigedd yn lleol.' Source: Ceredigion County Council

3.7 Higher education

Several respondents raised concerns about the numbers of young people leaving Wales, and Welsh-speaking communities in particular, to pursue higher education. Several organisations and individuals expressed the view that the Seren programme had contributed to the pattern of emigration among young people from Wales. There were a number of comments supporting the idea of following arrangements in Scotland, for example, where their policy and financial arrangements encourage people to receive education in that country.

Proposal 10: Reforming the student support system

'Where students choose to go to university in England and the Welsh Government assists them financially, a policy should be adopted that they return to Wales to work for five years after completing the course, or that the financial support is a loan which would not need to be repaid if the students returned to work for five years. Better still would be that the public sector could employ them for a specific period in order to strengthen work opportunities and experience for bilingual students.'

'Dylid mabwysiadu polisi os yw myfyrwyr yn dewis mynd i brifysgol yn Lloegr a Llywodraeth Cymru yn cynorthwyo'r myfyrwyr yn ariannol, eu bod yn dychwelyd i Gymru i weithio am bum mlynedd ar ôl cwblhau'r cwrs, neu fod y cymhorthdal ariannol yn fenthyciad na fyddai angen ei ad-dalu pe bai'r myfyrwyr yn dychwelyd i weithio am bum mlynedd. Gorau oll, pe bai'r sector cyhoeddus yn gallu eu cyflogi am gyfnod penodol er mwyn cryfhau cyfleoedd gwaith a phrofiad i fyfyrwyr dwyieithog.'

Source: Dyfodol i'r laith



4. Agricultural and land use policy

Several respondents referred to the high number of Welsh speakers working in the agricultural sector. The agriculture sector in Wales has a significantly higher percentage (43%) of workers who speak Welsh compared to the national average of 19%, which means that this is the industry with the highest proportion of Welsh speakers. This highlights a strong relationship between the Welsh language and the agricultural industry, indicating its importance to the future of the language as a community language. This was the context of a large number of responses in the area of agricultural policy.

4.1 Supporting smaller farms and family farms

Protecting family farms was a common concern among respondents, who provided suggestions for ensuring their sustainability and resilience.

Proposal 11: Ensuring the stability of family farms

'Give consideration to the recommendations of the <u>laith y Pridd</u> 2020 report, including "Ensuring that policies and the benefit payment system support activity on the family farm" and "Ensuring that the planning system supports rural enterprises and communities."

'Rhoi ystyriaeth i argymhellion yr adroddiad <u>laith y Pridd</u> 2020, yn cynnwys awgrymiadau'n cynnwys "Sicrhau bod polisïau a'r system gymorthdaliadau yn cefnogi gweithgarwch ar y fferm deulu" a "Sicrhau bod y gyfundrefn gynllunio yn cefnogi mentrau a chymunedau gwledig."

Source: Menter a Busnes, Ceredigion County Council and NFU Cymru

The <u>Agriculture (Wales) Bill</u> establishes Sustainable Land Management as the legislative framework for future agricultural policy. The policy framework focuses on the complementary objectives of supporting farmers to produce food in a sustainable way. One idea proposed was to amend the Bill to specifically include support for family farms: 'While the inclusion of sustainable food production and the Welsh language within the four primary Sustainable Land Management (SLM) Objectives outlined in the draft Agriculture (Wales) Bill is welcomed, the FUW continues to lobby for an additional fifth objective which explicitly seeks to ensure the economic stability of farming families.'

Source: Farmers' Union of Wales

'Grants could be offered to farmers to sell agricultural land for development as Community Land Trusts.'

'Gellid cynnig grantiau i ffermwyr werthu tir amaethyddol ar gyfer eu datblygu'n Ymddiriedolaethau Tir Cymunedol.'

Source: Individual respondent

'Subsidies should be removed from the largest farms and more subsidies should be provided to family farms. It does not make any sense at all that some farmers receive hundreds of thousands of pounds.'

¹⁶ Figures from the Menter a Busnes submission



24

'Dylid tynnu cymorthdaliadau oddi ar y ffermydd mwyaf a rhoi mwy o cymorthdaliadau i'r ffermydd deuluol. Does dim synnwyr yn y byd fod rhai amaethwyr yn derbyn cannoedd o filoedd o bunnoedd.'

Source: Individual respondent

'Rather than plan rural social housing why not reintroduce tenant farms which would retain young farmers in their communities, be an investment for Councils and take into account local need.'

Source: Individual respondent

4.2 Forestry Policy

Some respondents referred to existing policies and regulations and, in some cases, to the negative unintended consequences of certain targets. There were recommendations to prohibit large companies from outside Wales from buying land, as well as reviewing forestry and land use policies, as it was claimed that these policies have significant effects on the Welsh economy and environment and can replace the current ownership of family farms. Some said that planting trees on agricultural land should be subject to planning permission. Respondents suggested that, by prioritising the ownership and management of land and resources locally, the Welsh Government could promote sustainable and community-led practices, while protecting the rights of local people to access and benefit from their own natural resources.

4.3 Conservation and biodiversity

Respondents indicated that ensuring food security for local communities and producing more food locally was a possible step forward, but no specific proposals were made, apart from some general points about diversifying local food sources, promoting biodiversity, and supporting smaller agricultural units. Likewise, although no specific proposals were made regarding conservation and environmental protection, some respondents questioned where this would fit in the role of the Commission and suggested that these policy areas needed to be included.



5. Regeneration and economic development policy areas

Respondents paid considerable attention to economic development and regeneration issues, with a number framing their comments and suggestions as ideas to tackle their biggest concern, namely emigration among young people:

'The main problem facing Ceredigion in general, from the perspective of the Welsh language, is emigration. Data about this has been available for a long time but the latest census shows the phenomenon clearly. Economic factors such as a lack of good jobs and housing unaffordability are pushing Welsh-speaking young people out of the area.' (Aberystwyth Town Council)¹⁷

5.1 Expansion and funding of the ARFOR Scheme

Many respondents referred to the importance of ensuring strong and coherent economic, community and linguistic plans. They also highlighted the need for sufficient funding over the medium and long term for plans to come to fruition. The importance of the ARFOR Programme, which has supported entrepreneurship and the rural economy in Ceredigion, Carmarthenshire, Anglesey and Gwynedd, was highlighted as a means of maintaining the Welsh language in its strongholds.

Proposal 11: Building on the ARFOR Programme and a commitment to its funding

'We believe that the Arfor scheme needs to be expanded over the medium term, no less than 5 years, with sufficient funding allocated in order to increase and promote economic development in the care of Welsh speakers.'

'Credwn fod angen ehangu cynllun Arfor i'r tymor canol, dim llai na 5 mlynedd, a neilltuo cyllid digonol er mwyn cynyddu a hyrwyddo datblygiad economaidd yng ngofal siaradwyr Cymraeg.'

Source: Dyfodol i'r laith

Several proposals were presented by various respondents which could be incorporated or prioritised as part of implementing Arfor 2:

• 'Focus on creating Welsh-speaking spaces, with the aim of "creating the best circumstances for people to work, use and enjoy the Welsh language."

'Ffocysu ar greu gofodau Cymraeg, gyda'r nod o "greu yr amgylchiadau gorau i bobl weithio, defnyddio a mwynhau'r Gymraeg."

Source: Cyngor Gwynedd

¹⁷ 'Y prif broblem sy'n wynebu Ceredigion yn gyffredinol o safbwynt y Gymraeg yw allfudo. Mae data am hyn wedi bod ar gael am amser hir ond mae'r cyfrifiad diweddaraf yn dangos y ffenomenon yn glir. Mae ffactorau economaidd fel diffyg swyddi da ac anfforddiadwyedd tai yn gwthio pobl ifanc Cymraeg eu hiaith allan o'r ardal.'



1

 'Encourage more companies within the areas to operate in Welsh and/or provide a service in Welsh.'

'Annog mwy o gwmnïau o fewn yr ardaloedd i weithredu yn Gymraeg a/neu darparu gwasanaeth yn y Gymraeg.'

Source: Aberystwyth University

• 'Seek to attract more companies where Welsh language skills are required to locate themselves within these areas.'

'Ceisio denu mwy o gwmnïau ble mae gofyn am sgiliau yn y Gymraeg i leoli eu hunain o fewn yr ardaloedd hyn.'

Source: Aberystwyth University

Other respondents presented similar ideas.

While ARFOR offers a model at a broad regional level across several local authorities, reference was also made to the idea of city-regions as a model that could be adopted to support regeneration and economic development on a more local scale. It was proposed that civic/urban centres could be a focus for schemes and that looking at lessons arising from developments in Carmarthenshire's towns could be useful.

'Plans such as Carmarthenshire's 10 Town Plan is a possible model to be considered and emulated in other areas. Its aim is to counterbalance the emphasis on civic development brought about by the Swansea Bay City Region plan. As far as we know, Carmarthenshire is the only county to date that has set out to create such a plan, and we welcome their vision, but consider that there is scope and opportunity to offer further benefit to the areas around the towns rather than focusing on the towns themselves. We believe that any similar scheme should be under the control and responsibility of a local authority rather than central Government. Collecting data will be important when assessing specific plans as well as developing relevant interventions; and setting criteria that could be helpful in assessing proposed plans, looking at what its potential impact (positive and negative) will be on the language in that specific area.'

'Mae cynlluniau fel Cynllun 10 Tref Sir Gaerfyrddin yn fodel posibl i'w ystyried a'i efelychu mewn ardaloedd eraill. Ei nod yw gwrthbwyso'r pwyslais ar ddatblygu dinesig a ddaw yn sgil cynllun Dinas-ranbarth Bae Abertawe. Hyd y gwyddom Sir Gâr yw'r unig sir sydd wedi mynd ati i greu cynllun o'r fath hyd yma, ac rydyn ni'n croesawu eu gweledigaeth, ond yn gweld bod lle a chyfle i gynnig mwy o fudd i'r ardaloedd o amgylch yn y trefi yn hytrach na chanolbwyntio ar y trefi eu hunain. Credwn y dylai unrhyw gynllun tebyg fod dan reolaeth a chyfrifoldeb Awdurdod Lleol yn hytrach na Llywodraeth ganol. Bydd hi'n bwysig casglu data wrth asesu cynlluniau penodol a datblygu ymyriadau perthnasol; a gosod criteria a allai fod o gymorth wrth asesu cynlluniau arfaethedig, gyda golwg ar beth fydd ei ardrawiad potensial (positif a negyddol) ar yr iaith yn yr ardal benodol.'

Source: Cymdeithas yr laith



5.2 Welsh as an essential skill in public institutions

Several respondents referred to the crucial role of the world of work and jobs with regards to the position of the language within Welsh-speaking communities. A number of organisations proposed establishing the principle that the whole public sector workforce in Gwynedd, Anglesey, Ceredigion and Carmarthenshire should have bilingual skills. It was proposed that such a policy would raise the status, use and awareness of the Welsh language in those areas and beyond.

Proposal 12: Welsh language skills are required for local authority positions and public bodies that serve Welsh-speaking communities

'The following [guidance] should be given to local authorities and public bodies that serve Welsh-speaking communities [to make] the Welsh language an essential qualification for all jobs.'

'Dylid rhoi'r [canllaw] canlynol i awdurdodau lleol a chyrff cyhoeddus sy'n gwasanaethu cymunedau Cymraeg [i wneud] y Gymraeg yn gymhwyster hanfodol ar gyfer pob swydd.' Source: Cylch yr laith

'The four counties, relevant health boards, police, Colleges and Universities (in terms of organisation and administration), and relevant national institutions, e.g. the National Library, all need to act on the principle that they operate in the Welsh language and that all members of staff are expected to be able to function in a fully bilingual working environment. As a starting point, district offices, leisure centres, registry offices, libraries and public sector theatres within and on the outskirts of Welsh-speaking communities should ensure a fully bilingual workforce to be able to provide all public services in Welsh to the taxpayers.'

'Mae angen i'r pedair sir, y byrddau iechyd perthnasol, yr heddlu, y Colegau a'r Prifysgolion (o ran trefniant a gweinyddiaeth), sefydliadau cenedlaethol perthnasol, e.e. y Llyfrgell Genedlaethol, oll weithredu ar yr egwyddor eu bod yn gweithredu yn y Gymraeg a bod disgwyl i bob aelod o staff fedru gweithredu yn llawn mewn awyrgylch gwaith dwyieithog. Fel man cychwyn, dylai swyddfeydd ardal, canolfannau hamdden, swyddfeydd cofrestru, llyfrgelloedd a theatrau sector cyhoeddus o fewn ac ar gyrion cymunedau Cymraeg sicrhau gweithlu cyfan gwbl ddwyieithog i allu cyflenwi gwasanaethau cyhoeddus cyflawn Gymraeg i'r trethdalwyr.'

Source: Dyfodol i'r laith

Following on from the above points, there were some references to the economic benefit that would arise from relocating public offices and jobs (especially those operating in Welsh) to Welsh-speaking communities.

