

One Wales: One Planet

The Sustainable Development Annual Report
2010-11

Laid before the National Assembly for Wales
September 2011

Contents

Minister's Foreword	3
Commentary	4
Sustainable Development – the central organising principle	7
Sustainable Resource Use	11
Sustaining the Environment	18
A Sustainable Economy	22
A Sustainable Society	29
The Wellbeing of Wales	36
Annex A: Accounting for Sustainability Report	42

This is the Welsh Government's Sustainable Development Annual Report, made under section 79(6)(a) of the Government of Wales Act 2006

Minister's Foreword

I am very pleased to be able to present my first Sustainable Development Annual Report since becoming Minister for Environment and Sustainable Development, although it is our third Annual Report since we launched our Sustainable Development Scheme One Wales: One Planet.



This Annual Report covers the period April 2010-March 2011, and sets out how the proposals we set out in the Sustainable Development Scheme have been implemented.

It provides a body of evidence to demonstrate how we have used sustainable development as our central organising principle to ensure all our decisions promote the economic, social and environmental wellbeing of people and communities in Wales, now and in the future. It shows how this approach is making a real and long lasting difference to people's quality of life. We also report on how we have taken forward the 18 specific actions contained in our Sustainable Development Scheme.

We are extremely conscious of the ambition of the sustainable development agenda that we set out in One Wales; One Planet, and that we need to do more to reflect the scale and pace of change that is needed to make Wales a sustainable nation.

It is extremely timely therefore that this Annual Report is being published whilst we are undertaking our statutory review of the effectiveness of our Sustainable Development Scheme. We will use this review to help us identify the blockages to scaling up action on sustainable development in Wales, and to identify the areas where we can help with the solutions to these blockages. We will be talking to all our stakeholders up and down Wales who I know have a real passion and commitment to making their communities more sustainable.

We have already announced our proposals to legislate to strengthen our approach to sustainable development in Wales. We hope that this will set us on the path to becoming a leading sustainable development nation.

I hope this Annual Report encourages everyone to maintain their commitments to sustainable development, and to continue to work with us so we can scale up action for sustainable development on the ground for the benefit of all.

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "John Griffiths". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

John Griffiths, AM
Minister for Environment and Sustainable Development

Commentary by Commissioner for Sustainable Futures and Cynnal Cymru

This is the first independent commentary made under the new arrangements for sustainable development delivery and advice since the UK Government decision to withdraw funding from the Sustainable Development Commission in March 2011. The decision to maintain this capacity for independent advice and scrutiny through the Commissioner for Sustainable Futures and Cynnal Cymru is itself demonstration of the Welsh Government's commitment to making sustainable development the central organising principle of Government.

Since *One Wales:One Planet* was launched in May 2009, there is no doubt that progress has been made in addressing how sustainable development, as a central organising principle, is understood and applied in policy development and implementation. However, as in previous years, the report fails to provide an overall sense of how the individual strategies, policies and initiatives combine to contribute towards measurable progress against the Sustainable Development Indicators.

There is a continued need to ensure that sustainable development is treated as the core purpose of Government rather than as a cross-cutting theme. In 2010 the Wales Audit Office found examples of sustainable development being seen as a 'competing priority' in delivery¹. We are concerned that there are still examples where sustainable development is treated as one of many competing priorities, including in high-profile areas noted in this report, such as Local Service Boards. We expect this to be a primary focus of the Effectiveness Review of *One Wales:One Planet*. The Effectiveness Review should tackle important questions that could help achieve this: is language of 'relationships' or 'links' with sustainability hindering embedding it? Is sustainable development seen as an 'add-on' to core responsibilities? How tangible and transparent are targets and objectives? Who takes ownership for seeing actions delivered? How effectively can evaluation and measurement of progress be carried out?

We see the perceived disconnect between the Sustainable Development Scheme and the programme of Government as a key issue. The review *Progress in Embedding the One Planet aspiration in Welsh Government*² raised cause for concern that *One Wales:One Planet* did not feature in key areas of "policy discourse" and, in some instances, is still bolted on to policy considerations. This lack of progress in mainstreaming sustainable development, as stressed by the Sustainability Committee in its legacy report from the third Assembly, highlights the need to look at the effectiveness of how the programme of government delivers the commitments of *One Wales:One Planet*. The combination of reporting on small-scale interventions alongside major issues highlights the need for a clearer materiality test to identify the key issues that need to be reported in more depth. The Wales Audit Office previously noted the tendency in reporting for "cherry picking of topics and

¹ Wales Audit Office, 2010. "Sustainable development and business decision making in the Welsh Assembly Government".

² Netherwood A. 2011. "Progress in Embedding the One Planet Aspiration in Welsh Government". WWF Cymru.

uneven treatment to mask gaps in coverage. Inconsistencies in reporting have obscured priorities and prevented the identification of trends.³

The Sustainable Development Indicators for 2011 showed improvements. Worryingly, however, there were also red indicators - in particular, Greenhouse Gas Emissions. The Annual Report also notes new indicators for Planning and Climate Change. We are concerned that the links between the Sustainable Development Indicators and these new sources of data are not clear. There is a risk that the Sustainable Development Indicators will become confused amongst these other indicators, and we would like to see greater clarity of the relationships between them. It is also important that the indicators are presented in the context of their targets, and that progress against those targets is meaningfully explained; for example, the publication refers to a doubling of renewable energy capacity, but no explanation of how that fits with Government targets for renewables.

The Sustainable Development Indicators provide a measure of how we are doing as a nation, representing the cumulative impact of all parts of society. It is also important to be able to demonstrate how the impact of Government policy is contributing to improving performance across the range of indicators. The recent report *More than GDP: Measuring What Matters*⁴ highlights the work in this field happening in Scotland, France and across the EU. Wales should draw on this learning and create clearer measurements of progress.

There are many examples of effective work on Sustainable Development issues in the Annual Report: rewarding good practice in the sustainability category of the Welsh Tourism Awards, the work of the Centre for Regeneration Excellence Wales and Construction Skills on skills for sustainable development, and the recognition of a procurement case study as an exemplar within a British Standard.

With procurement though concerns remain and we would like to see greater progress. The Annual Report notes that the Sustainable Procurement Action Framework score achieved was 3.5 in 2010, against a target of 5. We would like to see some remedial actions to achieve the target. Given the impact that public procurement can have in influencing sustainability, we are concerned that there remain stakeholder concerns about how sustainability outcomes are achieved in procurement exercises.

In the 2011-12 year we recommend that the Welsh Government improves its work on sustainability through:

- Ensuring that examples of best practice are accompanied by a narrative which includes an evidence based critique of “how” and “why” they work.
- Better involvement of specialists and citizens at grass roots level in Wales to understand and respond to the challenges of sustainable development. It is important that progress on Sustainable Development is communicated better in-year, and that this report becomes more accessible and more widely discussed across Wales.

³ [1] Section 2.45, p31.

⁴ Carnegie Trust and Sustainable Development Commission (Scotland). 2001. *Measuring What Matters, More Than GDP*.

- Develop greater clarity of actions and objectives to deliver sustainable development, in particular for this report to demonstrate better work and understanding across traditional departmental boundaries.
- The Permanent Secretary has sustainability as a key performance indicator of the operation of Government. Targets and progress should form part a clearer part of the Accounting for Sustainability annex to the report. Important results such as the total carbon savings achieved this year are not clear from the report.
- The Accounting for Sustainability annex should be improved by reporting economic and social indicators and objectives alongside the existing environmental ones, drawing on global best practice of sustainability reporting.

There is no doubting the commitment to the principles of sustainable development across Government. Previous effectiveness reviews of the Sustainable Development Scheme have highlighted the pride felt by politicians of all parties and civil servants in Wales' sustainable development duty. The Annual Report on progress in delivering that duty needs to be a focal point for that pride across Government and the basis for communication to citizens and businesses inside and outside Wales. We believe that while some progress has been made, there is still a long way to go before we can truly claim that sustainable development is effective as the central organising principle.

Chapter 1 Sustainable Development – Central Organising Principle

Vision: Sustainable development will be the central organising principle of the Welsh Assembly Government

Indicator: Sustainable development is mainstreamed as our central organising principle

Progress:

We have made good progress mainstreaming sustainable development as our central organising principle but we accept that there is still more to do. Through our statutory review of the effectiveness of our Sustainable Development Scheme we will develop Key Performance Indicators to more accurately report on our progress.

Training and capacity building

We have continued to provide training, open to all staff, on sustainable development as our central organising principle. We have continued to work with Forum for the Future, who have provided case studies from other countries looking at how sustainable development has shaped the delivery of public services.

Decision making

Over the course of the year, Ministers submitted papers to the Cabinet Sub Committee on Sustainable Futures explaining how sustainable development as our central organising principle has informed their decisions. These papers are available on the Welsh Government website.⁵

A sustainable way of working

Progress continued on a range of environmental performance enhancements across the Administrative Estate. Green Dragon management now includes over 90% of total net internal floor area and staff. As a result, the entire Welsh Government administrative estate is now certified to Green Dragon level 5. At the same time, we started work to baseline our greenhouse gas emissions from a wider range of Welsh Government activities. This included castles and historic monuments in our guardianship; lighting and network communications equipment for Welsh trunk roads; and buildings where we have energy responsibilities. Once baselines have been established, a Carbon Reduction Strategy will be adopted in each area seeking to minimise emissions by 30% by 2020.

We have continued to lead by example in sustainable procurement:

- Applying the Sustainable Risk Assessment to all contracts above £25,000;
- Routinely including community benefits clauses in major contracts. This has encouraged suppliers to recruit and train long-term unemployed in contracts covering the Welsh National Survey, Facilities Management, Work Based Learning and Fuel Poverty schemes. These arrangements also included provision to maximise opportunities for SMEs;

⁵ <http://wales.gov.uk/about/cabinet/cabinetsubcommittees/previous/cc/?lang=en>

- Undertaking collaborative contracts on behalf of the wider public sector. An all-Wales print framework stipulates mandatory use of recycled paper and use of vegetable-based inks. Fourteen Welsh SMEs were appointed to the framework. This arrangement is an exemplar procurement in Publication BS8903:2010 *"Principles and framework for procuring sustainable – Guide"*;
- Reserving business for Supported Businesses for signage at the Welsh Government buildings in Aberystwyth and Llandudno and IT recycling, supporting disabled people in employment and focusing on refurbishment for re-use, delivering both wellbeing and environmental outcomes;
- Mandating timber from legal, sustainable sources for furniture contracts; and
- Introducing more locally produced food into catering contracts menus and reducing suppliers' carbon footprint.

We continued to use the Sustainable Procurement Action Framework (SPAF) to improve our sustainable procurement performance, rising from a score of 2 in 2008, to 3.5 in 2010, against a target of SPAF level 5 by 2010 that we set out in the Sustainable Development Scheme.

Working with others

Sustainable development is embedded in the efficiency and innovation agenda, encouraging strong and integrated working across public services to seek better long- term outcomes. The work focused on seven priority areas in order to identify innovation that promoted social and environmental outcomes alongside cost savings. These seven areas were: collaborative procurement and commissioning; public services ICT; transforming the business; national asset management; new models of service delivery; leadership, and workforce development.

CASE STUDY: Public Service Reform

Over the last year, the efficiency and innovation agenda has brought public service leaders in Wales together in order to respond to the financial challenges and increasing demand faced by public services. It aimed at championing innovation in the design and delivery of public services, promoting collaboration and maximising the benefits for the economy, environment and people of Wales.

The context for activity in the seven priority areas is consistent with the Welsh Government's commitment to sustainable development as the central organising principle, aiming at driving better services and outcomes for people in Wales. This principle was incorporated in practical ways to promote social and environmental outcomes alongside cost savings. For example:

- the ecological footprint of public service organisations can be reduced through co-location of services and more effective estate management, which is being taken forward by the National Asset Management Group;
- increased take up of a single public services broadband network for Wales is enabling cost savings through greater integration of ICT systems;
- the Memorandum of Understanding agreed between local authorities and the Wales TUC is helping to protect local government jobs and services;
- sustainable innovation has been identified through service re-design, placing the most vulnerable in society at the centre of service provision; and

- a review of public sector procurement – Buying Smarter in Tougher Times – focused on standardisation, simplification, sharing and strengthening capability (including skills and technology). The review recognised the importance of procurement for economic regeneration and benefits for local communities, estimating that efficiency savings might be achieved if the recommendations were widely adopted.

Welsh Government Sustainable Development Charter

The SD Charter network had grown to 57 organisations by the end of the reporting period. Signatories include Carillion Plc, Marks and Spencer, PwC, Sharp Electronics, the Hay Festival, the National Trust, the National Federation of Women's Institutes, Cardiff University, Aneurin Bevan Health Board, our three National Park Authorities and six local authorities.

The network met twice during 2010. Organisations reported how signing the Charter had given them both political and commercial advantage, with the potential to improve customer and stakeholder engagement through involvement in the network. The Charter had helped build enthusiasm, gave direction and purpose and made the case for those engaged in sustainable development.

Reporting

We continue to report on our environmental performance in our Annual Green Dragon report and we have summarised our performance using the Accounting for Sustainability integrated reporting framework, in ANNEX A of this report.

We published the progress we are making towards becoming a more sustainable nation in our annual Sustainable Development Indicators publication⁶

Action 1 - We will develop a measure of wellbeing in Wales, and report it as a 5th headline indicator of sustainable development.

Cabinet agreed to report on the wellbeing of Wales as a 5th headline indicator of sustainable development at its meeting in January 2010, and we reported on wellbeing as a 5th headline indicator for the first time in our Sustainable Development Indicators 2010 publication, in August 2010.

Action 2 – We will benchmark our progress on sustainable development in our operations against other Government departments, using the Sustainable Development in Government (SDiG) reporting process, from spring 2009.

We published one SDiG report from the Sustainable Development Commission (SDC) which we referred to in last year's Annual Report. Following the decision of the UK Government to withdraw funding from the SDC from the end of March 2011, the SDC (which is now closed) were unable to produce a second SDiG report.

Action 3 – Through our Policy Integration Toolkit, we will identify how each new initiative can best contribute to sustainable development, and we will use

⁶ <http://wales.gov.uk/topics/statistics/headlines/sustain2010/100826/?lang=en>

the Resources and Energy Analysis Programme (REAP) to identify the contribution of these to reducing Wales' Ecological Footprint.

During 2010-11, we continued to use the Gateway Tool and Policy Threshold tool in our policy making. We also undertook work to improve the effectiveness of the Tools by ensuring that:

- the right questions are posed at the right time and addressed using the right data, and
- unnecessary duplication is reduced.

That work is continuing into 2011-12.

Chapter 2 Sustainable Resource Use

Vision: Within the lifetime of a generation we want to see Wales using only its fair share of the earth's resources

Headline indicator of sustainable development: Wales' Ecological Footprint

Progress:

The most recent figure available for Wales' ecological footprint is 4.4 global hectares per person (2006), still more than double the average earthshare and slightly below the UK average (4.6). This figure, which hasn't been updated since 2006, predates the publication of the One Wales: One Planet Scheme

• Greenhouse gas emissions

The overall trend has been an estimated decrease of 10 per cent in emissions of the basket of greenhouse gases from Wales in 2008 since 1990. More recently, greenhouse gas emissions have been increasing. 2008 emissions were up by 4.7 per cent compared to the previous year.

• Waste arisings

Between 1998-99 and 2004-05, the total amount of municipal waste produced in Wales per year increased by almost 400 thousand tonnes. Since 2004-05 however, the total amount of municipal waste produced in Wales annually has been decreasing year on year. By 2009-10 it had decreased by over 250 thousand tonnes since the high point in 2004-05.

• Household waste recycled or composted

The proportion of household waste recycled or composted has continually increased since 1996-97. In 2009-0, 40% of household waste was recycled or composted.

• Mobility

The number of trips made per person per year by walking and cycling decreased between 1995/00 to 2002/03, and has since increased a little. In terms of travelling to work, in 2010, 79 per cent of people travelled to work by car, van, minibus or works van, which was a slight decrease compared to the previous year. Both walking or cycling, and other modes of transport saw a slight increase. Around 13 per cent travelled to work by walking or cycling and 8 per cent travelled to work using other modes of transport.

Climate Change Strategy

We published our Climate Change Strategy for Wales in October 2010, confirming our principal target to reduce greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions in areas of devolved competence by 3% per year from 2011, against a baseline of average GHG emissions between 2006 and 2010. The Strategy also confirmed the Welsh Government's commitment to achieving at least a 40% reduction in all GHG emissions in Wales by 2020 against a 1990 baseline, as well as a range of sector emission reduction targets.

We published two Delivery Plans alongside the Climate Change Strategy. The Emission Reduction Delivery Plan sets out a range of specific measures to reduce GHG emissions in the transport, public, business, agriculture, waste, residential sectors. The Adaptation Delivery Plan sets out the specific adaptation policies and programmes that we are implementing.

In addition to the work underway to implement the emission reduction and adaptation measures, we are now putting in place a comprehensive monitoring framework to measure progress towards the emission reduction targets we have set. A suite of indicators are being developed to track implementation of the measures contained in the Delivery Plan to ensure that they are delivering the anticipated emission savings. This framework is consistent with that which has been adopted by the UK Government to enable comparative assessments.

CASE STUDY: Eco Schools

The highest concentrations of pupils entitled to free school meals occurs in the South Wales Valleys. This statistic is often used as an indication of areas that are deemed economically and socially challenged. These same places are full of vibrant Green Flag Eco-Schools making a positive environmental difference. What is often overlooked is the positive impact the programme plays in raising pupil self esteem, communication skills and attainment levels.

The Eco-Committee of Bryntirion Juniors (Bridgend) regularly monitor the usage of water, energy and waste arising. They determine how much has been used and whether this is an increase or a decrease compared to other months. They use analytical skills to then determine possible reasons for the change. All this information is then reported back to the rest of the school in a fun and dynamic way. This approach improves their mathematical skills as well as heightening their levels of communication.

Heolgerrig Community Primary in Merthyr Tydfil have a dynamic and committed Eco-Committee. They chose to develop a recycling scheme, build a learning environment made from reclaimed materials with the help of Tidy Towns Merthyr as well as explore the UN Rights of a Child. Being on an Eco-Committee creates opportunities for pupils which they may not have been able to access leading to a development in their attainment. This is best illustrated by a direct quote from a member of the Eco-Committee "At first I joined the Eco-Committee to get out of doing Maths and English, now I do it because I like talking and making a difference to my school".

The Eco-Committee of Penrhys Primary (Rhondda Cynnon Taff) ran a project to encourage and recognise British garden birds. They built bird feeding areas, made bird cake and sited them. They recorded the birds who visited the school. The skills involved in this project are multi dimensional and incredibly hands on. This approach suited some of the academically less able pupils who shone during this project raising their self esteem in the process.

Waste

In June 2010 we published Towards Zero Waste, the overarching waste strategy document for Wales. It confirmed the key milestones of maximising recycling to at least 70% across all waste streams by 2025, and minimising the production of residual waste; and, by 2050, we aiming to phase out residual waste through actions on sustainable consumption and production.

Under the Waste (Wales) Measure 2010, we have made the 70% recycling target for all wastes statutory for local authorities.

The Municipal Sector Plan, covering waste collected by local authorities, was issued for consultation in June 2010 and the final version published in March 2011. Alongside it we published the "Collections Blueprint" which describes a consistent, sustainable collection service that local authorities can deliver for household waste.

In March 2010 we published, for consultation, the draft Collections, Infrastructure and Markets Sector Plan, and the draft Food Manufacture, services and Retail Sector Plan.

The Sustainable Waste Management Grant provided by the Welsh Government to help support increases in local authority recycling was increased to £72 million (from £59 million in 2009-10). This increase in funding was focussed on increasing the separate collection of food waste. By December 2010 around 80 per cent of households in Wales were provided by their local councils with a separate collection service for food waste.

Planning

In 2010/11 we have continued to update and issue new policy and guidance to further facilitate the role that planning plays in delivering our vision of a sustainable Wales.

In June 2010 we published *Technical Advice Note 22 Planning for Sustainable Buildings* to provide advice to developers and planners on how to implement our national planning policy on sustainable buildings.

In July 2010 we published a new edition of *Planning Policy Wales* which completed the process of updating our policy and guidance on tackling climate change through the planning system. These updates reiterate the key role that planning plays in tackling climate change within the context of sustainable development.

Alongside the new edition of *Planning Policy Wales* we also published;

- a *Renewable Energy Toolkit for Planners* which will help local planning authorities to assess and identify the opportunities for renewable and low carbon energy in their area;
- *Practice Guidance – Planning Implications of Renewable and Low Carbon Energy* for planners to assist them in taking decisions on applications for a range of renewable and low carbon energy technologies. The guidance was updated in February 2011 to include additional advice on Solar PV array schemes; and
- A suite of 10 leaflets covering a range of small scale renewable and low carbon energy technologies. The *Generating Your Own Energy* leaflets assist householders, communities and businesses who want to generate their own energy on what issues they should be aware of. This compliments our *Improving Your Home – A Climate Change Guide* from 2008.