Proposal 13: Relocation of public jobs to Welsh-speaking communities

'The Welsh Government can support the economy [of Welsh-speaking communities] by relocating some of their offices to Gwynedd and Anglesey, to begin to make up for the opportunity lost at the outset of devolution.'



'Gall Llywodraeth Cymru gefnogi economi [cymunedau Cymraeg] drwy adleoli rhai o'u swyddfeydd i Wynedd a Môn, i ddechrau gwneud iawn am y cyfle a gollwyd ar ddechrau datganoli.'

Source: Sail

5.3 Labour market strategy

Others argued that a more strategic and purposeful approach was needed to support employment opportunities and access to jobs, calling for a labour market strategy for Welshspeaking communities.

Proposal 14: Producing a labour market strategy for Welsh-speaking communities

'Creating a labour market strategy for Welsh-speaking communities to ensure better opportunities for young people to transition from education to jobs locally.'

'Creu strategaeth marchnad lafur ar gyfer cymunedau Cymraeg er mwyn sicrhau bod gwell cyfleoedd i bobl ifanc drosglwyddo o'r byd addysg i swyddi'n lleol.'

Source: Hawl i Fyw Adra

'Create a National Welsh-speaking Labour Market plan so that specific courses or language courses can be planned in order to fill positions [where] the Welsh language will be required.'

'Creu cynllun Farchnad Lafur Cyfrwng Cymraeg Cenedlaethol fel fod modd cynllunio cyrsiau penodol neu cyrsiau iaith er mwyn llenwi swyddi [lle] fydd gofyn am y Gymraeg.'

Source: Mentrau laith Cymru

Several respondents proposed linking such a labour market strategy to possible developments in the field of vocational education.

5.4 Reforming procurement arrangements

Several respondents noted that there are opportunities to support jobs and economic development within Welsh-speaking communities by reforming procurement processes. It was proposed that procurement arrangements should be revised to take advantage of, and promote, the ability of local companies to apply for contracts across different sectors.

Proposal 15: Favour local suppliers in procurement

'Ensuring that local authority tenders and procurement arrangements set out expectations in relation to the Welsh language.'

'Sicrhau fod tendrau a threfniadau caffael awdurdodau lleol yn nodi disgwyliadau mewn perthynas â'r iaith Gymraeg.'

Source: Grŵp Cynefin

'The entire procurement process and service level agreements in bodies that supply Welshspeaking communities need to be reconsidered. Since the same conditions no longer need to be followed since leaving the European Union, the weighting and value of applications



from local bilingual individuals and companies to carry out work on behalf of the public sector and Central Government need to be increased. Similarly, where it becomes clear that there is no company or capacity in Wales then this needs to be highlighted, and a plan put in place to close the gap in future by creating such a company. Different reports mention various figures but it is likely that over 50% of all public spending in Wales through procurement goes to companies in England. This pattern must be halted urgently in order to strengthen the Welsh economy and keep money locally.'

'Mae angen ystyried o'r newydd holl broses caffael a chytundebau lefel gwasanaeth mewn cyrff sy'n cyflenwi cymunedau Cymraeg. Gan nad oes angen dilyn yr un amodau bellach ers gadael yr Undeb Ewropeaidd, mae angen codi pwysoliad a gwerth ceisiadau gan unigolion a chwmnïau dwyieithog lleol i gyflawni gwaith ar ran y sector cyhoeddus a Llywodraeth Ganol. Yn yr un modd, lle daw'n amlwg nad oes cwmni neu gapasiti yng Nghymru yna mae angen amlygu hynny a chynllunio i gau'r diffyg yn y dyfodol trwy greu cwmni o'r fath. Mae adroddiadau gwahanol yn sôn am ffigyrau amrywiol ond mae'n debygol bod dros 50% o holl wariant cyhoeddus Cymru trwy gaffael yn mynd i gwmnïau yn Lloegr. Rhaid atal y patrwm hwn ar frys er mwyn hybu economi Gymreig a chadw'r bunt yn lleol.' Source: Dyfodol i'r laith

'We believe that social enterprises offer a revolutionary way of promoting social value, and that all public bodies should seek to significantly increase how many of their procurement contracts are won by social enterprises. In some cases, social enterprises are prepared to undertake these contracts, and social value must be embedded in procurement practices to ensure that their added value is considered. However, in other markets, we need to expand the supply of social enterprises in order to deliver products and services. ... Ensuring that specialist business support, education and funding continues to be available to social enterprises is essential.'

'Rydym yn credu bod mentrau cymdeithasol yn cynnig ffordd chwyldroadol o hyrwyddo gwerth cymdeithasol, ac y dylai'r holl gyrff cyhoeddus geisio cynyddu'n sylweddol faint o'u contractau caffael sy'n cael eu hennill gan fentrau cymdeithasol. Mewn rhai achosion, mae mentrau cymdeithasol yn barod i ymgymryd â'r contractau hyn, a rhaid i werth cymdeithasol gael ei wreiddio mewn arferion caffael i sicrhau bod eu gwerth ychwanegol yn cael eu hystyried. Fodd bynnag, mewn marchnadoedd eraill, mae angen i ni ehangu'r cyflenwad o fentrau cymdeithasol er mwyn darparu cynnyrch a gwasanaethau. ... Mae sicrhau y bydd cymorth busnes arbenigol, addysg a chyllid yn parhau i fod ar gael i fentrau cymdeithasol yn hanfodol.'

Source: Online form

5.5 Targeting support towards Welsh-medium organisations and businesses

Several respondents identified the need to build on strengths, prioritising financial support towards private sector companies and community organisations that work through the medium of Welsh. Some respondents identified the need to support more Welsh speakers to become business leaders, especially businesses that are influential within their communities and regions. It was suggested that successful businesses in Welsh strongholds are often led by non-Welsh speakers, especially within the tourism sector. Menter Môn concluded in its response that financial support needs to be targeted towards businesses that already operate in the Welsh language.



Proposal 16: Targeting support and business grants towards Welsh-medium businesses that are already operating to help them grow

'There is an argument for supporting organisations, bodies and businesses that already give appropriate status to the language, and helping them to develop more widely This means that Welsh is the main internal language, the language of staff meetings, the main language of activities and the first language of any marketing campaign (etc). This normalises the language, and gives it a consistent status. This can mean financial support, but also recognition in awarding contracts, outsourcing services and releasing assets for development (e.g. land, construction).

Assuming that the Welsh language benefits from having businesses owned by Welsh speakers... we need to identify a way to target these businesses / people with financial support. ...

Language conditions have been imposed on grants for 20 years and more, but this has not strengthened the Welsh language. These conditions are not effective. Conditions need to be re-examined and reintroduced, and/or freedom given to those administering/leading the grants to include linguistic conditions.'

'Mae dadl dros gefnogi mudiadau, cyrff a busnesau sydd yn rhoi statws teilwng i'r iaith yn barod, a'u helpu nhw i ddatblygu yn ehangach Mae hyn yn golygu fod y Gymraeg yn briod iaith fewnol, yn iaith cyfarfodydd staff, yn brif iaith gweithgareddau ac iaith gyntaf unrhyw ymgyrch farchnata (ayb). Mae hyn yn normaleiddio iaith, ac yn rhoi statws cyson iddi. Gall hyn olygu cefnogaeth ariannol, ond hefyd cydnabyddiaeth wrth gwobrwyo cytundebau, allanoli gwasanaethau a rhyddhau asedau i ddatblygu (e.e. tir, adeiladu).

O gymryd fod budd i'r Gymraeg o gael busnesau ym mherchnogaeth Cymry Cymraeg... mae angen adnabod ffordd o dargedu y busnesau / y bobl yma gyda cymorth ariannol. ...

Mae amodau ieithyddol wedi'i gosod ar grantiau ers 20 mlynedd a mwy, ond nid yw hyn wedi cryfhau y Gymraeg. Dydy'r amodau yma ddim yn effeithiol. Mae angen ail-edrych ac ail-gyflwyno amodau, a/neu rhoi rhyddid i'r sawl sy'n gweinyddu/arwain y grantiau i ychwanegu amodau ieithyddol.'

Source: Menter Môn

'More private companies need to be encouraged to adopt language policies, to take steps to improve Welsh language services for the public, and to protect the language rights of their employees. Influencing the private sector is difficult, and there is currently no clarity where the power of influence or support lies. We believe that the Government should look at the support being offered as a result of bringing the [Local] Helo Blod / Welsh in Business scheme to a close..... Apart from the translation support available, we believe that a grant fund should be established, which would be available to businesses towards the costs of signs or bulky translation work such as websites.'

'Mae angen annog mwy o gwmnïau preifat i fabwysiadu polisïau iaith, i gymryd camau i wella gwasanaethau cyfrwng Cymraeg i'r cyhoedd, ac i warchod hawliau ieithyddol eu gweithwyr. Mae dylanwadu ar y sector breifat yn anodd, a dim eglurder ar hyn o bryd lle mae grym dylanwad na chefnogaeth i'w gael. Credwn y dylai'r Llywodraeth edrych ar y gefnogaeth sydd yn cael ei gynnig yn sgil dod a chynllun Helo Blod [Lleol]/Cymraeg Byd Busnes i ben Ar wahân i'r gefnogaeth cyfieithu sydd ar gael, credwn y dylid sefydlu cronfa grant, fyddai ar gael i fusnesau tuag at gostau arwyddion neu waith cyfieithu swmpus megis gwefannau.'

Source: Cyngor Gwynedd



The Welsh Language Commissioner's response referred to current work by the Welsh Government to develop an Innovation Strategy for Wales. This is linked to other points regarding economic development and regeneration. The Commissioner emphasised the need to 'consider the relevance of the Innovation Strategy to innovation in Welsh-speaking communities.'18

Some respondents referred to the growth deals in their submissions. Aberystwyth Town Council recommended making the Welsh language central to the Mid Wales Growth Deal while Aberystwyth University highlighted the need to integrate the Welsh language into regional development plans, especially the growth deals. The response noted that there is:

'a danger that the North Wales Growth Deal – with its focus on centralising growth in the cities of North-West England – devalues the economic development needs of the more western areas of the region, with negative implications for the Welsh language. The same comment could be made regarding the Swansea City-Region and South West Wales. Are the priorities of the more urban and civic areas of this region the most important? To what extent are the development needs of more Welsh-speaking areas – in terms of their percentages of speakers – of the region being undervalued.' (Aberystwyth University)¹⁹

5.6 Tourism

Several responses referred to the harmful effects of 'over-tourism' and unsustainable tourism on the position of the Welsh language as a community language. It was highlighted that over-tourism contributes towards demographic change as a result of an influx of non-Welsh speakers.

Reference was made to the Gwynedd and Eryri Sustainable Visitor Economy Plan, which is a joint development between Cyngor Gwynedd and the Eryri National Park Authority to ensure that decisions and developments in the field of tourism support and do not undermine the sustainability of the Welsh language and the prosperity of Welsh-speaking communities.

Proposal 17: Supporting community ownership of tourism initiatives in Welsh-speaking communities

'Our vision for the future is: "A visitor economy for the benefit and wellbeing of the people, environment, language and culture of Gwynedd and Eryri". Both bodies [Cyngor Gwynedd and Eryri National Park Authority] have reviewed international and local good practice and also considered the United Nations World Tourism Organisation's definition of sustainable tourism in order to create principles for the Cyngor Gwynedd and Eryri National Park area to follow in future.

¹⁹ 'perygl bod bargen dwf Gogledd Cymru – gyda'i ffocws ar ganoli twf ar ddinasoedd Gogledd-Orllewin Lloegr – yn dibrisio anghenion datblygu economaidd ardaloedd mwy gorllewinol y rhanbarth, gyda goblygiadau negyddol ar gyfer y Gymraeg. Gellid gwneud yr un sylw ar gyfer dinas rhanbarthol Abertawe a De-Orllewin Cymru. Ai blaenoriaethau ardaloedd mwy trefol a dinesig y rhanbarth hwn sydd bwysicaf? I ba raddau mae anghenion datblygu ardaloedd mwy Cymreig – o ran eu canrannau o siaradwyr – y rhanbarth yn cael eu tanbrisio.'



32

¹⁸ 'ystyried perthnasedd y Strategaeth Arloesi i arloesi mewn cymunedau Cymraeg.'

Following a number of consultation sessions with Elected Members, communities, the visitor economy sector and other organisations, we have agreed on the following Sustainable Visitor Economy Principles:

- 1. Celebrate, Respect and Protect our Communities, Language, Culture and Heritage
- 2. Maintain and Respect our Environment
- 3. Ensure that the advantages for Gwynedd and Eryri communities outweigh any disadvantages

This Plan is pioneering for the area and responds directly to the views of our communities and the desire of our businesses to operate in a different way in future. Our intention is that this new collaboration between Cyngor Gwynedd, Eryri National Park and community, business and public partners will lead to a sustainable visitor economy in the area which gives priority to the well-being and prosperity of our communities, our environment, our language and our culture.'