We consulted on changes to our planning policy for renewable and low carbon energy to help facilitate our energy aspirations. The final policy was published in February 2011 in a new edition of *Planning Policy Wales*. Our revised policy seeks to further establish a framework in which local planning authorities should plan positively for all forms of renewable energy development.

We continue to work on removing the barriers to the installation of micro generation on both domestic and non domestic properties. In 2010 we consulted further on extending permitted development rights for microgeneration technologies.

We have updated our policy and guidance on how the planning system can be used to promote sustainable rural communities through *Planning Policy Wales* and *Technical Advice Note 6* in July 2010. This introduced our One Planet Development policy which requires these proposals to have an ecological footprint of 2.4 hectares per person or less.

Wales Spatial Plan

Among the examples of how Sustainable Development principles have been applied in the spatial plan work at an area level in 2010/11 are the Networked Environment Region project in South East Wales, and the marine energy project in Pembrokeshire.

The highly innovative Networked Environment Region project used geographic data, coupled with professional expertise, to demonstrate a new approach to integrating green and blue infrastructure into strategic planning. The outputs have informed our consultation on 'A Living Wales', on a new Natural Environment Framework.

In Pembrokeshire, the Spatial Plan brought together industry, researchers, local authorities, and environmental interests to work jointly on a project to achieve a step change and make Pembrokeshire a centre for excellence in marine energy. As a result, cutting-edge tidal stream technology is now being piloted off the coast of Pembrokeshire.

Housing

We announced in July 2010 a new target to reduce carbon emissions from new housing by 55% against 2006 standards, through devolved Building Regulations. Work is in hand to develop proposals for public consultation during 2012. This is intended as a major step on the road to zero carbon new buildings. The work is supported by the Wales Low Zero Carbon Hub through its engagement and dissemination activities.

Food

The Food Strategy for Wales – Food for Wales, Food from Wales 2010-2020 – was launched at the end of 2010. It sets a long term and proactive agenda to address the challenges ahead for the wider food sector. The strategy identifies the complex issues around food that face all of us, including how best to balance the need for increased food production with the need to protect our environment for the immediate and longer term future. The strategy joins up a range of the Welsh Government's key policies, embedding broad cross-cutting strategic issues such as sustainability, health and well being, food security, education, biodiversity, rural development, and building strong ties with other key Welsh Government strategies. The Strategy identified a key role for industry in delivery. Industry-led environmental initiatives such

as the 'Dairy Road Map' and the 'Red Meat Road Map', in partnership with Government, are examples of how closer collaboration can promote positive change.

Transport

The four regional transport consortia across Wales successfully completed their first year of Regional Transport Plan delivery in 2010/11. We are expecting to receive their first Annual Progress Reports by the end of September 2011.

We are currently refreshing WelTAG, (Welsh Transport Planning and Appraisal Guidance), with an expectation that the revised version will in place by the end of 2011. The updated WelTAG will take account of best practice and the appraisal will remain centred around the three main impact areas of society, environment and the economy.

Consumer items

The Climate Change Engagement Strategy sets out how public behavioural change will play a crucial role in meeting our climate change targets. The document sets out an approach which builds on the expertise already existing within Wales, and the action which is already happening at a community level. The approach aims to catalyse action - that is to help people, communities and organisations to:

- (a) relate to climate change and understand how it connects to the way they live and work;
- (b) feel that climate change is an issue where they can make a positive difference; and
- (c) change the way they live to adopt more climate aware choices and habits.

To help achieve a more sustainable Wales, we have put a framework contract in place that provides easy access to support and advice. The aim is to help people and communities create and communicate a shared vision of a sustainable, resilient, low carbon Wales, help with the actions we have to take to realise the vision; and help us deliver programmes which have more sustainable ways of living as outcomes.

Our Supporting Sustainable Living Grant Scheme gives funds and advice for projects to help people move to a more sustainable and lower carbon lifestyle. We want to help bring about long-term lifestyle changes that will help reduce Wales' greenhouse gas emissions and tackle climate change impacts. The grant scheme is open to organisations from all sectors

We continue to support practitioners at community level across Wales who are working on locally led projects, through these biannual network events, which provide opportunities for collaboration joint learning and sharing of expertise.

Action 4 - *To promote a low footprint Wales, we will further extend the use of ecological footprinting by introducing a grant scheme from 2009/10.*

The ecological footprint grants were used by four organisations in the reporting period:

- Cymdeithas Tai Eryri to measure the carbon and ecological footprint of the housing association;
- Rounded Development Enterprises Ltd used the grant to develop a Construction Product Database aimed at encouraging the construction industry get better quality and more accessible information on building products;

The Hay Festival used the grant to measure the ecological footprint of the 2010 Hay Festival; and

The Environment Agency carried out a footprint of the water resources used by lamb, potatoes and tomatoes produced in Wales as compared to countries that export these products to Wales (New Zealand, Israel and Spain respectively).

Action 5 - We will initiate, in consultation with local government, a strategic monitoring framework to measure key sustainable development outcomes delivered by the planning system.

We commissioned research to help identify a suite of indicators to demonstrate how the planning system contributes to the delivery of our sustainable development objectives. This project is nearing completion and we will consult on our proposals later this year with a view to introducing the new monitoring framework in 2012.

Action 6 - We will develop a strategy to reduce each Wales Spatial Area's ecological footprint across the range of its activities, and set this out in the Area's delivery framework. As part of this, we will define the concept of low-carbon regions and how this can be achieved in each Spatial Plan Area.

The Welsh Government has worked together with the Sustainable Development Commission and other partners to progress this commitment. The publication of the Sustainable Development Commission's report 'Low Carbon Wales – Regional Priorities for Action' in November 2009 marked the first stage in the process. Since then there has been good progress on the development of Low Carbon Region action plans:

- In *South West Wales*, the Low Carbon Task Force, chaired by Peter Davies was established. It launched its route map in September 2010 and work on the delivery plan is progressing.
- In *Central Wales*, the Low Carbon Region work is focusing on the important challenge of protecting and improving soil carbon stores and on renewable energy under the Green Economy Framework for Action.
- In *North Wales*, work to link and amplify the large number of very positive, but disparate activities in the region is progressing. An early win is the successful INTERREG GIFT bid (Green Innovation and Future Technology).
- In *South East Wales* strong links have been built with the academic community as part of the Low Carbon Research Institute and the ESRC's RETROFIT project. Work on the action plan is progressing. (Karen Morris)

Action 7 - We will have a National Energy Efficiency and Savings Plan that will better target our energy efficiency investments at the fuel poor, whilst promoting improvements for all households.

The National Energy Efficiency and Savings Plan was published in March 2011. To ensure that this Plan has a clear identify and purpose, it is focussed on the actions being taken and planned to promote energy efficiency and, where relevant, small scale low carbon energy generation in Wales. The National Energy Efficiency and Savings Plan will contribute to:

- Reducing fuel poverty and helping to deliver our Fuel Poverty Strategy
- Reducing greenhouse gas emissions and helping to deliver our Climate Change Strategy;
- Creating jobs and business opportunities in one of the six sectors identified in Economic Renewal: A New Direction and supporting delivery of our Green Jobs Strategy;
- Improving the energy performance of buildings in Wales, raising the overall quality of building stock and cutting energy costs;
- Regeneration of communities in Wales both through improvement in the fabric of buildings and, importantly, through the creation of jobs and business opportunities which will lead to more cohesive, sustainable communities;
- Our wider energy policy, complementing the contents of Wales: A Low Carbon Revolution;
- Enabling and engaging people, organisations and businesses to reduce their energy consumption and become more energy efficient; and
- Supporting a more equal and socially just distribution of resources.

Action 8 - We will work to develop a series of Sustainable Travel Towns in each region. To take this forward we will initially develop a pathfinder scheme in a large urban area. We will subsequently identify and develop a series of towns linked to other key settlement identified in the Wales Spatial Plan.

The first Sustainable Travel City in Wales was announced for Cardiff in 2009/10 and further funding was awarded to Cardiff in 2010/11.

In addition, in line with the National Travel Plan commitment, Sustainable Travel Towns (STT's) in South West Wales (a joint project for Carmarthen/Haverfordwest), Mid Wales (Aberystwyth) and North Wales (Mon a Menai, including Bangor) were announced for 2010/11. These proposals were developed in partnership with the regional transport consortia and are closely aligned with both Regional Transport Plan and Wales Spatial Plan priorities. Each project was awarded £1m during 2010/11 toward an agreed programme of initiatives.

Chapter 3 Sustaining the Environment

Vision: Wales has healthy, functioning ecosystems that are biologically diverse and productive and managed sustainably

Headline indicator of sustainable development: % of Biodiversity Action Plan habitats and species recorded as stable or increasing

Progress:

Of the priority species for which sufficient information was available, 52 per cent were classed as stable or increasing in 2008, compared with 40 per cent in 2002. Of the priority habitats with sufficient information available, the percentage of habitats classed as stable or increasing has increased slightly to 39 per cent in 2008, which is a 2 per cent increase since 2002.

• Trends in bird populations

The index of widespread breeding birds began in 1994 and peaked at 113 for all species in 2000. The index fell to its lowest point of 98 in 2009. This is the first time that the index has fallen below 100. Values less than 100 indicate a decline in abundance since 1994. These data are not representative of all birds in Wales.

• Ecological impacts of air pollution

There was little change in the percentage of sensitive habitats in Wales exceeding critical loads for acid deposition from 1998-2000 to 2004-06. However, in 2006-08 there was a decrease of 2 percentage points.

• Air quality

At each rural and urban site, the number of days when pollution was moderate or higher has fluctuated from year to year. However, in 2010 rural monitoring sites reached their lowest figure for days when pollution was moderate or higher. The main causes of moderate or higher pollution at urban sites are fine particles (PM10) and ozone. In rural areas, differences are a reflection of the variation in ozone levels, which is the main cause of pollution in rural areas and which is affected by the weather.

• River quality

The percentage of river lengths in Wales of good chemical quality has been consistently above 90 per cent since 1994, and has remained at around 95 per cent over the last 5 years. The percentage of river lengths in Wales of good biological quality has steadily increased since 2000, peaking at 88 per cent in 2008 before going down slightly to 87 per cent in 2009.

• Soil quality

The Countryside Survey assesses the tonnes of carbon per hectare in the top -0-15cm of soil in Welsh broad habitats. The results showed that the mean soil carbon stock in 2007 was highest under dwarf shrub heath habitat, and lowest in arable soils.

• Sustainable water resource management

The percentage of resource zones in Wales with target headroom deficits has varied since 2001-02, but improved to its lowest level of 8 per cent in 2009-10. A target headroom deficit occurs when the actual amount of available water supply is less than the sum of the forecast demand and the additional "target headroom" amount.

Environment Strategy

The latest update against the progress of the Environment Strategy Action Plan was published in November 2010. This included detailed reporting our biodiversity duty under the Natural Environment and Rural Communities Act 2006.

Progress was also seen in the support of practical, hands-on environmental projects through the role of a Green Volunteering coordinator based at the Wales Council for Voluntary Action, and funded by Welsh Government. This post will build capacity of smaller organisations to increase the number of volunteers they can accommodate and promote green volunteering with the general public, particularly disadvantaged and excluded groups.

We also published a comprehensive suite of State of the Environment indicators in July 2010.

Land management

Woodlands and trees are recognised for their ability to provide ecosystem services, address the effects of climate change, and protect biodiversity through their sustainable management, and these services are promoted through *Woodlands for Wales*. To take this forward, Forestry Commission Wales has:

- Launched the Glastir Woodland Creation Grant scheme to fund an increase in the area of woodland in Wales;
- Promoted outdoor learning through the Forest Education Initiative. During 2010/11 this included the further development of the Forest School network in Wales and, through the Forestry Commission Wales' (FCW) Woodlands for Learning team, the delivery of Key Stage 2 climate change educational visits with supporting teacher's and students learning packs.
- Launched the *Woodlands and You* framework to encourage more public involvement in the woodlands they manage on behalf of the Welsh Government.

CASE STUDY: A Living Wales – Natural Environment Framework

In the light of emerging evidence on ecosystem health, in September 2010 the Natural Environment Framework, 'A Living Wales' was launched. This outlined the Welsh Government's approach and aimed to ensure that the environment is addressed as a whole and sought to focus on all the benefits better management of our environment can bring.

Following the initial consultation, plans to adopt a new ecosystem approach were published in February 2011.

The main changes that this ecosystem approach will bring are:

- A focus on the value of the environment as a whole, delivering positive environmental, social and economic outcomes
- Opportunities for wider public involvement.
- A positive approach for landowners, farmers, fisheries, forestry, developers and regulated industries to reflect the common goal of sustainable development, delivering positive environmental change, not just conserving what we have

- Changes in the way we deliver policy, make decisions and regulate the environment, to ensure our communities and neighbourhoods have the highest possible standards of health and wellbeing
- Ensuring the public bodies, charged with protecting and enhancing the environment are equipped to deliver the new approach.

The Welsh Government's guiding aim is to ensure that Wales has increasingly resilient and diverse ecosystems that deliver economic, environmental and social benefits. In delivering this aim, the Welsh Government is committed to embedding the ecosystem approach into its policy development and service delivery mechanisms.

Water management

The Wales Water Industry Forum was established in May 2010 and met twice more during the year 2010-11, providing a mechanism for engaging key organisations in planning the strategic direction for water management and water and sewerage services in Wales and discussing strategic water issues, including environmental water quality.

Implementation of the Water Framework Directive (WFD) has continued through the investigative work and interventions detailed in the River Basin Management Plans. The Wales WFD Stakeholder Forum continues to meet, as do the Liaison Panels for each River Basin District, to monitor and steer action and outcomes.

We are promoting the deployment of sustainable urban drainage systems to help ease the surface water burden on the sewerage system and alleviate flood risk. Primary powers for Welsh Ministers were secured as part of the Flood and Water Management Act 2010.

We have supported the European Commission in its intention to bring forward regulation to reduce phosphates at source by reducing their use in washing detergents.

Marine and Coastal Management

The Welsh Government shares in the UK vision for all our seas - for them to be clean, healthy, safe, productive and biologically diverse. The Marine & Coastal Act 2009 gives us the powers to develop plans to help achieve sustainable development in our marine area and integrate marine and coastal policies and priorities, as well as specific powers to manage activities in the sea better and protect marine life, for example by designating marine conservation zones and updating our fisheries management and licensing systems.

The Welsh Government has adopted the UK-wide Marine Policy Statement, which sets the overarching framework for developing marine plans, including the ecosystem approach and integration between the sea and land, and has gone out to consultation on the approach to developing plans for the Welsh marine area.

Fisheries Management

The Wales Fisheries Strategy is the Welsh Government's long term strategy for the management and development of fisheries in Wales across all sectors of aquaculture, commercial fisheries and recreational fisheries for 2020. The vision of the Wales Fisheries Strategy is to support the development of viable and sustainable fisheries in Wales as an integral part of coherent policies for safeguarding the environment. It emphasises the importance of developing and managing fisheries in a sustainable way as a part of healthy and productive ecosystems.

Delivery of the strategy will be through the Implementation Plans which will be kept under regular review. The first of these reviews was undertaken during 2011 and revised implementation plans due to be published in 2012.

The finalisation of the implementation plans involved a wide range of stakeholders from the industry, environmental interests and fisheries management. The plans will establish what work has already been undertaken to date, and will set out the staged approach to increase our knowledge of fisheries/environment interactions in support of sustainable fisheries development, improved stock and catch assessments, examination of fishery effects on aquatic ecosystems and of the interactions between fisheries activities and other aquatic environment uses. (Stuart Evans)

Action 9 - Following a review of Axis II of the Rural Development Plan for Wales, we will set in place a structure of support for environmentally sustainable land management, including support for land-based carbon management through best practice management of soils, and management for water quantity and quality, biodiversity, woodland, landscape, heritage and access.

2,940 applications to the All-Wales Element (AWE) of Glastir (the new sustainable land management scheme for Wales) were received in 2010, in addition to over 300 commons grazing associations indicating an interest in joining the Glastir Common Land Element. This is far in excess of any annual application round to the previous agri-environment schemes.

In November 2010 the former Minister for Rural Affairs announced an independent review of the potential for on-farm delivery of the AWE options. The purpose being to maximise the scheme's potential for ecosystem delivery by enhancing its attractiveness to farmers and other land managers.

In total, the review group made 69 recommendations, some of which were accepted for immediate implementation, and others which could not be implemented directly as they require further development. All planned changes to the scheme will be implemented prior to the second application round opening in December 2011.

The monitoring and evaluation framework for the scheme has been under development throughout 2010-11, and will clearly assess – in a considerably more effective way than in previous agri environment schemes- delivery of environmental outcomes and their benefits to the taxpayer.

Chapter 4 A Sustainable Economy

Vision: A resilient and sustainable economy for Wales that is able to develop whilst stabilising, then reducing, its use of natural resources and reducing its contribution to climate change.

Headline indicator of sustainable development: Gross Value Added (GVA) and GVA/head

Progress:

Both GVA and GVA per head in Wales increased continually between 1995 and 2008, but fell in 2009. Wales' GVA per head as a proportion of the UK's GVA per head has fallen from 83 per cent in 1995 to 74 per cent in 2009.

• Employment

The percentage of all people aged 16-64 in Wales has increased *overall* since 1985. However, there has been a decrease of 3 percentage points since 2008.

• Resource efficiency

The ratio of carbon dioxide emissions to GVA in Wales has decreased by 12 per cent between 2005 and 2007.

• Electricity from renewable sources

The percentage of electricity generated in Wales from renewable sources has more than doubled since 2002, reaching 5.0 per cent in 2009.

Develop the approach to a more sustainable economy

In July 2010 we published Economic Renewal: a new direction. This policy outlines our vision of making Wales one of the best places in the world to live and to work. It sets out the role we can play in providing the best conditions and framework to enable the private sector to grow and flourish. In future government resources will be targeted at tackling wide systematic issues within the Welsh Economy - investing in infrastructure, skills and improving the conditions within which businesses operate.

Economic Renewal will see a fundamental shift away from direct and generic support for companies to a focus on creating the right environment for businesses to succeed. Our approach is organised by five priorities:

- Investing in high-quality and sustainable infrastructure
- Making Wales a more attractive place to do business
- Broadening and deepening the skills base
- Encouraging innovation
- Targeting the business support we offer

Support for Sustainable Business Growth

Sustainable Tourism Framework

The Welsh Government's Sustainable Tourism Framework (STF) equally considers the needs and quality of life of local communities, enhances and respects culture and local traditions, contributes to local economic prosperity, as well as minimises damage to the environment. VisitWales sets an annual work programme for

sustainable tourism development that is divided into partnership working, establishing pilot projects, investing in tourism infrastructure, and improving the quality of the sustainable tourism product in Wales. Examples under this programme of work include:

- *Green Sea Partnership* - Considerable success has been achieved improving the quality of Wales' coastline and increasing the number of award winning beaches. In 2011 coastal awards include 41 Blue Flag beaches, 5 Blue Flag marinas, and 46 Green Coast Awards.
- *National Park Environmental Management Pilots 2010* - Wales' three National Park Authorities undertook environmental management events and seminars designed to address key sustainable tourism themes, e.g. energy efficiency, waste management, recycling and participation in green accreditation schemes.
- *Tourism Investment Support Scheme (TISS)* - Launched in October 2010, TISS is open to existing Welsh tourism businesses for the purpose of upgrading facilities, for instance increasing energy efficiency or environmental improvement. In August 2011, the TISS Destination Management scheme was also launched, to enhance the visitor experience through improvements to visitor amenities and the local environment in support of destination management plans.
- *National Tourism Awards, Sustainable Tourism Category* - In 2010 VisitWales launched a new sustainable tourism category of the National Tourism Awards. Key sustainability questions were also incorporated within all other award categories.
- *Tourism Environmental Satellite Account and Tourism Impact Model* - VisitWales worked with Cardiff Business School on the Tourism Satellite Account for Wales in order to measure key economic and environmental impacts of tourism in Wales. This includes improving data on carbon, water, and waste in tourism.

Support for R&D and commercialisation of new sustainable technologies, products and processes

One of the flagship Low Carbon R&D programmes receiving support via the Welsh Government included the Low Carbon Research Institute (LCRI). The LCRI represents collaborative action by a number of Welsh Higher Education Institutions that have come together to deliver a range of research priorities, from marine energy to the use of carbon capture and storage.

LCRI is supported through industry representation by RWE nPower, Corus Colours and the National Grid, as well as a number of other companies working directly on specific research projects. Representation is also made from the R&D field, including membership by the UK Energy Research Council (UKERC), the Energy Technology Institute and the Technology Strategy Board (TSB).