'Ein gweledigaeth i'r dyfodol yw: "Economi ymweld er budd a lles pobl, amgylchedd, iaith a diwylliant Gwynedd ac Eryri". Mae'r ddau gorff [Cyngor Gwynedd ac Awdurdod Parc Cenedlaethol Eryri] wedi adolygu arfer-dda rhyngwladol a lleol gan hefyd ystyried diffiniad Sefydliad Twristiaeth y Byd y Cenhedloedd Unedig o dwristiaeth gynaliadwy er mwyn creu egwyddorion ar gyfer ardal Cyngor Gwynedd a Pharc Cenedlaethol Eryri i'w dilyn yn y dyfodol.

Yn dilyn nifer o sesiynau ymgynghori gydag Aelodau Etholedig, cymunedau, y sector economi ymweld â sefydliadau eraill rydym wedi cytuno ar yr Egwyddorion Economi Ymweld Cynaliadwy canlynol:

- 1. Dathlu, Parchu a Gwarchod ein Cymunedau, Iaith, Diwylliant a Threftadaeth
- 2.Cynnal a Pharchu ein Hamgylchedd
- 3. Sicrhau bod cymunedau Gwynedd ac Eryri'n cael mwy o fantais nac anfantais

Mae'r Cynllun hwn yn torri tir newydd i'r ardal ac yn ymateb yn uniongyrchol i farn ein cymunedau a dyhead ein busnesau i weithredu mewn ffordd wahanol i'r dyfodol. Ein bwriad yw y bydd y cydweithio newydd yma rhwng Cyngor Gwynedd, Parc Cenedlaethol Eryri a phartneriaid cymunedol, busnes a chyhoeddus yn arwain at economi ymweld cynaliadwy yn yr ardal sy'n rhoi blaenoriaeth i les a ffyniant ein cymunedau, ein hamgylchedd, ein hiaith a'n diwylliant.'

Source: Eryri National Park Authority

'Cyngor Gwynedd have a number of local plans that seek to tackle the specific challenges faced by residents of the county, and that affect Welsh-speaking communities. These include... A Sustainable Tourism Plan, which will try to ensure better ownership by local communities over the industry in future.'

'Mae nifer o gynlluniau lleol gan Gyngor Gwynedd sydd yn ceisio mynd i'r afael â'r heriau penodol mae trigolion y sir yn eu hwynebu, ac sydd yn effeithio ar gymunedau Cymraeg eu hiaith. Mae'r rhain yn cynnwys... Cynllun Twristiaeth Gynaliadwy, fydd yn ceisio sicrhau gwell perchnogaeth gan gymunedau lleol dros y diwydiant yn y dyfodol.'

Source: Cyngor Gwynedd

This was supported by other respondents who also referred to the importance of sustainable tourism and the steps that should be taken to tackle the negative effects of overtourism.



Proposal 18: Supporting sustainable tourism

laith Cyf referred to principles that should be upheld to ensure that the visitor economy is economically, socially, environmentally and culturally sustainable.

'The three principles underlining this are:

- Making the best use of environmental resources;
- Respecting the socio-cultural qualities of the host communities;
- Securing long-term viable economic enterprises that provide socio-economic benefits for all.

Among others, the community tourism initiatives developed in the Bro Ffestiniog area maintain and multiply the income from tourism within Welsh-speaking communities. Community ownership of tourism initiatives needs to be grown in Welsh-speaking communities throughout Wales.'

'Y tair egwyddor sy'n tanlinellu hyn yw:

- Gwneud y defnydd gorau o adnoddau amgylcheddol;
- Parchu rhinweddau cymdeithasol-diwylliannol y cymunedau croesawu
- Sicrhau mentrau economaidd sy'n hyfyw yn y tymor hir sy'n darparu buddion economaidd-cymdeithasol i bawb.

Ymhlith eraill, mae'r mentrau twristiaeth cymunedol a ddatblygwyd yn ardal Bro Ffestiniog yn cadw a lluosogi'r incwm o dwristiaeth o fewn cymunedau Cymraeg. Mae angen tyfu'r berchnogaeth gymunedol ar fentrau twristiaeth mewn cymunedau Cymraeg ar hyd Cymru.' Source: laith Cyf

'In order to counteract the harmful effects of overtourism, the following steps should be taken:

- a. Allow local authorities to limit the numbers and percentages of second homes and short-term holiday accommodation.
- b. Ensure that tourist sector businesses provide a service in Welsh and English by employing bilingual staff and using bilingual websites/leaflets/signs.
- c. Ensure that the marketing materials of businesses in the sector highlight and emphasise the distinctive culture of Wales.
- d. Instruct local authorities to promote developments such as hotels, bed and breakfast accommodation and farm accommodation, rather than caravan sites and holiday cabins.
- e. Encourage the use of local products and products from Wales in tourist organisations, and local labour and contractors when necessary.
- f. Ensure that any subsidy applications from tourist enterprises and organisations are assessed in terms of their potential impact on the Welsh language locally; their use of the Welsh language; their contribution to the image of Wales; and their economic benefit to the local community.
- g. Ensure that planning applications from tourist enterprises and organisations are assessed in terms of their potential impact on the Welsh language locally; their use of the Welsh



language; their contribution to the image of Wales; and their economic benefit to the local community.

- h. Ensure that tourism promotion bodies give prominence to the Welsh language and culture in all their activity,
- i. Encourage higher education and further education institutions to develop specific tourism courses in order to expand the pool of qualified, knowledgeable local workers available to work in, develop and manage the sector, ensuring that visitors receive appropriate information about language, culture, local history and national history.'
- 'Er mwyn gwrthweithio effeithiau niweidiol yr ordwristiaeth, dylid
- a. Caniatáu i awdurdodau lleol gyfyngu ar niferoedd a chanrannau ail gartrefi a lletyau gwyliau tymor byr.
- b. Sicrhau bod busnesau'r sector twristaidd yn darparu gwasanaeth yn Gymraeg ac yn Saesneg drwy gyflogi staff dwyieithog a defnyddio gwefannau/taflenni/arwyddion dwyieithog.
- c. Sicrhau bod deunyddiau marchnata busnesau'r sector yn amlygu ac yn pwysleisio diwylliant neilltuol Cymru.
- ch. Cyfarwyddo awdurdodau lleol i hyrwyddo datblygiadau megis gwestai, lletyau gwely a brecwast a lletyau fferm, yn hytrach na meysydd carafanau a chabanau gwyliau.
- d. Annog defnyddio cynnyrch lleol a chynnyrch Cymru mewn sefydliadau twristaidd, a llafur a chontractwyr lleol pan fo angen.
- dd. Sicrhau bod unrhyw geisiadau gan fentrau a sefydliadau twristaidd am gymhorthdal yn cael eu hasesu o ran eu heffaith ddichonol ar y Gymraeg yn lleol; eu defnydd o'r Gymraeg; eu cyfraniad i ddelwedd Cymru; a'u budd economaidd i'r gymuned leol.
- e. Sicrhau bod ceisiadau cynllunio gan fentrau a sefydliadau twristaidd yn cael eu hasesu o ran eu heffaith ddichonol ar y Gymraeg yn lleol; eu defnydd o'r Gymraeg; eu cyfraniad i ddelwedd Cymru; a'u budd economaidd i'r gymuned leol.
- f. Sicrhau bod cyrff hyrwyddo twristiaeth yn rhoi amlygrwydd i'r iaith a'r diwylliant Cymraeg yn eu holl weithgarwch,
- ff. Annog sefydliadau addysg uwch ac addysg bellach i ddatblygu cyrsiau twristiaeth penodol, er mwyn ehangu'r gronfa o weithwyr lleol cymwys, gwybodus sydd ar gael i weithio yn y fasnach, ei datblygu a'i rheoli, gan sicrhau bod ymwelwyr yn derbyn gwybodaeth briodol am iaith, diwylliant, hanes lleol a hanes cenedlaethol.'

Source: Cylch yr laith

5.7 Infrastructure in Welsh-speaking communities

Respondents referred to several challenges associated with infrastructure in Welsh-speaking communities. The most common concerns raised across the responses are noted below. The importance of securing fast broadband connections was highlighted, a key factor in establishing and maintaining businesses in Welsh-speaking communities, and which also provide



opportunities to work and learn from home. Reference was also made to the importance of ensuring access to 'consistent and reliable public transport services' (Menter a Busnes).²⁰

'Infrastructure: in order to support an economy in a rural area there must be robust physical transport. Investment is needed in roads, railways and public transport to ensure good connectivity; this as well as investment in digital infrastructure to support initiatives and user access to services. This also includes ensuring that there is a fast broadband connection across the county to support businesses and people to be able to work from home effectively.'

'Seilwaith: er mwyn cefnogi economi mewn ardal weledig mae'n rhaid cael trafnidiaeth ffisegol gadarn. Mae'n rhaid buddsoddi mewn ffyrdd, rheilffyrdd a chludiant cyhoeddus er mwyn sicrhau cysylltiad da; hyn yn ogystal â buddsoddi mewn seilwaith digidol i gynorthwyo mentrau a mynediad defnyddwyr at wasanaethau. Mae hyn hefyd yn cynnwys sicrhau bod cysylltiad band-eang cyflym ar draws y Sir i gefnogi busnesau a phobl i allu gweithio o adref yn effeithiol.'

Source: Ceredigion County Council

'[It should] be ensured that there is a first-class broadband service in every community which will enable people of all ages to work and lead a full life and therefore stay in their local community.'

'[Dylid] sicrhau fod gwasanaeth band eang o'r radd flaenaf ym mhob cymuned a fydd yn galluogi pobl o bob oedran i weithio a byw bywyd llawn ac felly i aros yn eu cymuned lleol.'
Source: UCAC

5.8 The foundational economy

The foundational economy is the part of the economy that creates and distributes goods and services that we rely on every day, such as health and care, food, housing and energy. Some respondents raised points about how goods and services could be procured in a way that supports the foundational economy and supports Welsh-speaking communities. Some respondents recommended a change of attitude in terms of how the economy is considered and supported, and a greater focus on ensuring support for the foundational economy.

Proposal 19: Measures to support the foundational economy

'We believe that there is more the Government can do to help regenerate and develop our rural and marginalised communities. Although good work is being done at a strategic level in "high value" sectors through the "Growth Deal" (and through that the work of Ambition North Wales), there is concern that this focus is too narrow spatially (the A55 and M4 corridors), and at the expense of the foundational economy (such as construction, care sector etc.) which is so essential in terms of maintaining jobs within our Welsh communities.

We need a wider and deeper intervention within rural communities throughout the country, with a clear rural economy strategy to deliver the wider vision. Schemes such as the Adra Decarbonisation Hub is a good example of an intervention which not only responds directly

²⁰ '[g]wasanaethau trafnidiaeth cyhoeddus cyson a dibynadwy.'



36

to a strategic need to meet Net Zero targets, but just as importantly indirectly addresses issues such as the foundational economy and language conservation.'

'Credwn fod mwy y gellir y Llywodraeth ei wneud i fod yn helpu i adfywio a datblygu ein cymunedau gwledig ag ymylol. Er fod gwaith da yn digwydd ar lefel strategol mewn sectorau "gwerth uchel" drwy law y "Growth Deal" (a drwy hynny waith Uchelgais Gogledd Cymru); pryderir fod y ffocws hyn yn rhy gyfyng yn ofodol (coridorau A55 a'r M4), ag ar draul yr economi sylfaenol (megis y sector adeiladu, gofal ayyb) sydd mor greiddiol o ran cynnal swyddi o fewn ein cymunedau Cymreig.

Mae angen ymyrraeth mwy eang a dyfnach o fewn y cymunedau gwledig ledled y wlad, gyda strategaeth economi wledig glir i gyflwyno'r weledigaeth ehangach. Mae cynlluniau megis Canolfan Dadgarboneiddio Adra yn enghraifft dda o ymyrraeth sydd nid yn unig yn ymateb yn uniongyrchol i angen strategol o gwrdd â thargedi Net Sero, ond yr un mor bwysig yn anuniongyrchol mae'n mynd i'r afael â materion megis economi sylfaenol a gwarchodaeth yr iaith.' Source: Adra

'More emphasis [is needed] on supporting the economy, creating jobs and creating community employment opportunities in Welsh-speaking communities.

With rural communities under threat, emigration of young Welsh speakers can be predicted from these areas to urban and civic work centres. Securing work locally is a key part of the solution with an emphasis on supporting small and micro-businesses, community enterprises, the foundational economy and the circular economy. In recent years, the Welsh Government has begun to place more emphasis on the development and prosperity of the foundational economy in Wales. With the support of the Foundational Economy fund, DOLAN – a collaboration between Cwmni Bro Ffestiniog, Siop Griffiths and Partneriaeth Ogwen – was formalised in 2020 resulting in a constructive, creative and active relationship between three social enterprises in the quarrying areas. Our economic projects also seek to strengthen the local economy, not through inward investment from transnational companies but through strengthening and fostering local small businesses.

The experience of Partneriaeth Ogwen in operating Cadwyn Ogwen is an example of how social enterprises can support private sector activity (micro and small) and our conviction regarding the Welsh language has also meant that we promote the use of the language by private businesses who would have been nervous about doing so without our support.'