CASE STUDY: Grassohol - In search of a greener bio-fuel

An innovative research project brings together scientists, farmers, fuel manufacturers and distributors to develop a new sustainable method of producing bio-fuel. Led by IBERS, the project brings together the expertise of seven partners who are leaders in their respective fields and is supported by the

Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs (Defra), the Department of Energy and Climate Change (DECC) and the Biotechnology and Biological Sciences Research Council (BBSRC) through the Renewable Materials LINK programme, and by the Welsh Government's Academic Expertise for Business programme, which is itself supported by the Welsh European Funding Office (WEFO) through the Convergence Programme-funded project 'Knowledge Transfer and Collaborative Research'.

The three year Grassohol project, lead by Dr Joe Gallagher is focusing on sugar-rich varieties of perennial ryegrass, developed at Aberystwyth University's Institute of Biological, Environmental and Rural Sciences (IBERS), as a raw material for producing bio-ethanol.

Every link in the production chain is being studied in detail by the project team - from the farmer right through to the bio-fuel distributor - to develop a commercially viable bio-fuel production process which has minimal impact on the environment and current land use.

The team are using high-sugar varieties of perennial ryegrass and experimenting with different soils, fertilisers and companion crops such as white clover, with the aim of reducing dependency on artificial oil-based fertilisers. The process being developed will look to integrate into current farming practices and represents a real opportunity to demonstrate the potential of a commercially relevant process using an abundant UK non-food crop feedstock. Early results are promising and indicate that the quantities of ethanol that could be produced per hectare of ryegrass every year is comparable with other energy crops but with the advantage of being environmentally friendly, capable of growing on poorer land and with cheaper management costs.

Infrastructure, regeneration and masterplanning

Our *Creating Sustainable Places Together* guidance is used as a sustainable development desk top manual, to support the development of sustainable policies, activities, projects and programmes for all of our work. It helps and guides all managers within the department on how to mainstream sustainable development as the central organising principle. Last year's Annual Report contained a case Study of how this had been applied to the regeneration of Ebbw Vale Steel Works.

Structural funds

Over the last year, WEFO's Cross Cutting Theme (CCT) team attended over 170 meetings with project sponsors, advising them how their projects can deliver real and practical actions that directly improve the environmental, equality and economic situation 'on the ground'. In addition, advice on equality and Sustainable Development has been provided to 31 projects bidding to the Ireland-Wales Cross Border Programme.

Examples of practical actions to deliver SD through WEFO projects during the reporting period include:

- Cardiff University's SEREN project is currently developing a tool to help improve the environmental, equality and ultimately economic business performance of supported organisations and enterprises with direct advice and help from the CCT team;

- Support for Aberystwyth Universities' BEACON project, which seeks to research and promote the replacement of fossil-fuel derived products through bio-refining;
- Coleg Morgannwg's construction of the Nantgarw Campus is on course to attain BREEAM 'Excellent' accreditation;
- Support for the British Trust of Conservation Volunteers' (BTCV) Family Employment Initiative, which seeks to re-engage disadvantaged individuals in society and the economy through participation in environmental and community improvement projects;
- Support for Chwarae Teg's Agile Nation project, which aims to promote gender equality, career development and contribute to the reduction for the pay gap in the labour market.

Skills and training

Delivering the Low Carbon Skills Project

The £2m Delivering Low Carbon Skills Project, part-financed through European Structural Funds, represents collaborative action across four Sector Skills Councils (SS)Cs – ConstructionSkills, Energy & Utility Skills, Asset Skills and Summit Skills – to address the emerging skills needs associated with movement towards a low carbon Wales. The project works with training providers to develop their capacity in the delivery of new vocational qualifications, making connection to Welsh Government investment in renewable energy and energy efficiency programmes, such as the Arbed scheme. The focus of skills training, as part of the project, includes:

- Upskilling for installers working on solar photovoltaics, solar thermal systems and heat pumps.
- Development of Energy Advisors for both domestic and commercial properties;
- Support for Apprenticeship delivery within the on-shore wind market;
- Upskilling and retraining for individuals working within the construction industry to understand Modern Methods of Construction (MCC); and,
- Upskilling and retraining associated with insulation within the home, including cavity wall and loft installation.

At this stage of the project there has been a total tender for 693 participants with a further 99 looking to complete 'train the trainer' programmes.

CREW Skills for Low Carbon Professionals

We have invested jointly with ConstructionSkills and the Centre for Regeneration Excellence Wales (CREW) to review the skills they need to support the delivery of a low carbon and sustainable built environment for Wales. Analysis included a review of existing further education and higher education courses on offer. The final report will be published shortly and includes recommendations to develop a continuous professional development framework for professionals, such as architects, surveyors and town planners.

Public procurement

Procurement policies and resources developed by Value Wales have delivered improvements in hospital food and nutrition, initiatives on local food procurement, made it easier for small local firms to win government contracts, and encouraged procurement which incentivises training opportunities for the unemployed.

These approaches have also supported key elements of *Economic Renewal: a New Direction*, by opening up opportunities for Welsh businesses and contributing to the creation of "green" jobs and benefits for local economies and communities.

Mainstreaming SD into the procurement process – Value Wales has embedded sustainable development into procurement tools and principles, with outcomes including the following:

- Use of "Community Benefits" clauses has increased. Where these have been used skilfully within construction projects, the Local Multiplier Effect (benefitting the local economy) has been at least 30% greater than the average for the construction sector. Value Wales is supporting over 30 projects utilising this approach worth approximately £2 billion;
- All major organisations have committed to Opening Doors the Charter for SME friendly procurement. This, plus other initiatives to improve accessibility to public sector opportunities, has contributed to suppliers in Wales winning 51% of public sector business by 2008, rising from 35% in 2004;
xchangewales has reduced carbon and paper used, with transactions to date saving over 9m sheets of paper and 59.3 tonnes of carbon; and
- Work on opening up opportunities for local construction contractors, with Welsh businesses securing awards from 22 out of 39 major frameworks and contracts established over the last 18 months.

CASE STUDY: Sustainable Procurement – Community Benefits, Welsh Government North Wales Office

In October 2009, the construction contract for the Welsh Government North Wales Office in Llandudno Junction was awarded to Pochin plc. The potential for the delivery of 'Community Benefits' was incorporated into the tender process and as part of their bid, Pochin, proposed mechanisms for delivery.

The project teams at Welsh Government and Pochin worked closely together to deliver:

- 52% of the workforce on site were from the local area
- Local people secured employment providing security and catering services to the site
- The building has been awarded a BREEAM 'Excellent' rating reflecting the sustainable features of its design
- The building also won the Bespoke Building category at the BRE Awards recognising the sustainable solutions employed in the building
- Following a local 'Meet the Buyer' event just after contract award, over £400,000 worth of work was won by local businesses.
- Wherever possible materials were bought locally and local site labour used in order to maximise spend within the local community
- Signage at the office was provided by a supported business
- £8.7m of project costs have been spent locally
- Four local schools worked with the project team and contractor to bury a time capsule
- Engagement with local groups
- Open day attended by 350 local people

Action 10 - In our economic development and regeneration work we will encourage our partners to adopt similar principles to ours, integrating social, economic and environmental considerations, and seeking to maximise the benefits to the local community and economy from the way regeneration takes place.

Underpinning Creating Sustainable Places is our *Sustainable Development Integration Tool* which enables managers to generate customised sustainable

development objectives that are specific for each of our activities. This is to ensure that our work delivers sustainable development social, economic and environmental objectives. The desk top manual and tool are constantly reviewed and updated in the light of experience, and they are available to other departments and to any partners to share the learning and experience gained from their usage. The tool was used in the formulation of Economic Renewal: a new direction, and is used by the Valleys Regional Park team to ensure that sustainable development objectives are embedded into all projects.

In addition they have been shared for piloting with external stakeholders such as the Design Commission for Wales, and Newport Unlimited.

Action 11 - By our Green Jobs Strategy, we will set out the path to a sustainable (Low Carbon, Low Waste) economy for Wales, and will identify the roles that the Assembly Government needs to fulfil. We will put in place an embedded delivery plan that will refine and redirect our activities that will be needed to make this happen, together with a monitoring and reporting framework for the plan, integrated with the wider Welsh Assembly Government performance framework

In July 2010 the Welsh Government launched Economic Renewal as our policy for the development of the Welsh economy.

One of our priorities is investing in high quality and sustainable infrastructure. We are working to deliver a low carbon, low waste and resource efficient economy, working closely with sectors and with anchor and regionally important companies, collaborating with key partners and preparing sector strategies as the targeted means to delivery.

Chapter 5 A Sustainable Society

Vision: Safe, sustainable, attractive communities in which people live and work, have access to services, and enjoy good health and can play their full roles as citizens

Headline Indicator of Sustainable Development: % of the population in low-income households

Progress:

There has been little change in the percentage of the population in relative low-income households before housing costs since 1994/97. The percentage of the population in relative low-income households after housing costs has decreased since 1994/97. However, in recent years the percentage has been a little higher than the level seen in 2003/06.

• Health inequality:

The infant mortality rate per 1,000 has increased from 4.1 in 2008 to 4.8 in 2009, however these numbers have tended to fluctuate over recent years as they are based on small numbers. There has been a sustained increase in life expectancy for both males and females since 1991-93.

• Benefit dependency

The percentage of working age people on key benefits decreased each year from 2000 to 2008. However, there was an increase of 2 percentage points in 2009 to 16 per cent, which then fell by 1 percentage point in 2010.

• Housing

The average SAP energy efficiency rating for dwellings in Wales was 50.3 in 2008, an increase of 3.8 points since 2004. This was slightly below the average for England in 2008 (which was 51.4). The Standard Assessment Procedure (SAP) for energy rating of dwellings is a calculation of a building's energy efficiency. SAP ratings are scored on a scale from 1 to 100 where 1 is the worst and 100 is the most energy efficient.

• Accessibility

The percentage of households where the time taken to reach a GP surgery, grocer, shopping centre or hospital by foot or by public transport in 15 minutes or less has increased since 2005/06.

• Crime

The total number of police recorded serious acquisitive crimes in Wales has fallen by 12 per cent since the previous year to 36,000 in 2009-10.

The number of all household crimes in Wales per 10,000 households (as recorded by the British Crime Survey) increased between 2004-05 and 2006-07, before decreasing steadily since and falling to its lowest level in 2009-10.

Tackling disadvantage

The Welsh Government remains committed to supporting the most deprived areas in Wales through its Communities First Programme. The programme continues to focus on delivery of key outcomes for local communities, which reduce inequality and demonstrate measurable change for local communities.

The Communities First Outcomes fund has been developed to support communities in delivering projects, in Partnership with key service providers who also provide match funding to support them. These projects support the six key aims under the

Vision Framework, including health, child poverty and the environment. Since its launch the Outcomes Fund has supported 61 projects receiving almost £4m in 2010/11.

CASE STUDY: Communities First - Sustainable Energy in Clydach Vale

Over the last eight years Communities First in Clydach Vale had been developing ambitious plans to generate energy locally. They had planned two micro hydro electric generators and the first one was completed in March 2011. To further promote the sustainability of key local community projects the two key partners, Cwmclydach Community Development Trust and Cambrian Village Trust, will now receive 75% and 25% of the income generated. This income will support three buildings and help both partners with their aim of medium to long term sustainability and reducing grant reliance.

One of the buildings (the Lakeside Building) forms part of the local social enterprise and was recently extended. The extension has alternative energy features built in including solar panelling and photovoltaic & rain water harvesting which, along with the hydro plant, is becoming an educational attraction for people including school groups to come and see.

The Communities First Partnership has now begun work on community engagement in order to reduce the local carbon footprint. It is hoped that 100 homes will be prepared to pilot the project; in addition local schools have also agreed to participate.

Quality housing

Housing is fundamental to health and well-being and makes a significant contribution to economic and environmental outcomes. Our Housing Strategy was launched in April 2010 and puts the focus of action over the coming years on increasing the supply of homes, improving their quality and the quality of services that people need to live independently. This is particularly true for those who are in need or are particularly vulnerable.

Action continues to be taken to improve the quality of existing homes specifically around energy efficiency through schemes such as Arbed, Renewal Areas and the Welsh Housing Quality Standard (WHQS). Recent data has indicated that by the end of 2012-13 over 78% of all housing association homes will meet this standard, together with 87% of local authority homes⁷.

In parallel with the objective of meeting WHQS, the Welsh Government has encouraged local authorities and housing associations to use a targeted recruitment and training scheme (i2i) to stimulate the economic regeneration of communities. This includes local training and employment programmes aimed at the economically inactive, to provide real skills and employment prospects. The adoption of renewable technology has also been actively promoted through this work.

Cartrefi Conwy has since 2008 provided local employment and training opportunities resulting in over 150 new jobs with local connections. Newport City Homes has specified that for every £1million of WHQS work, the contractor must create 250 person-weeks of training. Also Bron Afon Community Housing has in its first year created 100 new jobs within the organisation, 43 apprentices in training, 17 pupils

⁷ excluding three local authorities that have received 'no votes' and two authorities balloting on the issue this year.

from local schools undertaking work experience placements and opened a community business cafe which provides traineeships for adults with learning difficulties.

Healthy living

One of the key themes in *Our Healthy Future* is further reducing smoking and exposure to second-hand smoke. We recently consulted on a Tobacco Control Action Plan to take this forward.

Local Health Boards are currently working towards the Platinum Corporate Health Standard by 2013. Carmarthenshire County Council is an example of good practice in this area. As one of the largest employers in South West Wales, employing over 9,000 employees, with 74 elected members, the local authority closely follows Magnox North: Wylfa Power Station in achieving the Platinum Corporate Health Standard

Guidance has been issued for local areas to create physical activity action plans that will link to Health Social Care and Well-being Strategies. These will encourage the development of local plans to increase physical activity including walking and cycling.

Planet Health Cymru (Planning for the Environment, Transport and Health in Wales),, a web based toolkit, has been launched⁸. It provides a 'one stop shop' to aid collaborative working, detailing key information, tools, documents and examples of current practice for use by practitioners working in planning, transport, urban design, development, architecture and public health, as well as anybody who has a responsibility in improving the nation's health.

Guidance has been developed for food served in leisure centres, youth clubs and hospitals. As well as promoting the provision of food which supports healthy choices, each document covers the issue of sustainable development, including issues such as local food procurement and reduction of food waste.

Work has been undertaken to extend the Welsh Network of Healthy School Schemes to pre-school settings. The opportunity has been taken to link this work with Sustainable Development, through the new Healthy and Sustainable Pre-School Scheme. Small grants have been made available for the roll-out, and a range of professionals have been trained to support implementation.

Local quality of life

Tidy Towns is an initiative between Keep Wales Tidy and Welsh local authorities which is funded by the Welsh Government. Keep Wales Tidy delivers the community engagement element across Wales and empowers the people of Wales to take responsibility for their local environment. Protecting wildlife is a crucial part and over 370 projects have been carried out to improve or maintain areas for the benefit of protected or endangered species. In addition to this, over 1500 projects have been

⁸ <http://www.planethealthcymru.org/> resource

completed to improve habitats for biodiversity across Wales, including the removal of Japanese Knotweed, Himalayan Balsam and rhododendron.

Local Service Boards (LSBs)

LSBs across Wales are developing innovative sustainable approaches to service delivery, for example Cardiff's award-winning neighbourhood management approach. This focuses on collaboration between partners to reduce the socio-economic differences between neighbourhoods and has since been adopted in Torfaen, Neath Port Talbot as well as in rural areas such as Powys.

LSBs are also providing leadership on carbon reduction; Flintshire LSB is working with key partners such as North Wales police, the NHS trust and Deeside College and has identified potential for savings of £80m by 2050 by improving energy use. In Gwynedd the LSB has set targets for carbon emission reductions from energy and transport of 15-20% by 2013. Monmouthshire, Powys and Carmarthenshire LSBs have provided a similar focus on joined-up service delivery to achieve measurable reductions in carbon emissions.

The Welsh Government has a WEFO approved £13 million European Social Fund (ESF) project to develop Local Service Boards and deliver priority projects. One of the 5 generic themes running through this is sustainable development. This provides the collective leadership capacity and the ability to pool expertise locally, and join up with national leadership and capacity. Going forward this will include network events, promoted through the local LSB development officers, to bring together representatives from public service organisations, target those that are not experts on sustainability and deliver specialist training.

Global citizenship and international engagement

The Wales for Africa programme seeks to support Welsh efforts to help deliver the UN Millennium Development Goals to halve global poverty by 2015. It reflects the continued desire for Wales to be an outward-facing nation that confidently recognises the contribution we can make to the world as active and responsible global citizens.

By the end of 2010-11 the Wales Africa Community Links project had supported 166 community-based projects, tackling poverty in Africa and providing benefits to those involved in Wales. The UN Development Programme endorsed the initiative as leading the world by example.

The 23+ Wales for Africa Health Links continued to improve their impact, providing essential and life-saving training to healthcare workers in Africa, supporting women in childbirth and providing bicycles and motorbike ambulances to transport people in the remotest rural areas to their clinics and hospitals.

We also continued to work with the Somali community in South Wales to develop development focussed Wales-Somaliland community initiatives, and supported other African Diaspora groups in Wales – from Zimbabwe, the Democratic Republic of Congo and elsewhere – to develop their activities in support of their homeland.

In October 2010 the Counsel General officially launched an innovative new regional partnership project hosted by the UN Development Programme (funded by the UK and Danish Governments), for Wales to assist the region of Mbale in Uganda to tackle climate change. The devastating effects of climate change are already being felt in Mbale and impacting on the poorest people. Earlier in 2010 a mudslide on mountain slopes in Mbale, caused by heavy rain and exacerbated by deforestation, killed around 300 people from poor farming communities. Work has now begun with a project to plant up to 1 million trees in the Mbale region in conjunction with the Size of Wales project.

The Fair Trade Nation campaign continued to grow, with 80% of local authorities and just under half of all Welsh towns having gained Fairtrade status.

Action 12 - Our flagship programme, Communities First, will be reconfigured to ensure it will be more focussed on sustainable outcomes for local people and communities whilst tackling economic inactivity, child poverty and promoting income maximisation.

Communities First is the Welsh Governments programme for tackling poverty and disadvantage in the most deprived communities in Wales.

The programme focuses on sustainable improvements to outcomes for communities, reducing inequality and promoting Social Justice. The Communities First Outcomes Fund is helping to achieve greater integration of local activity, through community empowerment, with key local service providers.

Action 13 - We will invest £190 million in public health and health improvement through the Public Health Strategic Framework for Wales, “Our Healthy Future” which will improve the quality and length of life and improve equity in health.

A key principle of Our Healthy Future is the adoption of a *Health in All Policies* approach, encouraging the development of policies and strategies by the Welsh Government and public sector partners that are health-enhancing and do not promote factors which contribute to poor health. It is only through this concerted action on the broader determinants of health that we will be able to create a healthy sustainable Wales with fairer outcomes for all.

Fairer Health Outcomes For All (FHOFA): Reducing Inequities in Health Strategic Action Plan was published in March 2011. The FHOFA plan:

- Sets out a vision for improved health and wellbeing for all, with the pace of improvement increasing in proportion to the level of disadvantage; and
- Sets a new target to improve healthy life expectancy for everyone and to reduce the differences in deprivation between different groups in Wales.

Action 14 - We will ensure that sustainable development will be made a core objective for the restructured NHS in all it does, by giving clear duties to the new bodies to demonstrate best practice in planning and design, building, transport, waste management, and in use of energy and water.

We have built sustainable development commitments into the governance requirements of the new NHS bodies (created as a result of the NHS reform that came into effect in 2009/10) following advice from the Wales Audit Office and the Sustainable Development Commission. A new Sustainable Development Working Group drawing together NHS representatives and government officials has been set up to follow through on this.

The NHS has continued to focus hard on reducing energy consumption and emissions. In addition, we are taking forward arrangements for transport planning, and looking at how sustainable development can be taken forward within the national programmes set up to support planning in the new Local Health Boards. Most recently, the NHS has been changing the emphasis from not just building energy use and travel to also address broader carbon generation issues with a view to producing a low carbon strategy for the NHS in Wales. To facilitate this, work has proceeded on producing a carbon footprint for the NHS in Wales which will inform the direction and content of the low carbon strategy.

Action 15 - We will ensure that every community in Wales is encouraged to join the Gold Star Community scheme to link with a community in sub-Saharan Africa, and will support them in helping to develop whilst building community cohesion at home.