'[Mae angen] mwy o bwyslais ar gefnogi'r economi, creu swyddi a creu cyfleoedd cyflogaeth cymunedol mewn cymunedau Cymraeg.

Gyda chymunedau gwledig dan fygythiad, gellir rhagweld allfudiad o siaradwyr Cymraeg ifanc o'r broydd hyn i ganolfannau gwaith trefol a dinesig. Mae sicrhau gwaith yn lleol yn rhan allweddol o'r ateb gyda phwyslais ar gefnogi busnesau bach a micro, mentrau cymunedol, yr economi sylfaenol a'r economi gylchol. Dros y blynyddoedd diweddar, mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi dechrau rhoi mwy o bwyslais ar ddatblygiad a ffyniant yr economi sylfaenol yng Nghymru. Gyda chefnogaeth y gronfa Economi Sylfaenol, ffurfiolwyd cydweithredu DOLAN – sef cydweithredu rhwng Cwmni Bro Ffestiniog, Siop Griffiths a Partneriaeth Ogwen yn 2020 gan esgor ar berthynas adeiladol, creadigol a gweithredol rhwng tair menter gymdeithasol yn y broydd chwarelyddol. Mae'n prosiectau economaidd hefyd yn edrych ar gryfhau'r economi leol, nid trwy fewnfuddsoddiad gan gwmnïau trawswladol ond trwy atgyfnerthu a meithrin busnesau bach lleol.

Mae profiad Partneriaeth Ogwen o weithredu Cadwyn Ogwen yn enghraifft o sut all mentrau cymdeithasol gefnogi gweithgarwch sector preifat (micro a bach) a mae'n argyhoeddiad ieithyddol hefyd wedi golygu ein bod yn hyrwyddo defnydd o'r Gymraeg gan fusnesau preifat fyddai wedi bod yn nerfus o wneud hynny heb ein cymorth.'

Source: Partneriaeth Ogwen



6. Community development policy

One recurring point in responses was the emphasis on supporting community development, and the need to promote bottom-up activity, rather than from the top down. Overall, the respondents saw community development as a way to strengthen the Welsh language and they were eager to promote, strengthen and extend the sector. Many argued that 'communitisation' would be able to strengthen Welsh-speaking communities and was in fact a method of promoting language planning on a micro level.

In this context, supporting a point raised in chapter 2 of this report, it was highlighted that the unique needs of individual areas need to be addressed, recognising that there is no single solution that would work for all with regards to promoting community development. Secondly, it was noted that the good work already being done within a number of community groups and organisations needs to be strengthened. Providing additional resources could help these groups further develop their initiatives and increase their ability to make a difference in their communities in sustainable ways. Related to this, respondents suggested the need for long-term funding and grants for community groups to ensure their sustainability. Finally, respondents referred to the lack of social opportunities for young people in a number of rural areas, and the need to address this. The remainder of this section sets out the main proposals in terms of:

- Offering services and support to community groups and enterprises;
- Opportunities for socialising;
- Community assets.

6.1 Services and support for community groups and initiatives

A number of respondents shared their suggestions on community development and the general feeling among these was that focus is needed on supporting and strengthening the work already underway by community groups and organisations, providing them with additional resources to develop their initiatives and increase their capacity. There were examples of organisations already involved with such work, such as Mentrau laith, community enterprises, voluntary organisations, town and community councils and departments within local authorities. There was a strong feeling that there was a need to support and strengthen this work and 'support community enterprises that promote the use of the language in a natural way' (individual response).²¹ It was recognised that grants and financial support were available, and that these help, but having more long-term funding would be better, as many of the grants available are often short-term.

Respondents also argued that 'integrated and holistic'²² models of community development in parts of Gwynedd (especially in the slate communities), and in Anglesey and Pembrokeshire and other places, have been successful, and that the Welsh Government needs to 'devise and support a programme to disseminate the model' across Wales (Cwmni Bro Ffestiniog).²³

In terms of practical steps, it was explained that providing support to groups and organisations to enable them to operate on the ground in Welsh or bilingually would also contribute to promoting the status of the language at a community level. This could be achieved by setting examples such as using bilingual signs, offering simultaneous translation at community meetings and using Welsh in social media and event posters.

²³ '[d]yfeisio a chefnogi rhaglen i ledaenu'r model.'



²¹ '[c]efnogi mentrau cymunedol sy'n hyrwyddo defnydd o'r iaith mewn ffordd naturiol.'

²² 'integredig a chyfannol'

There were also quite a few references in responses to the need to protect the right of town and community councils – as the most local level of democracy – to operate through the medium of Welsh. In that regard, it should also be noted that a number of responses were received expressing the need to support community media in the Welsh language, by continuing to support papurau bro, for example, or by establishing a fund to promote books of a local nature.

Proposal 20: More support for community groups

Support for local initiatives and long-term funding

'To continue to develop such work, it is not only necessary to increase capacity/resources/funding – but also to improve and facilitate the current system of securing this funding. From our experience, the current grant system does not allow for long-term planning – an important issue from the point of view of the Welsh language. Mentrau laith are obliged to apply for a core budget annually, which a) hinders long-term language planning, b) reduces the chance of receiving additional (match) funding through other sources, and c) causes concern among staff regarding the extent of their contracts, which ultimately makes it harder to attract high quality and committed staff.'

'I barhau a datblygu gwaith o'r fath, nid cynyddu capasiti/adnoddau/nawdd yn unig sydd angen ei wneud – ond yn ogystal, gwella a hwyluso'r drefn bresennol o sicrhau y nawdd hwn. O'n profiad ni, nid yw'r system grantiau bresennol yn caniatáu ar gyfer cynllunio hirdymor – rhywbeth sy'n bwysig o safbwynt yr iaith. Mae rheidrwydd i Fentrau laith ymgeisio am gyllideb craidd yn flynyddol, sy'n a) rhwystro cynllunio ieithyddol hirdymor, b) lleihau y siawns o dderbyn nawdd ychwanegol (match) drwy ffynonellau eraill, a c) achosi pryder ymysg staff ynglŷn â hyd a lled eu cytundebau, sydd yn y pendraw yn ychwanegu at y rwystr o ddenu staff safonol, ymrwymedig.'

Source: Menter Môn

'Strengthen coordination and collaboration across provisions that already exist, such as the Urdd, Young Farmers, Cylch Meithrin, Grwpiau Gwawr, Merched y Wawr, Women's Institute, schools, further education and mentrau iaith. There is currently too much working and operating in silos. Improve core funding for these organisations, and for a period that extends beyond a year at a time.'

'Cryfhau cydlynu a chydweithio ar draws y darpariaethau sydd eisoes yn bodoli, megis Yr Urdd, Mudiad Ffermwyr Ifanc, Cylch Meithrin, Grwpiau Gwawr, Merched y Wawr, Sefydliad y Merched, ysgolion, addysg pellach a mentrau iaith. Mae gormod o weithio a gweithredu mewn seilos yn digwydd ar hyn o bryd. Gwella ariannu craidd ar gyfer y mudiadau hyn, ag am gyfnod sydd yn ymestyn bellach na blwyddyn ar y tro.' Source: Grŵp Cynefin

'There is little dedicated core funding that local authorities have to spend on the Welsh language. Although welcome in the absence of core funding, the current system of allocating grant funding does not always allow for investment in long-term plans to strengthen the language.'

'Prin yw'r cyllid craidd neilltuol sydd gan awdurdodau lleol i'w wario ar y Gymraeg. Er i'w groesawu yn absenoldeb cyllid craidd, nid yw'r gyfundrefn bresennol o ddyrannu arian grant bob amser yn caniatáu ar gyfer buddsoddi mewn cynlluniau hirdymor i gryfhau'r



iaith.'

Source: Anglesey County Council

'The Welsh language needs to be linked more with social enterprises, and one way of ensuring this would be to enable the mentrau iaith to employ specific officers to develop such enterprises in their areas.'

'Mae angen i'r Gymraeg gael ei chysylltu'n fwy â mentrau cymdeithasol, ac un ffordd o sicrhau hyn fyddai galluogi'r mentrau iaith i gyflogi swyddogion penodol ar gyfer datblygu mentrau o'r fath yn eu hardaloedd.'

Source: Mentrau laith Cymru

Offering translation support

'It is therefore absolutely essential that the Welsh Government and its partners continue to support associations and organisations that promote the use of the Welsh language at grassroots level. ...Support is needed to allow community groups and associations to facilitate the use of the Welsh language completely naturally in face-to-face and virtual community events to maintain the presence of the Welsh language in our communities. We need to collaborate with professional interpreters in order to offer an affordable bilingual service.'

'Mae'n gwbl hanfodol felly bod Llywodraeth Cymru a'i bartneriaid yn parhau i gefnogi mudiadau a sefydliadau sy'n hyrwyddo'r defnydd o'r Gymraeg ar lawr gwlad. ...Mae angen cymorth er mwyn caniatáu i grwpiau a chymdeithasau cymunedol hwyluso'r defnydd o'r Gymraeg yn gwbl naturiol mewn digwyddiadau cymunedol wyneb yn wyneb a rhithiol er mwyn cynnal presenoldeb y Gymraeg yn ein cymunedau. Mae angen cydweithio â chyfieithwyr ar y pryd proffesiynol er mwyn cynnig gwasanaeth dwyieithog fforddiadwy.'

Source: laith Cyf

'It is possible to ensure that the Welsh language is a clause in any community grants etc. and that any grant includes an element for the provision of translation into English.'

'Gellir sicrhau bod y Gymraeg yn gymal mewn unrhyw grantiau cymunedol ac ati a bod unrhyw grant yn cynnwys elfen ar gyfer darpariaeth cyfieithu i'r Saesneg.' Source: Individual respondent

'Efforts should be made to ensure that One Voice Wales is included in the Welsh Language Standards Remit, to help Town and Community Councils protect and/or use the Welsh language. In order to be inclusive, more and more Town and Community Councils within the County are having to switch language due to the cost involved in providing simultaneous translation and translating all documentation. Consideration should be given to offering free intensive Welsh courses to Councillors who do not speak Welsh, so that the language is not lost in our communities.'

'Dylid mynd ati i sicrhau bod Un Llais Cymru yn cael eu cynnwys yn y Cylch Gorchwyl Safonau'r Gymraeg, hyn er mwyn helpu Cynghorau Tref a Chymuned i warchod a/neu i wneud defnydd o'r Gymraeg. Er mwyn bod yn gynhwysol mae mwy a mwy o Gynghorau Tref a Chymuned o fewn y Sir, yn gorfod newid iaith oherwydd y gost sydd ynghlwm â



darparu cyfieithwyr ar y pryd, a chyfieithu'r holl ddogfennaeth. Dylid ystyried cynnig cyrsiau Cymraeg dwys rhad ac am ddim i Gynghorwyr nad ydynt yn medru'r Gymraeg, fel nad yw'r iaith yn cael ei cholli yn ein cymunedau.'

Source: Ceredigion County Council

6.2 Providing opportunities for socialising

Respondents referred to a lack of opportunities to use the Welsh language in the workplace and socially. The pandemic was considered to have contributed to this problem, as a result of a reduction in face-to-face contact at community level, reducing the opportunities to use and practice speaking the language for a large number of people. Respondents believed that more opportunities are needed to socialise in rural areas, and many believed this would help retain young people in those areas. It was explained that there is a strong tradition of organisations running social events and activities (young farmers clubs, community pubs, the Urdd etc.), but it was also noted that these groups need to be supported to do more in order to promote the use of Welsh in social contexts.

Some respondents referred to online communities. Although no specific proposals were made to support online communities, there was a call / request to ensure that there was support and a way to communicate easily online through the medium of Welsh whether for socialising or for work purposes.

Proposal 21: Creating opportunities for socialising

Promoting opportunities for socialising and festivals

- "...making sure they [young people] have access to a range of experiences and activities, culturally and socially, as is available in more urban and civic areas. In that respect, equipping community groups, and ensuring that organisations such as the Urdd and the Mentrau have sufficient resources to be able to offer broad opportunities is key. The lack of social opportunities for young people is a specific problem in many of the more rural communities of Gwynedd, for example, and that is because the resources of partners such as the Urdd and the menter iaith are scarce, and it is not possible for them to reach all places where support is needed, and also because the Council has faced huge budget cuts over the years."
- '...gwneud yn siŵr bod ganddynt [bobl ifanc] fynediad i amrediad o brofiadau a gweithgareddau, yn ddiwylliannol a chymdeithasol, fel sydd ar gael mewn ardaloedd mwy trefol a dinesig. Yn hynny o beth, mae arfogi grwpiau cymunedol, a sicrhau bod gan fudiadau fel yr Urdd a'r Mentrau yr adnoddau digonol i allu cynnig cyfleoedd eang yn allweddol. Mae prinder cyfleoedd cymdeithasol i bobl ifanc yn broblem benodol yn nifer o gymunedau mwy gwledig Gwynedd, er enghraifft, a hynny am fod adnoddau partneriaid fel yr Urdd a'r fenter iaith yn brin, a bod dim posib iddynt gyrraedd pob man lle mae angen cefnogaeth, ac hefyd am fod y Cyngor wedi wynebu toriadau cyllidebol anferthol dros y blynyddoedd.'