Over 2010-11 Wales Africa Community Links, funded by the Wales for Africa programme has grown to support a network of 85 linking organisations who through volunteer action are delivering over 160 small-scale, innovative development projects improving livelihoods, environment, youth, health and social harmony of communities in Wales and Africa. During 2010-11 the programme has delivered:

- A new website, www.walesafrica.org, which brings together the network of community linking organisations and projects with good practise resources, funding information, news and events.
- A baseline report 'Welsh Civil Society and the Millennium Development Goals' which provides a first published analysis of the nature of Wales' contribution to the MDGs. This is accompanied by a short film profiling the contribution of Welsh organisations to MDGs.
- A new training programme 'Making a Difference in International Development,' which draws expertise to develop the capacity and skills of Welsh organisations in planning, funding, campaigning, impact assessment and communicating international projects. This is in addition to the now established Wales Africa Community Links annual conference, held this year at CAT in Machynlleth.
- Small grants (of £750 - £3,000) have been dispersed to 48 community linking projects, to support development of Welsh organisations, volunteers and partnership projects
- Development support and advice has been taken up extensively by voluntary groups, with over 150 project visits focused upon supporting links to progress through the steps of UN Gold Star framework.

Chapter 6 The Wellbeing of Wales

Vision: A fair, just and bilingual Wales, in which citizens of all ages and backgrounds are empowered to determine their own lives, shape their communities and achieve their full potential

Headline indicator of Sustainable Development: Wellbeing in Wales

Progress:

There has been little change in the physical and mental wellbeing scores since 2003/04. The mean physical and mental component scores for women are lower than those for men, indicating poorer health and wellbeing for women.

In 2009/10, the National Survey for Wales found that 85 per cent of adults were satisfied with their life overall, whilst 4 per cent were dissatisfied.

• Education

The percentage of all pupils at Key Stage 2 achieving the core subject indicator has increased from 61 per cent in 1999 to 78 per cent in 2010. The percentage of young people in Wales aged 19-21 with at least a NQF level 2 qualification has been relatively stable since 2001. The percentage of adults with an NQF level 4 qualification has increased since 2001. More women now have a level 4 qualification than men.

• Childhood poverty

The percentage of children in Wales in relative low-income households after housing costs has decreased since 1994/97, but has risen in recent years. Until recently, relative low-income households before housing costs followed a similar trend. Since 2005/08, the percentage of children in Wales in relative low-income households before housing costs has decreased.

• Pensioner poverty

There has been a small decrease in the percentage of pensioners in relative low-income households before housing costs. The percentage of pensioners in relative low-income households after housing costs has decreased substantially. Both before and after housing costs have reached their lowest level since 1994/97.

• Workless households

From 1997 to 2000, there was little change in the percentage of people aged 16-64 living in workless households. However, there was a decrease between 2001 and 2008, before increasing in 2009 and 2010. The figures for the percentage of children living in workless households have followed a similar pattern. In 2010, 17 per cent of children lived in workless households.

• Active community participation

From 2001 the percentage of people volunteering on a formal or informal basis at least once a month in the 12 months have fluctuated year on year. These changes were not statistically significant.

• Welsh language

The percentage of pupils assessed in Welsh at the end of Key Stages 1, 2 and 3 have all increased since 2000.

A Fair Society

Tackling Child Poverty is a key priority for the Welsh Government and this is reflected within the Communities First programme. In Blaenau Gwent a gap in supporting families was identified within the Team Around the Child (TAC) process. A project has now been developed and is delivered by Communities First Partnerships working closely with the borough. By March 2011, it had recruited, trained and empowered 53 volunteers to befriend and engage families with children between the ages of 5 and 18 improving the families' access to new and existing services.

This process has seen volunteers complimenting the work of both voluntary and statutory services throughout the TAC process in improving outcomes for children, young people and their families in Blaenau Gwent.

The project is underpinned by the belief that the unique support that is being offered by volunteers has assisted families to integrate and to build confidence within their own family circle as well as the wider community.

Lifelong learning

Education for Sustainable Development and Global Citizenship

Education for Sustainable Development and Global Citizenship (ESDGC) is an integral component of the Foundation Phase Framework for Children's Learning for 3 to 7-year-olds in Wales. It is embedded within the school curriculum for Wales for 3 to 19 year-olds. All curriculum guidance to promote sustainable development is produced bilingually and applies to all settings, English medium, Welsh medium and bilingual schools.

ESDGC has a clear place in subjects of the National Curriculum, such as science and geography. It is also one of the five themes in the personal and social education framework for 7 to 19-year-olds in Wales.

For learners aged 7 to 14 years old, there are opportunities to learn about ESDGC in most subjects, most explicitly in geography, design technology and science. It also features in the Learning Core of Learning Pathways 14-19 and in the Welsh Baccalaureate Qualification.

To support schools in Wales with the delivery of ESDGC / sustainable development, we have commissioned new bilingual teaching resources for use in Foundation Phase settings and primary schools, through our needs identification process.

ESDGC also features prominently in the Estyn Common Inspection Framework. When making judgements about the quality of provision in schools, inspectors consider the extent to which:

- the curriculum and extra-curricular activities help pupils to develop the knowledge, understanding, skills and values of ESDGC;
- the school acts sustainably, for example in using energy, minimising waste and recycling.

21st Century Schools

The 21st Century Schools programme helps to ensure that school buildings and the way they are managed will reinforce positive messages on how sustainable development principles work in practice. The programme was launched in March 2010. The Transitional Phase is currently running prior to actual commencement of the Programme. The programme will deliver, amongst other things, a 21st Century Schools Standard for all schools in Wales which will reduce recurrent costs, energy consumption and carbon emissions. The standard will be available in July 2011.

14-19 Learning Pathways

Through 14-19 Learning Pathways, the Welsh Government is seeking to ensure that young people are able to develop the skills that they need and obtain the qualifications they require for high skilled employment or higher education. 14-19 Learning Pathways contributes to the Welsh Government's Sustainable Development indicator 24b, of increasing the percentage of people aged 19-21 with at least a National Qualification Framework level 2 qualification.

Further Education

FE Colleges are engaged in delivering ESDGC and many of them are delivering sustainable development practices through both their estates and curriculum. The remit letter that was issued to FE colleges in March 2011 encourages each institution to sign up to the Welsh Government's Sustainable Development Charter.

Higher Education

The Higher Education Academy provides support and leadership to the HE sector Education for Sustainable Development and Global Citizenship Group, which offers a forum for developing and sharing best practice. Each Higher Education Institution (HEI) is represented on this group, which also links to the continuing work undertaken by University of Wales Newport, and Swansea University, on the UN Regional Centre of Expertise.

The Higher Education Funding Council for Wales continues to work in partnership with the Carbon Trust Wales, and the Environmental Association of Universities and Colleges to deliver improved environmental sustainability. Five HEIs have externally verified environmental management systems in place and it is anticipated that this will shortly increase to seven.

Youth Service

The Youth Service in Wales aims to promote and actively encourage opportunities for all young people between the ages of 11 and 25 to fulfil their potential as empowered individuals and as members of groups and communities. Youth Workers support young people through significant changes in their lives. During the life of the National Youth Service Strategy 2007 -2010 over 300,000 young people were engaged.

Adult Community Learning

Local Authorities receive direct funding from the Welsh Government for Adult Community Learning (ACL) provision. Work is being undertaken within the sector on developing methods of embedding ESDGC practices within delivery of ACL provision.

Work-based Learning

Between April 2010 and March 2011, we funded the National Training Federation of Wales (the representative body for Work Based Learning providers) to deliver workshops with Ymlaen Ceredigion to facilitate the embedding of ESDGC by raising awareness and developing sector specific resources that could be used to provide an integrated approach to the delivery of ESDGC. The workshops have been held and the resources are due to be completed by September this year.

A rich and diverse culture

Welsh Language

The Welsh Government is committed to seeing the Welsh language thrive and 2010-2011 has seen the following key developments: the Welsh Language Measure, a consultation on a new Welsh Language Strategy and a revised Welsh Language Scheme. The Welsh Language (Wales) Measure received Royal Assent in February 2011. Amongst other things, the Measure:

- confirms the official status of the Welsh language;
- creates a new system of placing duties on bodies to provide services through the medium of Welsh;
- creates a Welsh Language Commissioner with strong enforcement powers to protect the rights of Welsh speakers to access services through the medium of Welsh; and
- creates a Welsh Language Partnership Council to advise Government on its strategy in relation to the Welsh language.;

In December 2010 we launched our consultation on a strategy for the Welsh Language: A Living Language: A Language for Living, which sets out our vision for the language and what we will do, together with our partners, to increase the numbers who speak and use the language.

In March 2011 we produced a revised Welsh Language Scheme to show our continued commitment to the Welsh language and our commitment to improved compliance. It provides our Welsh-speaking customers with a clear indication of the service they can expect from us.

Historic Environment

Cadw's programme of urban characterisation studies to identify the historic development and distinctiveness of particular areas has continued as a foundation for sustainable regeneration schemes. Studies have been completed and reports produced for Aberdare, Dolgellau, Flint, Caernarfon Waterfront, Denbigh, Blaenau

Ffestiniog, Pontypool, Aberystwyth and Cefn Mawr area of Wrexham. Following a study of Merthyr Tydfil, a report is currently being drafted. Work on these studies is supported by close liaison with the relevant local authorities and our Strategic Regeneration Division.

Through the Heritage Tourism Project (HTP) Cadw has provided funding toward a comprehensive programme at City and Council of Swansea's Oystermouth Castle which started in September 2010 designed to improve access to the site and its appeal to visitors. At Strata Florida Abbey, the HTP has funded a complete overhaul of the visitor centre which opened to the public in April 2011 as well as extensive external interpretive and presentation improvement works all aimed at helping visitors better to understand and appreciate this iconic Welsh abbey.

Action 16 - Working with our partners we will deliver against all priority actions in the Education for Sustainable Development and Global Citizenship Action Plan by the end of 2009, and from this we will update and review the plan to provide a renewed focus from 2010-2014.

The successful establishment of the Education for Sustainable Development and Global Citizenship (ESDGC) agenda over recent years, including the implementation of the previous Action Plan, has resulted in a maturing of understanding and engagement in ESDGC. The Welsh Government is focussed on mainstreaming the ESDGC agenda with related programmes and policies, while seeking increased accessibility and learner engagement. This approach reflects progress to date, and that guidance for educational sectors and, in some instances, Estyn inspection arrangements on ESDGC, is now also in place.

Action 17 - We will implement a programme of action outlined in the Historic Environment Strategic Statement including the conservation of a range of iconic Welsh cultural heritage sites, promoting sustainable techniques and traditional skills, as well as achieving improved physical and intellectual access for the public.

In March 2011 Cadw published a set of Conservation Principles for the sustainable management of the Historic Environment in Wales. These will inform our approach to the protection and management of the historic environment as a whole.