Source: Cyngor Gwynedd

'Create a system of funding and promoting festivals in Welsh-speaking areas, similar to Tafwyl but on a smaller scale, so that the Welsh buzz is clear to all generations and it is an effective method of bringing generations together.'



'Creu trefn o roi nawdd a hyrwyddo gwyliau mewn ardaloedd Cymreig, tebyg i Tafwyl ond ar raddfa lai, fel bod y bwrlwm Cymreig yn amlwg i bob cenhedlaeth ac mae'n ddull effeithiol o dynnu'r cenedlaethau at ei gilydd.'

Source: Bala Town Council

'Welsh communities are great at community development e.g. Young Farmers Clubs, Merched y Wawr, community enterprises; volunteers need more support to continue running these associations.'

'Mae cymunedau Cymreig yn wych am ddatblygu'n gymunedol ee CFFI, Merched y Wawr, mentrau cymunedol, mae angen fwy o gymorth ar wirfoddolwyr i barhau i gynnal y cymdeithasau hyn.'

Source: Individual respondent

'The challenge we face is how to revive and reinforce these activity associations. We suggest: i. Encouraging repeat participation, e.g. promoting an events map as used in Gwynedd. ii. Welsh for Adults to emphasise organising community events iii. Schools to become hubs for daily events and socialising for a flurry of Welsh-medium activity iv. Sports and popular culture programmes for young people through Youth Services, the Urdd, Young Farmers, sports and interest clubs, etc.'

'Yr her sy'n ein hwynebu yw sut mae adfywio ac atgyfnerthu'r cymdeithasau gweithgaredd hyn. Awgrymwn: i. Annog cymryd rhan eto, e.e. hyrwyddo map digwyddiadau fel a geir yng Ngwynedd. ii. Cymraeg i Oedolion i roi pwyslais newydd ar gynnal digwyddiadau cymunedol iii. Ysgolion i fod yn ganolfannau digwyddiadau a chymdeithasu beunyddiol i fwrlwm o weithgaredd Cymraeg iv. Rhaglenni chwaraeon a diwylliant poblogaidd i bobl ifanc trwy Wasanaethau Ieuenctid, yr Urdd, Ffermwyr Ifanc, clybiau chwaraeon a diddordeb. ayyb.'

Source: Dyfodol i'r laith

The role of sports clubs

A number of participants highlighted the role of sports clubs such as the local football or rugby club, saying that they need to be supported to offer their provision in Welsh, or assisted to provide more in Welsh.

'The Mentrau also need to work closely to support the sports clubs which are <u>currently</u> "monolingual spaces". "Breathing spaces" schemes being piloted with sports clubs in the Basque Country are an interesting model that should be considered for implementation in Wales. The benefits of this are twofold – the benefits for the individuals but also with regards to maintaining the linguistic definitiveness of the sports clubs.'

'Mae angen i'r Mentrau hefyd weithio'n agos i gefnogi'r clybiau chwaraeon sy'n "ofodau uniaith" <u>ar hyn o bryd</u>. Mae cynlluniau "breathing spaces" sy'n cael eu peilota gyda clybiau chwaraeon yng Ngwlad y Basg yn fodel diddorol y dylid ystyried ei weithredu yng Nghymru. Mae manteision deublyg i hyn – y buddion i'r unigolion ond hefyd i gynnal pendantrwydd ieithyddol y clybiau chwaraeon.'

Source: Partneriaeth Ogwen

Many of the respondents linked their suggestions about opportunities for socialising with recommendations for ensuring that there are opportunities for socialising in Welsh for new speakers who wanted to practice speaking Welsh. There were calls for more free Welsh



lessons. There were also calls for lessons or opportunities for those who wanted to improve their confidence and skills.

6.3 Community Assets

Community assets was a theme in many responses, i.e. the resources, facilities and infrastructure owned by local communities, and how more assets can be brought under the control and ownership of the community. This is clearly linked with economic development policies, and as Cymdeithas yr laith explained, there is a 'long tradition of Welsh communities buying, developing and managing local assets in order to provide essential services such as pubs, community shops and renewable energy projects', and a number of respondents were keen to build on this tradition.²⁴

Proposal 22: Community Assets

Support for the principle of communitisation of assets

'It is increasingly important for communities to be able to own assets to ensure the sustainability of these communities and their language.'

'Mae'n gynyddol bwysig i gymunedau allu perchnogi asedau er mwyn sicrhau cynaliadwyedd y cymunedau hyn a'u hiaith.'

Source: Mentrau laith Cymru

'The Committee's report on community assets contained 16 recommendations, all but one of which were accepted in full, or in principle, by the Welsh Government. The Welsh Government has accepted in principle a recommendation to establish a commission, as proposed by Cwmpas, to stimulate innovative ideas regarding the transfer of land and assets to the community. Impact on the Welsh language must be central to the work of this commission.'

'Roedd adroddiad y Pwyllgor ar asedau cymunedol yn cynnwys 16 o argymhellion, a chafodd pob un ohonynt heblaw un eu derbyn yn llawn, neu mewn egwyddor, gan Lywodraeth Cymru. Mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi derbyn mewn egwyddor argymhelliad i sefydlu comisiwn, fel y cynigiodd Cwmpas, i sbarduno syniadau arloesol ynghylch trosglwyddo tir ac asedau i'r gymuned. Mae rhaid bydd effaith ar y Gymraeg wrth wraidd gwaith y comisiwn hwn.'

Source: Online form

Funding for buying assets

'Communities need more support to manage property and develop community asset transfer projects. It is also very important to support projects that create a healthy, vibrant and sustainable community.'

'Angen mwy o gefnogaeth ar gymunedau i reoli eiddo a datblygu prosiectau trosglwyddo asedau cymunedol. Mae hefyd yn holl bwysig cefnogi prosiectau sy'n creu cymuned iach, bywiog a chynaliadwy.'

'Legislative changes are needed to empower communities and give them equal opportunities when competing against private investors to buy community assets of interest. The Welsh Government will also need to contribute significant financial intervention for community initiatives to succeed, through development grants or long-

²⁴ 'traddodiad hir o gymunedau Cymreig yn prynu, datblygu a rheoli asedau lleol er mwyn darparu gwasanaethau hanfodol megis tafarndai, siopau cymunedol a phrosiectau ynni adnewyddol.'



43

term loans for community groups.'

'Angen newidiadau deddfwriaethol, i rymuso cymunedau a rhoi cyfle cyfartal iddynt wrth gystadlu yn erbyn buddsoddwyr preifat i brynu asedau cymunedol o ddiddordeb. Bydd hefyd angen i Lywodraeth Cymru gyfrannu ymyrraeth ariannol sylweddol er mwyn i fentrau cymunedol lwyddo, drwy grantiau datblygu/ neu fenthyciadau hir dymor ar gyfer grwpiau cymunedol.'

Source: Eryri National Park

'However, investment is needed to enable community enterprises to exercise their rights to own houses, land and community assets. Local Authorities and the Welsh Government should offer financial support to Welsh-medium community enterprises in the form of grants, equity investment and low interest loans.'

'Er hynny, mae angen buddsoddiad er mwyn galluogi mentrau cymunedol i arfer eu hawliau i berchenogi tai, tir ac asedau cymunedol. Dylai Awdurdodau Lleol a Llywodraeth Cymru gynnig cymorth ariannol i fentrau cymunedol Cymraeg ar ffurf grantiau, buddsoddi ecwiti a benthyciadau â llog isel.'

Source: Cymdeithas yr laith Gymraeg

'From our experiences as a housing association with a successful track record, investment [is needed] in teams of community development officers to support committees of community volunteers, to hold their hand, giving them direction and support when needed.'

'O'n profiadau ni fel cymdeithas dai hefo trac-record llwyddiannus, mae [angen] buddsoddi mewn timau o swyddogion datblygu cymunedol i gefnogi pwyllgorau o wirfoddolwyr cymunedol, i afael yn eu llaw, rhoi cyfeiriad a chymorth iddynt pan mae angen.'

Source: Grŵp Cynefin

'Co-operatives and social enterprises play an important role in the cultural, community and economic life of Wales. Examples can be seen throughout Wales in various areas (arts centres, regeneration of local pubs, and village shops amongst others) of how these organisations offer valuable services to their community. Communities must be encouraged to see the development of these models of development and providing various activities as a valuable way of supporting the sustainability of our Welsh-speaking communities.'

'Mae cwmnïau cydweithredol a mentrau cymdeithasol yn chwarae rhan bwysig ym mywyd diwylliannol, cymunedol ac economaidd Cymru. Gwelir enghreifftiau ledled Cymru mewn amryw o feysydd (Canolfannau celfyddydol, adfywio tafarndai lleol, a siopau pentref ymysg eraill) o sut y mae'r sefydliadau hyn yn cynnig gwasanaethau gwerthfawr i'w cymuned. Rhaid annog cymunedau i weld datblygiad y modelau hyn o ddatblygu a darparu amryw o weithgareddau yn ffordd werthfawr o gefnogi cynaladwyedd ein cymunedau Cymraeg.'

Source: Mudiad Meithrin

'Identify opportunities to look at providing co-operative housing in empty properties.'

'Nodi cyfleoedd i edrych ar ddarparu tai cydweithredol mewn eiddo gwag.'

Source: Welsh Local Government Association



7. Town and country planning

This chapter presents proposals in relation to town and country planning area.

There were several various suggestions for reforming planning policy, including having to consider the impact of planning applications on the Welsh language and on the sustainability of communities and more scrutiny of Welsh language impact assessments conducted within planning applications; ensuring more research so that there is a better understanding of housing needs; providing guidance for planning authorities on how and when national policies could be deviated from national policies to meet specific local needs and relaxing some planning regulations to allow developments and homes where necessary.

7.1 Town and country planning background and context

<u>Planning Policy Wales</u> (PPW) is a non-statutory document outlining the Welsh Government's policies on land use planning, while the Planning Act provides a legal framework. It is supported by a series of Technical Advice Notes (TANs), including <u>TAN 20: planning and the Welsh language</u>. PPW provides the strategic policy framework for local planning authorities when preparing development plans, and sets out steps that planning authorities should follow in terms of considering the needs and interests of the Welsh language but are not statutory requirements. Local planning policies are set out in the Local Development Plans for each planning authority area.

<u>Future Wales: the national plan 2040</u> is the National Development framework, outlining the direction for development work in Wales until 2040. Future Wales is a spatial plan, which means that it sets a direction for investment in infrastructure and development work and sets an ambition that the Welsh language is considered within the spatial strategy of each development plan.

Further to this, several responses referred to the <u>Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015</u> and its aim for a 'Wales of vibrant culture and thriving Welsh language' and redefining sustainable development to include culture as a fourth strand, alongside the environment, society and economy. Reference was also made to the <u>Placemaking Wales Charter</u> and the 'considerations that contribute to establishing and maintaining good places' including promoting the principle of identity as a core consideration in planning.

Many of the responses – especially those received from planning authorities – referred to these documents but often expressed the view that they needed to go further and provide more clarity and guidance. This is expanded upon in the remainder of this section.

7.2 A call for clearer guidance and better data and evidence

Planning and the Welsh language have been the subject of previous research and papers. The Welsh Language Commissioner referred to their review of the planning policies of planning authorities in 2019, Planning and the Welsh language: a review of Welsh planning authorities' procedures. Three main conclusions were reached following the review, namely that there is 'a lack of consistency in the planning policies of the authorities in the context of the Welsh language'; that 'planning authorities call for clear, national guidelines on assessing impact on language and defining areas of linguistic sensitivity' and raising a question about linguistic expertise within the Planning Inspectorate. The first two points were clear themes in the



responses to this call for evidence. RTPI Wales also referred to previous research, specifically to the RTPI | Placemaking as if a thriving Welsh language mattered paper which provides an overview of promoting and supporting the use of the Welsh language in town and country planning, and examples of good practice in terms of bilingual planning, and the benefits of promoting the Welsh language in planning.

As well as asking for clearer guidance and more attention to the Welsh language in planning policy, there was a feeling among many of the respondents that there was a need to change attitude and seek ways to enhance rather than just protect the Welsh language. In this sense some respondents referred to learning lessons from promoting biodiversity, and RTPI Cymru said 'we recommend consideration of an emphasis on "enhancement" in addition to "mitigation". This has been addressed for biodiversity in Wales.' There was also a call for more use of language planning experts in the field of town and country planning, or for a body to advise planning authorities in this area.

Proposal 23: Definitive guidance on planning policy

Clearer guidance in TAN 20

'Although they were published after Cymraeg 2050, and although they encouraged support for the language, TAN 20 (2017) and Planning Policy Wales issue 10 (2018) only have a few specific details on how Placemaking could or should play a role in enabling the Welsh language to thrive as a social language.'

'Er iddynt gael eu cyhoeddi ar ôl Cymraeg 2050, ac er iddynt annog cefnogaeth ar gyfer yr iaith - dim ond ychydig o fanylion penodol sydd gan TAN 20 (2017) a Pholisi Cynllunio Cymru rhifyn 10 (2018) ar sut y gallai neu a ddylai Creu Lleoedd chwarae rhan mewn galluogi'r Gymraeg ffynnu fel iaith gymdeithasol.'

Source: RTPI Wales

'It would be very beneficial for the Commission to seek to collaborate with the Government's Planning Policy Department to strengthen Planning Policy Wales, TAN 20 and the Development Plans Manual providing clear guidance for all Welsh Planning Authorities. It will be an opportunity:

- 1. to have clearer guidance in national policy documents in terms of language sustainability and the relationship with the national targets of a million Welsh speakers by 2050.
- 2. to have clearer guidance on what is meant in terms of areas of linguistic sensitivity or significance.
- 3. to provide guidance to Local Planning Authorities to identify the possibility of strategic growth options that are guided by the well-being of the Welsh language.
- 4. to provide clearer guidance to local authorities on how to set an appropriate objective in terms of the Sustainability of the Welsh language by developing a consistent methodology to assess the likely impact of Strategies and Local Development Plans policies on the Welsh language.
- 5. to develop a consistent methodology to assess planning applications.'

'Byddai o fudd mawr petai'r Comisiwn yn edrych i gydweithio gydag Adran Cynllunio Polisi'r Llywodraeth i gryfhau Polisi Cynllunio Cymru, TAN 20 a Llawlyfr Cynlluniau Datblygu gan ddarparu arweiniad clir ar gyfer holl Awdurdodau Cynllunio Cymru. Bydd yn gyfle i:

- 1. gael arweiniad cliriach mewn dogfennau polisi cenedlaethol o ran cynaliadwyedd iaith a'r berthynas gyda'r targedau cenedlaethol o filiwn o siaradwyr Cymraeg 2050.
- 2. gael arweiniad cliriach ar beth olygir o ran ardaloedd o sensitifrwydd neu arwyddocâd ieithyddol.



- 3. i roi arweiniad i Awdurdodau Cynllunio Lleol i adnabod y posibilrwydd o opsiynau strategol twf ac sy'n cael eu harwain gan ffyniant y Gymraeg.
- 4. Roi arweiniad cliriach i awdurdodau lleol o sut i osod amcan priodol o ran Cynaliadwyedd y Gymraeg gan ddatblygu methodoleg gyson i asesu effaith debygol Strategaethau a pholisïau Cynlluniau Datblygu Lleol ar yr iaith Gymraeg
- 5. Ddatblygu methodoleg gyson i asesu ceisiadau Cynllunio.'

Source: Eryri National Park

'It will be important to make a strong link between language planning and land use planning leading to clearer guidance in Planning Policy Wales and TAN 20. It will be an opportunity for the Welsh Government to set an expectation in terms of the contribution of each local planning authority towards a million Welsh speakers.'

'Bydd yn bwysig gwneud cyswllt cryf rhwng cynllunio ieithyddol a chynllunio defnydd tir gan arwain at arweiniad cliriach ym Mholisi Cynllunio Cymru a TAN 20. Bydd yn gyfle i Lywodraeth Cymru osod disgwyliad o ran cyfraniad pob awdurdod cynllunio lleol tuag at y miliwn o siaradwyr Cymraeg.'

Source: Eryri National Park

'Further clarity would be welcomed, setting out the role of planning and planners in strengthening placemaking to support the Welsh language through development planning and development management. A specific example of this is the need for greater clarity and guidance on TAN 20 (section 2.7 Defined Areas) of what it means for Local Development Plans to identify an area of sensitivity and/or significance. This is something which the Commissioner could address, or through commissioning further research.'

Source: RTPI Wales

A formal consultation process and supporting the community's ability to contribute

'Planning authorities also need additional resources to ensure support for communities to formulate and work together to prepare habitat plans based on local needs. There is currently a lack of resources in this area.'

'Angen adnoddau ychwanegol ar awdurdodau cynllunio hefyd i sicrhau'r gefnogaeth i gymunedau i lunio i a chydweithio i baratoi cynlluniau cynefin sydd wedi ei selio ar anghenion lleol. Diffyg adnoddau ar hyn o bryd yn y maes yma.'

Source: Eryri National Park

A guide to signs and names:

'A number of planning authorities call for more powers in terms of Welsh signage policies from the community, however the TAN only allows Local Development Authorities to "promote the provision of bilingual signs"; this needs to be strengthened.'

'Nifer o'r awdurdodau cynllunio yn gofyn am fwy o gryfder o ran polisïau arwyddion Cymraeg gan y gymuned, fodd bynnag mae'r TAN ond yn caniatáu i Gynghorau Datblygu Lleol "hyrwyddo darparu arwyddion dwyieithog", mae angen cryfhau hyn.'

Source: Ceredigion County Council

'Stronger policies are needed to make it mandatory for signage to be either in Welsh or bilingual. This would be to prevent English only signs. Currently we can only encourage this as an authority, so we need to be able to demand/enforce bilingual signs at least.'

'Angen polisïau cryfach i'w gneud yn ofynnol i arwyddion fod yn unai Gymraeg neu ddwyieithog. Hyn i atal arwyddion uniaith Saesneg. Ar y funud dim ond annog hyn allwn ni wneud fel awdurdod, felly angen gallu mynnu/gorfodi arwyddion dwyieithog o leiaf.'

Source: Ervri National Park



As well as clearer guidance, many of the respondents wanted better data and evidence to inform planning decisions. At a national level there was a call for more discussion about how planning and developments can create space to support Welsh-speaking communities, and at a more local level the community should also be supported to ask and understand how planning affects it.

Proposal 24: Further research to obtain improved and consistent data and evidence at a national level

Collecting and sharing evidence and consistency of evidence

'The socio-linguistic analysis of the position of the language in communities across Wales will be very useful as an evidence base for Planning Authorities and it is welcomed that the commission will recommend policy interventions based on sound evidence. It will be a means of ensuring consistency in the evidence base and recommending policy interventions that are beneficial to the Welsh language across Welsh Planning Authorities.'

'Bydd y gwaith dadansoddiad sosio-ieithyddol o sefyllfa'r iaith mewn cymunedau ar draws Cymru yn ddefnyddiol iawn fel sail tystiolaeth i Awdurdodau Cynllunio a croesawir y bydd y comisiwn yn argymell ymyraethau polisi yn seiliedig ar dystiolaeth gadarn. Bydd yn fodd o sicrhau cysondeb mewn sail tystiolaeth ac argymell ymyraethau polisi er budd yr iaith Gymraeg ar draws Awdurdodau Cynllunio Cymru.'

Source: Eryri National Park

'Collecting reliable and quantitative data about community use of the language to allow us to act on a firm evidence base is a challenge. We would welcome a national effort to bring together the different data sources in order to assist decision makers to measure and assess the impact of their proposals on the Welsh language.'

'Mae cywain data meintiol a dibynadwy am ddefnydd cymunedol o'r iaith i'n caniatáu ni i weithredu ar sylfaen dystiolaeth gadarn yn her. Byddem yn croesawu ymdrech genedlaethol i ddwyn ynghyd y gwahanol ffynonellau data er mwyn cynorthwyo gwneuthurwyr penderfyniadau fesur ac asesu effaith eu cynigion ar y Gymraeg.'

Source: Anglesey County Council

'Interim information and data must be used, as well as data for recent years, to ensure that we can plan for the future viability of communities and the language. We support Professor Mark Tewdwr-Jones' call for the use of "live", up-to-date data in a meaningful way in the planning system... ensuring it is possible to respond quickly to changes in communities. We recognise that a lot of resources are needed to achieve this but we believe that the Welsh Government must invest in doing so in order to be ready to respond to changes on an ongoing basis.'

'Mae'n rhaid defnyddio gwybodaeth a data cyfamserol, yn ogystal â data am flynyddoedd diweddar, er mwyn sicrhau y gellir cynllunio er hyfywedd cymunedau a'r iaith i'r dyfodol. Ategwn alwad yr Athro Mark Tewdwr-Jones am ddefnyddio data "byw", cyfoes mewn ffordd ystyrlon yn y system gynllunio.... er mwyn sicrhau bod modd ymateb yn gyflym i newidiadau mewn cymunedau. Rydym yn cydnabod bod angen llawer o adnoddau i gyflawni hyn ond credwn bod rhaid i Lywodraeth Cymru fuddsoddi i wneud hynny er mwyn bod yn barod i ymateb i newidiadau yn barhaus.'

Source: Welsh Language Commissioner



8. Housing policy

There is overlap between the comments on town and country planning and on housing policy, but a number of respondents referred in their evidence to housing policy specifically. Comments were mostly general, expressing views on problems of affordability or the number of second homes but without offering firm proposals, although several points and some proposals were raised under the following headings:

- The need to consider housing when planning strategic interventions
- Ensuring more affordable housing for local people
- Actions to mitigate the impact of second homes.

8.1 Ensuring a strong voice for the housing sector when planning strategic interventions

A number of respondents noted that the housing sector needs to be considered alongside wider areas when discussing community regeneration and other development plans. It was noted that housing, and the availability of affordable housing, cuts across all policy areas relevant to the future of Welsh-speaking communities.

'Good work is already being done in North Wales on economic aspects (i.e. responding to an obvious failure in the market) through the Ambition North Wales strategic partnership; and the case needs to be continuously presented to the Housing Sector to obtain equal status in this strategic area; having a strong voice in planning any national and regional interventions, supporting "Housing-led Regeneration" as a real catalyst for economic development and wider socio-cultural consequential effects.'

'Mae gwaith da eisoes yn digwydd yng Ngogledd Cymru ar agweddau economaidd (h.y. ymateb i fethiant amlwg yn y farchnad) trwy bartneriaeth strategol Uchelgais Gogledd Cymru; ac mae angen parhau i gyflwyno'r achos i'r Sector Tai i gael statws cyfartal yn y maes strategol hwn; cael llais cryf mewn unrhyw gynllunio ymyriadau Cenedlaethol a rhanbarthol, gan gefnogi "Adfywio a Arweinir gan Dai" fel catalydd gwirioneddol ar gyfer datblygu economaidd a sgil-effeithiau cymdeithasol-ddiwylliannol ehangach.'

Source: Adra

'The social housing sector must be represented in all key strategic spaces that are seeking to reinvigorate rural Welsh-speaking communities. We understand that securing the sustainability of communities cannot be achieved through housing policy alone. However, good housing is a critical factor in helping communities to thrive.'

Source: Community Housing Wales

8.2 Ensuring more affordable housing for local people

Although some communities were more affected than others, most respondents had concerns about a lack of affordable housing in their communities. Comments from Ceredigion County Council were typical of many received, noting that 'the housing crisis needs to be resolved,



ensuring that strategies are in place to ensure young people can afford to buy or rent houses locally.'25

Some respondents working directly in housing referred to the challenges local people can face in trying to secure a mortgage. If a developer agrees to provide affordable homes as part of their planning application, it can be formalised as a section 106 agreement, an agreement aimed at mitigating the impact of new developments on communities. Some respondents referred to the fact that the requirements of section 106 agreements can lead to situations where individuals can face difficulties in obtaining a mortgage.

However, section 106 agreements, and the contributions they bring, can have a positive effect on communities. Anglesey County Council's response referred to a development's impact assessment on the Welsh language which led to securing a number of commitments to protect and strengthen the Welsh language through a Section 106 agreement, including a commitment from the developer that all correspondence and community meetings would be bilingual. Among other commitments, there were financial contributions to employ teachers to support the late immersion education provision.

Proposal 25: Research on how to address unintended consequences of the affordable housing / section 106 condition.

'We are familiar with and supportive of the "Local Market Housing Scheme" which is implemented in Gwynedd and Anglesey. However, there are some issues relating to the availability of mortgages which need to be addressed. We administer the Tai Teg Affordable Housing Register across north Wales and Powys and have experienced issues with individuals trying to access mortgages for affordable units that have an S106 restriction on the property. The number of lenders lending on affordable properties appears to be low, so there is limited choice for buyers when looking for a mortgage. In addition, mortgage companies who would lend do not take the risk of offering mortgages on several units on one development. Discussions with leading mortgage lenders would be useful, facilitated by the Welsh Government.'

'Rydym yn gyfarwydd ac yn gefnogol o'r "Cynllun Tai Marchnad Lleol" a weithredir yng Ngwynedd ac Ynys Môn. Fodd bynnag, mae rhai materion yn ymwneud ag argaeledd morgeisi, y mae angen mynd i'r afael â hwy. Rydym yn gweinyddu Cofrestr Tai Fforddiadwy Tai Teg ar draws gogledd Cymru a Phowys ac wedi profi problemau gydag unigolion yn ceisio cael mynediad at forgeisi ar gyfer unedau fforddiadwy sydd â chyfyngiad A106 ar yr eiddo. Ymddengys fod nifer y benthycwyr sy'n rhoi benthyg ar eiddo fforddiadwy yn isel, felly mae dewis cyfyngedig i brynwyr wrth chwilio am forgais. Yn ogystal, nid yw cwmnïau morgeisi a fyddai'n rhoi benthyg yn cymryd y risg o gynnig morgeisi ar sawl uned ar un datblygiad. Byddai trafodaethau gyda benthycwyr morgeisi blaenllaw yn ddefnyddiol, wedi'u hwyluso gan Lywodraeth Cymru.'