Cadw launched a public consultation in March 2011 on the establishment of Register of Historic Battlefields in Wales. The consultation is seeking views on Welsh Ministers' proposed policies for the identification, protection and management of significant battlefields.

The programme of work under the Welsh Cultural Heritage Initiative continued in 2010-11, to conserve and promote public access to medieval sites of particular importance to Welsh nationhood. Major conservation work was completed at Deganwy Castle, Sycharth Castle, Glyndyfyrdwy, Llys Rhosyr, Machynlleth Parliament building and Nevern Castle.

Cadw has also delivered a programme of works entitled 'Eco-lighting' during 2010-11, encompassing new interior LED lighting at visitor centres, replacement flood lighting

with LED units at sixteen monuments in state care, LED illumination of historic town walls at three towns and installation of micro-hydro power generation at a Dyfi Furnace near Machynlleth. Energy consumption and carbon dioxide emissions have been already been reduced by 53% in respect of the services replaced.

Action 18 - We will ensure that Wales is recognised internationally as a leading sustainable tourism destination as set out in the Sustainable Tourism Framework by incorporating sustainability aims into all our tourism promotion and development by 2011, followed by a review in 2014 to refresh the programme of commitments.

VisitWales refers to typical visitors to Wales as 'Independent Explorers', they are interested in Wales' heritage, culture, natural, historic environmental landscape as well as activities such as walking, cycling and other adventure activities based on the built and natural heritage of Wales.

According to the Visitor Survey 2009

- 72% of survey respondents endorsed the statement that choosing a holiday destination that preserves its culture and heritage was very important.
- 3/10 rated their trip as excellent in terms of giving them a 'unique Welsh cultural experience'.
- 15% responded that Wales' scenery, landscape and countryside were the main reasons for visiting.
- 85% of respondents strongly agreed that Wales has beautiful scenery.

Our 2009 Visitor Survey also revealed that almost three quarters of visitors to Wales chose their holiday destination because it preserved its culture and heritage; that 18% of UK based visitors and 26% of overseas visitors actively looked for environmentally friendly accommodation; that 30% of respondents agreed Wales offered the opportunity to take an environmentally friendly family break; and 25% of overnighting tourists visited an eating establishment because Welsh food was on the Menu.

The findings from our 2009 visitors' survey show an appreciation of Welsh culture, landscape, natural and physical environment. Building on this our forthcoming 2011 visitor survey will hopefully demonstrate a growing trend for Wales being recognised as a sustainable holiday destination.

Accounting for Sustainability Report – Welsh Government 2010-11

KEY INDICATORS	DIRECT IMPACTS		INDIRECT IMPACTS	Industry	
	← Achievements	Non-financial indicators Targets and narrative	Sustainable Development Commission Target ² / Benchmark Information → Customer/Supplier indicators		
Climate Waste and resource indicators					
Emissions <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ CO₂ equivalent emissions <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Sustainability expenditure - Offset expenditure - Carbon equivalent liability ▪ Other significant emissions <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Sustainability expenditure 	Green Dragon Level 5 extended across the entire administrative estate.	Maintain Green Dragon level 5 or equivalent during 2011/12 across the administrative estate.	Sustainable Development Commission Target ² / Benchmark Information Departments to work towards an accredited certified environmental management system such as ISO14001 or EMAS	Sustainable procurement is essential in reducing the environmental footprint of the organisation and its supply chains. Formulation of contract specifications and effective contract management is key to achieving improved sustainability of business operations across all areas of environmental impact.	
Waste <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Sustainability expenditure ▪ Hazardous waste <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Total disposal cost ▪ Non hazardous waste <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Total disposal cost Waste Electronic and Electrical Equipment (WEEE) Regulations <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Cathays Park - Other Green Dragon Offices 	Total waste arisings in kg per m² down 13% against the baseline. 67% of office waste sent for recycling. All obsolete ICT equipment and miscellaneous waste electrical items from the office are sent for reuse and recycling. Recycling has risen in percentage terms since 2006, but there is still scope to reduce total waste and to recycle more. 60% Increase in the amount of food waste being recycled at Cathays Park	Reduce waste arisings by 5% by 2010 relative to 2006-07 (25% by 2020) per FTE [2% per annum] Increase recycling to 80% of waste arisings by 2010 [70% in 2009 in Level 5 Offices]	Reduce waste arisings by 5% by 2010 relative to 2004-05 (25% by 2020) Increase recycling to 40% of waste arisings by 2010 (by 75% by 2020)	A debate on sustainable procurement in Plenary on 25 November 2008 emphasised the importance and value of the Welsh Assembly Government leading the sustainable agenda by example, with its own sustainable practices held as a benchmark for Wales. In January 2009 the Assembly Government's Business Group (BG) reaffirmed their commitment to making the Welsh Assembly Government an exemplar organisation over sustainable procurement and to champion the sustainable agenda within Departments. BG tasked Value Wales with leading the establishment of a cross Departmental project to review the Assembly Government's sustainable procurement performance and deliver improvements through the integration of the Sustainable Procurement Assessment Framework (SPAF).	
Finite resource usage <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Water <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Operating expenditure - Sustainability expenditure 	Water consumption in the Cathays Park office has decreased by 16.5% in 2010 Average water consumption within the main Environmental Management System offices has decreased from 11m³ in 2009 to 8.4m³ in 2010	Reduce water consumption by 25% on the core administrative estate by 2020, relative to 2006/2007 levels. [2% per annum from Level 5 Offices] Offices to not exceed 4m ³ water/FTE/annum consumption benchmark Reduce water consumption to an average 3m ³ per person/year for all new office builds and major office refurbishments	Reduce water consumption by 25% on the office and non-office estate by 2020, relative to 2004/2005 levels. The target for the Government estate is based on an independent study carried out by CIRIA on water use in offices which suggests an average of 4 m ³ per employee per year for all offices Reduce water consumption to an average 3m ³ per person / year for all new office builds or major office refurbishments		

Accounting for Sustainability Report – Welsh Government 2010-11

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Energy consumption <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Operating expenditure - Sustainability expenditure 	<p>A co-ordinated approach has been developed by the administrative Environmental Management Team to reduce carbon emissions; through investment in both dedicated energy saving measures and the Capital Works Programme.</p> <p>In 2010/11 we continued to invest in carbon reduction projects through our Carbon Management Programme. This was in addition to projects with energy efficiency aspects funded through the Estate Capital Works Programme.</p> <p>CO2 emissions on the administrative estate were reduced by 2.6% in 2010/11 compared with 2009/10, which is equivalent to 322 tonnes of co2.</p> <p>A comparison of the period 2006/07 to 2010/11 identified that there was a cumulative 10.2% net reduction in emissions, which is equivalent to 1,379 tonnes of co2.</p> <p>Electricity co2 emissions at Cathays Park have reduced by 5% since 2009/10.</p> <p>There are 12 Display Energy Certificates displayed in the main WG administrative offices. 9 out of the 12 sites achieved a grade D or above.</p>	<p>30% reduction in carbon dioxide equivalent (CO2e) emissions by December 2010 from the core administrative estate and business travel from the 2006/07 baseline year¹. [10% per annum from Level 5 Offices]</p> <p>Energy Efficiency to be considered¹</p>	<p>CARBON EMISSIONS FROM OFFICES Reverse the current upward trend in carbon emissions by April 2007. Reduce carbon emissions by 12.5% by 2010-11, relative to 1999/2000 levels. Reduce carbon emissions by 30% by 2020, relative</p> <p>ENERGY EFFICIENCY FROM BUILDINGS Departments to increase their energy efficiency per m² by 15% by 2010, relative to 1999/2000 levels.</p> <p>Departments to increase their energy efficiency per m² by 30% by 2020, relative to 1999/2000 levels.</p>		
<p>Construction and Building Maintenance</p>	<p>New builds at Aberystwyth and Llandudno Junction built to BREEAM 'Excellent' standards.</p> <p>Biomass heating and natural ventilation key features at both sites.</p>	<p>'Excellent' Building Research Establishment Environmental Assessment Method (BREEAM) for all new builds and 'very good', aspiring to 'excellent' for all major refurbishments.</p> <p>From 2011 all new build on WAG core administrative estate to be 'zero carbon' in operation^{1, 2}</p>	<p>The application of BREEAM excellent standards, or equivalent, to all new builds and major refurbishments (at least 'very good'). (Government to Mandate)</p>		
<p>Procurement and Office Consumption</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Renewable Electricity - Paper - Publications 	<p>We have run a project to embed sustainable procurement throughout the Welsh Government during 2010.</p> <p>79% of electricity supply contracts are now green tariff (supplying 81% of electricity consumed).</p> <p>Paper consumption is 38% lower than in 2006/07</p> <p>Everyday use of recycled paper increased</p>	<p>To meet Sustainable Procurement Assessment Framework (SPAF) Level 5 by 2009-10 [Level 3 by 2008-09]</p> <p>To utilise Sustainable Procurement Risk Assessment (SPRA) on all contracts over £25k</p> <p>SD ACTION PLAN 04-07 Procure 100% renewable electricity across the estate by 2010</p>	<p>Accepted elements from the Sustainable Procurement Task Force National Action Plan</p> <p>Source at least 10% electricity from renewables (31 March 08) and 15% electricity from CHP (2010)</p>		

Accounting for Sustainability Report – Welsh Government 2010-11

	<p>from 73% to 77% in 2010/11 compared to 2009/10.</p> <p>All of our publications are produced on recycled paper.</p>				
<p>Transport</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Conferencing Technology - Ministerial Travel Travel Planning - Aberystwyth new build - Llandudno Junction new build - Commuting 	<p>19% decrease in emissions from private car use.</p> <p>Emissions from air travel decreased by 47% and train by 24%</p> <p>Our Travel to Work priorities are: improvements to public transport provision; car-sharing; promotion of cycling opportunities; development of a Parking Policy.</p> <p>Our Parking Policy provides incentives for car sharers. Car sharing teams are given preferential allocation of parking spaces at Cathays Park.</p> <p>Our tax-free 'Cycle to Work' Scheme opened during 2010/11. .</p>	<p>Reduce carbon emissions from road vehicles used for WAG business travel by 30% by December 2010 relative to 2006/07 levels¹ [10% per annum]</p>	<p>CARBON EMISSIONS FROM ROAD VEHICLES</p> <p>Reduce carbon emissions from road vehicles used for Government administrative operations by 15% by 2010/11 relative to 2005/06 levels</p>		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Other finite materials - Sustainability expenditure 					
<p>Environmental incidents</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Fines 	<p>Number</p>				<p>Zero incidents</p>