Source: Grŵp Cynefin

'Urgent research is needed to solve problems arising from the local / affordable condition of Section 106 and the unintended consequences that have made obtaining a mortgage difficult for some people.'

'Mae angen ymchwil brys i ddatrys problemau sy'n codi yn deillio o amod leol / fforddiadwy Adran 106 a'r canlyniadau anfwriadol sydd wedi gwneud codi morgais yn anodd i rai pobl.' **Source: Bala Town Council**

²⁵ 'angen datrys yr argyfwng tai, gan sicrhau bod strategaethau yn eu lle ar gyfer sicrhau bod pobl ifanc yn medru fforddio prynu neu rhentu tai yn lleol.'



'We consider that financial lenders use affordable local need houses as an excuse not to lend money and where the risk is not really higher than loans for open market houses. The Welsh Government needs to do further work to overcome the lending barriers on 106 agreements.'

'Rydym yn ystyried bod benthycwyr ariannol yn defnyddio tai angen lleol fforddiadwy fel esgus i beidio a benthyg arian a lle nad yw'r risg wir yn uwch na benthyciadau ar gyfer tai marchnad agored. [Mae] angen i Lywodraeth Cymru wneud gwaith pellach i ddod dros y rhwystrau benthyg ar gytundebau 106.'

Source: Eryri National Park

Better evidence on housing needs

Linked to the points made in the section on planning, some respondents called for more data and more up to date research on housing needs so that development plans and housing strategies of local authorities are informed by the most current evidence.

Proposal for better evidence (continued from proposal 25 above)

'Carrying out a periodical review of housing needs is a statutory duty for Local Authorities.... However, the LHMA [Local Housing Market Assessment] only gives broad, long-term estimates of what the local housing needs might be in future.

Instead of theoretical estimates of needs and demand, local authority Development Plans and Housing Strategies should be guided by evidence of local needs at individual community level. This evidence would be the basis for deciding on appropriate housing solutions for each community, identifying local opportunities to meet the need and then presenting the case for investing public funds. Carrying out a regular assessment of the needs of each community would provide a "real" evidence base for preparing Development Plans and Local Housing Strategies which would, in turn, ensure that local needs guide land use policies, affordable housing targets and priorities for investing in new homes.'

'Mae cynnal adolygiad cyfnodol o anghenion tai yn ddyletswydd statudol ar Awdurdodau Lleol.... Fodd bynnag, dim ond amcangyfrifon eang, hirdymor y mae AMTLI [Asesiad Marchnad Tai Lleol] yn eu rhoi o'r hyn y gallai'r angen lleol am dai fod yn y dyfodol.

Yn lle amcangyfrifon damcaniaethol o angen a galw, dylai Cynlluniau Datblygu a Strategaethau Tai awdurdodau lleol gael eu llywio gan dystiolaeth o anghenion lleol ar lefel cymunedau unigol. Byddai'r dystiolaeth hyn yn sail ar gyfer penderfynu ar ddatrysiadau tai priodol ar gyfer pob cymuned, adnabod cyfleoedd lleol i ddiwallu'r angen ac yna cyflwyno'r achos dros fuddsoddi arian cyhoeddus. Byddai cynnal asesiad rheolaidd o anghenion bob cymuned yn darparu sylfaen dystiolaeth "go iawn" ar gyfer paratoi Cynlluniau Datblygu a Strategaethau Tai Lleol a fyddai, yn eu tro, yn sicrhau bod anghenion lleol yn llywio polisïau defnydd tir, targedau tai fforddiadwy a blaenoriaethau ar gyfer buddsoddi mewn cartrefi newydd.'

Source: Individual respondent



Resources for buying existing buildings

Another idea proposed was to help communities (and local enterprises or housing associations) buy assets. Elaborating on the point made above on the communitisation of assets, it was explained that more resources need to be provided for the purchase of existing buildings, especially properties with conservation value, and empty homes, ensuring that they are available as affordable housing for local people. Financial support should be provided to community enterprises to purchase existing property.

Continuation of Proposal 23 above: Financial support for community enterprises

'Local Authorities and the Welsh Government should offer financial support to Welsh-medium community enterprises in the form of grants, equity investment and low interest loans. In particular, the Welsh Government should establish a fund similar to the Scottish Land Fund, which finances the purchase of land and buildings that would contribute to the overall sustainability of a community or enable the preservation or provision of key local services. These public and private funds will be essential if community enterprises are to realise the opportunities created by introducing policies similar to the Community Right to Buy.'

'Dylai Awdurdodau Lleol a Llywodraeth Cymru gynnig cymorth ariannol i fentrau cymunedol Cymraeg ar ffurf grantiau, buddsoddi ecwiti a benthyciadau llog-isel. Yn benodol, dylai Llywodraeth Cymru sefydlu gronfa debyg i Gronfa Dir Yr Alban, sydd yn ariannu prynu tir ac adeiladau a fyddai'n cyfrannu at gynaliadwyedd cyffredinol cymuned neu alluogi cadw neu ddarparu gwasanaethau lleol allweddol. Bydd y cronfeydd cyhoeddus a phreifat hyn yn hanfodol os yw mentrau cymunedol i wireddu'r cyfleoedd a fydd yn cael eu creu drwy gyflwyno polisïau tebyg i'r Hawl Gymunedol i Brynu.'

Source: Individual respondent

'Creating a local vehicle, some sort of joint venture to buy vacant houses / shops, bring them up to standard and rent them out to generate income. Use this income to buy further empty properties and turn them into homes, to offer as an option for keeping people in their communities or attracting people and their families back to the communities where they were brought up.'

'Creu cerbyd lleol, rhyw fath o fenter ar y cyd i brynu tai / siopau gwag, dod â nhw i safon a'u rhentu i greu incwm. Defnyddio'r incwm yma i brynu eiddo gwag pellach a'u troi yn gartrefi, er mwyn cynnig fel opsiwn ar gyfer cadw pobl yn eu cymunedau neu ddenu pobl a'u teuluoedd yn ôl i'r cymunedau ble maent wedi eu dwyn i fyny.'

Source: Grŵp Cynefin

Amending the Renting Homes Act

Several respondents highlighted the fact that the rental sector also needs attention, and that it should be ensured that renting is affordable.



Proposal 26: Increasing the number of rental houses and ensuring affordability and security of tenure for tenants

The Renting Homes (Wales) Act 2016 came into force on 1st December 2022 creating a completely new system for residential tenancies with most existing tenancies and licenses being converted into occupation contracts. There are two types of occupation contract: 'Secure Contract' and 'Standard Contract.'

'Private landlords are usually expected to enter into standard contracts, but may choose to enter into a secure contract. The landlord can terminate a standard contract with cause, or without cause, after a certain period of notice. The Renting Homes (Wales) Act 2016 should be amended to give tenants of private landlords the right to secure contracts. Improving security of tenure would make the private rental sector in our Welsh-speaking communities a much more stable and attractive option for local residents who do not have the means to consider buying a house.'

'Disgwylir y bydd landlordiaid preifat fel arfer yn ymrwymo i gontractau safonol, ond gallant ddewis ymrwymo i gontract diogel. Gall y landlord derfynu contract safonol gydag achos, neu heb achos, ar ôl cyfnod penodol o rybudd. Dylid diwygio Deddf Rhentu Cartrefi (Cymru) 2016 i roi'r hawl i denantiaid landlordiaid preifat dderbyn contractau diogel. Byddai gwella sicrwydd deiliadaeth yn gwneud y sector rhentu preifat yn ein cymunedau Cymraeg yn opsiwn llawer mwy sefydlog a deniadol i drigolion lleol nad oes ganddynt y modd i ystyried prynu tŷ.'

Source: Individual respondent

Letting houses

Some respondents called for local people to be given priority in housing letting policies. Adra said that that it is,

'crucial that flexibility in Housing Letting Policy arrangements are used in Welsh-speaking communities to ensure that priority is given to local people. A further role is seen for National and Local Government to promote this further over the next few years.' (Adra)²⁶

Grŵp Cynefin explained in its response that it had carried out a consultation with communities in order to understand their views on the housing situation, and that social rental housing was one of the topics raised. It explained that:

'communities are aware that there are homelessness problems and the need for housing in the county (especially under the current cost of living situation etc) but feel that having a Local Letting Policy on housing would also protect the fabric of communities and protect those in need of a home in their community.' (Grŵp Cynefin)²⁷

²⁷ 'cymunedau yn ymwybodol bod problemau digartrefedd a'r angen ar gyfer tai yn y Sir (yn enwedig o dan yr amgylchiadau presennol costau byw a.y.y.b) ond yn teimlo byddai cael Polisi Gosod Lleol ar dai hefyd yn gwarchod gwead cymunedau ac yn amddiffyn y rheini mewn angen am gartref yn eu cymuned.'



26

²⁶ 'hollbwysig fod hyblygrwydd mewn trefniadau Polisi Gosod Tai yn cael eu defnyddio mewn cymunedau Cymraeg er mwyn sicrhau fod blaenoriaeth yn cael ei roi i bobl leol. Gwelir rôl bellach i Lywodraeth Genedlaethol a Lleol i fod yn hyrwyddo hyn ymhellach dros y blynyddoedd nesaf.'

Financial support for small, affordable developments

A number of housing associations and planning authorities explained that small developments (say 6 houses or less) are almost impossible to build in a viable way, and as social housing provider Adra explains, 'estates of around 15-20 houses have to be built in order to justify the developments on a financial basis. As a result, it is almost impossible to develop housing on a smaller scale in Welsh communities that really need new stock to help maintain the fabric of the community.'28

Proposal 27: Offering higher grants to address the unviability of smaller developments

'It is essential that the number of affordable houses developed matches local need and also reflects the size of the rural village. In rural areas this means developing sites of around 3 to 5 affordable units. It is probably more expensive to develop smaller sites as there is no gas supply, more travel for workers etc. There should be additional financial remuneration in rural areas / on smaller sites to take account of issues such as infrastructure, site conditions etc. As a result, rural villages in Eryri lose out in terms of affordable housing provision due to viability issues, with Housing Associations being risk averse and very reluctant to develop smaller developments in rural areas. Very often, we see that a Housing Association wants to build 6-10 units in a rural area so that the development is viable which is more likely to receive local opposition. It is essential that any housing grants overcome difficulties of development and viability of small sites in rural areas.'

'Mae'n hanfodol bod y nifer o dai fforddiadwy a ddatblygir yn cyd-fynd gyda'r angen yn lleol a hefyd yn adlewyrchu maint y pentref gwledig. Mewn ardaloedd gwledig mae hyn yn golygu datblygu safleoedd o tua 3 i 5 uned fforddiadwy. Mae'n debyg ei bod yn ddrytach datblygu safleoedd llai gan nad oes cyflenwad nwy, mwy o waith teithio i'r gweithwyr ayyb. Dylai bod cydnabyddiaeth ariannol ychwanegol mewn ardaloedd gwledig / ar safleoedd llai i gymryd i vstyriaeth materion megis isadeiledd, amodau'r safle ayyb. O ganlyniad mae pentrefi gwledig yn Eryri yn colli allan o ran darpariaeth tai fforddiadwy oherwydd problemau hyfywedd gyda Chymdeithasau Tai yn gyndyn iawn o ddatblygu ac yn wrth risg i ddatblygu datblygiadau llai mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Yn aml iawn gwelir bod Cymdeithas Dai eisiau codi 6-10 uned mewn ardal wledig er mwyn i'r datblygiad fod hyfyw sydd fwy tebygol o dderbyn gwrthwynebiad lleol. Mae'n hanfodol bod unrhyw grantiau tai yn goresgyn anawsterau datblygu a hyfywedd safleoedd bach mewn ardaloedd gwledig.'

Source: Eryri National Park

In addition to the comments already mentioned, respondents suggested that the planning system needed to be re-examined, especially in terms of allowing houses to be built on farm property. However, it was recognised that different areas face different challenges, and that targeted methods are needed, as Carmarthenshire's response explained, 'addressing empty houses within areas, this is more of a challenge in Carmarthenshire (currently) than second homes.'29

²⁹ 'mynd i'r afael â thai gwag o fewn ardaloedd, hyn yn fwy o her yn Sir Gâr (ar hyn o bryd) nag ail gartrefi.'



²⁸ 'mae rhaid adeiladu stadau o oddeutu 15-20 o dai er mwyn gallu cyfiawnhau y datblygiadau ar sail ariannol. O ganlyniad, mae hi bron yn amhosib i fod yn datblygu tai ar raddfa llai mewn cymunedau Cymreig sydd wir angen stoc newydd er mwyn helpu gynnal gwead y gymuned.'

8.3 Second homes

A number of respondents referred to the effects of second homes and short-term holiday accommodation on Welsh-speaking communities, and expressed concerns that the challenges Welsh-speaking communities face will increase as the number of second homes increases and as people continue to be pushed out of their communities by high house prices.

There was recognition that there are no easy solutions, and although some steps have already been taken to address these issues, as explained by RTPI Cymru, 'this is a complex issue and as such, multifaceted solutions will be needed, often beyond planning policy such as taxation and licensing.'³⁰

Some responses referred to taking advantage of the opportunity to raise higher taxes, or a premium on second homes, and went on to propose what to do with the funding raised. Other comments included a desire for Wales to adopt a housing policy similar to other countries, with a high proportion of houses to buy or rent designated for the local market or permanent residents, but respondents did not propose concrete steps as to how to achieve this. There were also comments about the importance of protecting Welsh names and calls for action to protect names as part of town and country planning.

Proposal 28: Encouraging use of the second home premium and reviewing how the money is spent

'a percentage of the income from policies such as the second home tax should be set aside for the intensification of efforts to strengthen Welsh-speaking communities. For example: promoting the benefits of Welsh language education and ensuring that language transfer takes place throughout the education journey and that there are valuable opportunities for our young people to use Welsh beyond school walls.'

Source: Clybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs

'Tackling the current crisis - raising a premium for second homes and a tourism tax and using that income to fund community owned housing projects within communities.'

'Taclo'r argyfwng presennol - codi premiwm ail-gartrefi a treth twristiaeth a defnyddio'r incwm hwnnw i ariannu prosiectau tai dan berchnogaeth cymunedol mewn cymunedau.'

Source: Menter Gwynedd

'It is generally considered that the tax-related powers given to local authorities in terms of increasing the levels of council tax levied on second homes is a positive measure. A number of our members noted that the additional charge at its lower levels will not reduce the number of second homes (it was felt that owners could deal with a small increase) in general but that it provides an additional revenue stream to be invested in housing within a local area. Linked to this, we believe it is key and essential, regardless of the additional charge levied on second homes, for local authorities to ensure that the revenue obtained is reinvested in housing-related activities, particularly in developing affordable homes. However, we recognise that this commitment may be difficult going forward due to inflationary pressures on Local Authority budgets.'

'Ystyrir yn gyffredinol bod y pwerau trethu a roddwyd i awdurdodau lleol o ran codi lefelau treth y cyngor a godir ar ail gartrefi yn fesur cadarnhaol. Nododd nifer o'n haelodau na fydd y tâl ychwanegol ar ei lefelau is yn gostwng y nifer o ail gartrefi (teimlwyd bod perchnogion yn gallu cymathu cynnydd bach) yn gyffredinol ond ei fod yn darparu ffrwd refeniw ychwanegol

³⁰ 'mae hwn yn fater cymhleth ac o'r herwydd, bydd angen atebion amlweddog, yn aml y tu hwnt i bolisi cynllunio megis trethiant a thrwyddedu.'



i'w buddsoddi mewn tai o fewn ardal leol. Yn gysylltiedig â hyn, credwn ei bod yn allweddol ac yn hanfodol, waeth beth fo'r tâl ychwanegol a godir ar ail gartrefi, i awdurdodau lleol sicrhau bod y refeniw a geir yn cael ei ail-fuddsoddi mewn gweithgareddau gysylltiedig â thai, yn enwedig datblygu cartrefi fforddiadwy. Er hynny, rydym yn cydnabod y gallai'r ymrwymiad hwn fod yn anodd wrth symud ymlaen oherwydd pwysau chwyddiant ar gyllidebau Awdurdodau Lleol.'

Source: CIH

'The house and my connection with the area are extremely important to me in order to keep my Welsh language alive and to maintain a connection with the language and culture of Wales. I am willing to pay additional tax to the council as it is a "second home", and I would be pleased to see the money go towards helping young people in the area have affordable housing.'

'Mae'r tŷ a'm cysylltiad gyda'r ardal yn hynod o bwysig imi er mwyn cadw fy iaith Gymraeg yn fyw ac er mwyn cadw cysylltiad efo iaith a diwylliant Cymru. Yr wyf yn fodlon i dalu treth ychwanegol i'r cyngor oherwydd ei safle fel "ail dŷ", a buaswn yn falch o gael gweld yr arian yn mynd tuag at helpu pobl ifanc yr ardal i gael tai fforddiadwy.'

Source: Individual respondent

'Local Authorities should ensure that any premium collected from holiday home owners is spent in those areas where the number of holiday homes is clearly a problem, e.g. that the premium collected in Dwyfor is spent in Dwyfor'

'Dylsai Awdurdodau Leol gofalu fod unrhyw dreth Premiwm a gesglir gan berchnogion tai haf yn cael ei wario yn yr ardaloedd hynny lle mae'r niferoedd o dai haf yn amlwg yn broblem, e.e bod y dreth Premiwm a gesglir yn Nwyfor yn cael ei wario yn Nwyfor'

Source: Individual respondent



9. Equality and Diversity

Several respondents emphasised the welcoming nature of Welsh communities, but that policies always need to be mainstreamed in favour of equality. In this context there were references to equality with regards to race, with some respondents mentioning the Anti Racist Wales Action Plan, and others referring to the importance of LGBT+ rights. The right to acquire the language was also mentioned, whether through the education system or for individuals moving to Welsh-speaking areas as adults. It was also noted that gender could be a consideration in terms of patterns of language transmission within families.

Proposal 29: Promoting equality

Integration of newcomers

'Strategies to assimilate new arrivals, in a county where in-migration is high; for example the Croeso Ceredigion Project. Ceredigion County Council and Menter laith Cered are collaborating on a comprehensive project to raise awareness among people moving to Ceredigion for the first time about the Welsh language and various aspects of living through the medium of Welsh. The aim of the project is to maintain the viability of communities by highlighting the opportunities available to contribute and support locally, and help people understand how the Welsh language is woven into the cultural and social life of the county. The project will be inclusive, bringing together Welsh speakers, shy speakers, non-Welsh speaking learners and those who are completely new to the Welsh language. The project will aim to ensure ownership by the 21 communities, equipping the communities themselves to tackle the challenges associated with in-migration.'

'Strategaethau i gymhathu newydd ddyfodiaid, mewn Sir ble mae mewnlifiad yn uchel; er enghraifft Prosiect Croeso Ceredigion. Mae Cyngor Sir Ceredigion a Menter Iaith Cered yn cyd-weithio ar brosiect cynhwysfawr er mwyn codi ymwybyddiaeth ymysg pobl sy'n symud i Geredigion am y tro cyntaf am yr iaith Gymraeg ac am y gwahanol agweddau o fyw bywyd trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Bwriad y prosiect yw cynnal hyfywedd cymunedau trwy amlygu'r cyfleoedd sydd ar gael i gyfrannu a chefnogi'n lleol, ac i helpu personau i ddeall sut mae'r Gymraeg yn gweu i fewn i fywyd diwylliannol a chymdeithasol y Sir. Bydd y prosiect yn gynhwysol, gan ddwyn ynghyd siaradwyr Cymraeg, siaradwyr swil, dysgwyr y di-Gymraeg a'r rhain sy'n gwbl newydd i'r Gymraeg. Bydd y prosiect yn anelu at sicrhau perchnogaeth gan y 21 gymuned, gan arfogi'r gymuned ei hunain i fynd i'r afael â'r heriau sy'n gysylltiedig â mewnfudwyr.'

Source: Ceredigion County Council

Activities to show that Welsh is a language for everyone

'One way of strengthening Welsh-speaking communities is emphasising that Welsh is a language for everyone. Organisations such as Mas ar y Maes (which is an important part of the National Eisteddfod) have recently proposed the idea of establishing a Local Eisteddfod for LGBTQ+ people to promote the Welsh language within the community. Ensuring support for such organisations to implement their ideas is crucial....One way to strengthen Welsh-speaking communities is by emphasising that Welsh is a language for everyone.'

'Un ffordd o gryfhau cymunedau Cymraeg yw trwy bwysleisio bod y Gymraeg yn iaith i bawb. Mae mudiadau fel Mas ar y Maes (sydd yn rhan bwysig o'r Eisteddfod Genedlaethol) yn



ddiweddar wedi cynnig y syniad o sefydlu Eisteddfod Leol ar gyfer pobl LHDTC+ er mwyn hybu'r iaith Gymraeg o fewn y gymuned. Mae sicrhau fod y gefnogaeth i fudiadau fel hyn weithredu ar y syniadau yn hollbwysigUn ffordd o gryfhau cymunedau Cymraeg yw trwy bwysleisio bod y Gymraeg yn iaith i bawb.'

Source: Menter a Busnes

Implementing strategic objectives

'Local Councils throughout Wales have also begun to engage with anti-racism principles, as set out in the recently published Anti Racist Wales Action Plan. This action plan highlights the Welsh language as a specific policy area, and local authorities will consider this as they proceed with the plan in their local contexts and in line with the development of their Strategic Equality Plans 2024. The Welsh Government may want to consider using the next 12 months, when the majority of councils will begin to draw these equality plans together, to convey how best practice regarding equality and the Welsh language is reflected within these plans.'

'Mae Cynghorau lleol ledled Cymru hefyd wedi dechrau ymgysylltu ag egwyddorion gwrthhiliaeth, fel y nodir yng Nghynllun Gweithredu Cymru Wrth-hiliol a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar. Mae'r cynllun gweithredu hwn yn tynnu sylw at y Gymraeg fel maes polisi penodol, a bydd awdurdodau lleol yn ystyried hyn wrth iddynt fwrw ymlaen â'r cynllun yn eu cyd-destunau lleol ac yn cyd-fynd â datblygu eu Cynlluniau Cydraddoldeb Strategol 2024. Efallai y bydd Llywodraeth Cymru am ystyried defnyddio'r 12 mis nesaf, lle bydd mwyafrif y cynghorau yn dechrau tynnu'r cynlluniau cydraddoldeb hyn at ei gilydd, er mwyn cyfleu sut yr adlewyrchir yr arferion gorau ynghylch cydraddoldeb a'r Gymraeg o fewn y cynlluniau hyn.' Source: Welsh Local Government Association

'We will actively look for opportunities to mainstream the objectives of the Anti Racist Wales Action Plan and the LGBTQ+ Action Plan for Wales in particular, together with any other steps we can take and working in partnership, in implementing Arfor 2 to ensure that Arfor communities are inclusive and give everyone – regardless of their background – the opportunity to fulfil their aspirations while living, working and enjoying in communities where Welsh is a living language.'

'Byddwn yn mynd ati i edrych am gyfleoedd i brif ffrydio amcanion Cynllun Gweithredu Cymru Wrth-hiliol a Chynllun Gweithredu LHDT+ Cymru yn benodol, ynghyd ag unrhyw gamau eraill y gallwn eu cymryd, gan weithio mewn partneriaeth, wrth roi Gwedd Arfor 2 ar waith i sicrhau bod cymunedau Arfor yn gynhwysol ac yn rhoi cyfle i bawb – waeth beth fo'u cefndir – i gyflawni eu dyheadau tra'n byw, gweithio a mwynhau mewn cymunedau lle mae'r Gymraeg yn iaith fyw.'

Source: ARFOR

Ensuring access to education and Welsh lessons

'Representing minority groups is extremely important at all levels of society, and Welsh-speaking communities should be supported to nurture leaders who reflect the diversity of their community. This can be done by offering mentoring programmes and free language lessons. The work should be embedded within the Welsh Government's anti-racism framework ensuring that Black, Asian and ethnic minority families can easily access Welsh-medium care and education (without barriers of any kind).'

Source: Clybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs

'The language acquisition programmes for asylum seekers also need to be reviewed, ensuring that EAL (English as an Additional Language) and CIY (Welsh as an Additional Language) are offered in Wales from the beginning.'



'Y mae angen hefyd adolygu'r rhaglenni caffael iaith i geiswyr lloches hefyd gan sicrhau bod EAL (English as an additional language) a CIY (Cymraeg fel laith Ychwanegol) yn cael eu cynnig yng Nghymru o'r cychwyn.'

Source: RhAG

Gender and language transmission within the family

'It must also be considered that there is research suggesting that the mother's language is the best predictor of a child's linguistic development. ... Specific interventions need to be considered to work with fathers who can speak Welsh in mixed-language families. Paying more attention to the impact and significance of gender through all actions would be beneficial.'

'Rhaid hefyd ystyried bod yna waith ymchwil sydd yn awgrymu mai iaith y fam yw'r rhagfynegydd orau o ddatblygiad ieithyddol y plentyn. ... Mae angen ystyried ymyraethau pwrpasol i weithio gyda thadau sy'n medru'r Gymraeg mewn teuluoedd cymysg eu hiaith. Byddai talu mwy o sylw i effaith ac arwyddocâd rhywedd trwy'r camau gweithredu i gyd yn fuddiol.'

Source: Mudiad Meithrin

