

Copy of email issued by Davina Fiore on 4 December 2020 to Cllr Rees and Cllr Williams

Dear Cllr Rees and Cllr Williams,

Further to our meeting on Monday, and our exchange of emails, I thought it would be helpful to write and explain to you the context of the population projections provided by the Council to the Boundary Commission on 31st May 2019, to give you a fuller understanding of the Council's position.

These were provided at the time when Boundary Commission had given a preliminary indication that its focus in the review would be on wards and communities where there was significant under representation.

To be clear, the community projections did use housing development information. It was applied at the community level under the assumption that this was distributed evenly across the ward and so was applied to each community within the ward on a pro rata basis.

My understanding is that generally the planning department capture and publish development data at the ward level. For some of the wards, due to the way the data is coded, they would be able to provide the information at the community level (i.e. Creigiau/St Fagans, Pontprennau/Old St Mellons, Whitchurch & Tongwynlais). For example, developments in Pontprennau are given a different code to those in Old St Mellons so the two areas are easily distinguishable. However, this is not the case for many of the communities such as Castle, Llanedeyrn, Pontcanna, Thornhill, Tremorfa and the communities within Pentyrch and Radyr. Therefore, it does not appear to have been possible to apply a uniform methodology across the whole of Cardiff unless the pro rata split is used. It seems that the pro rata split was the only available option for producing the projections in a consistent way across Cardiff. Technically speaking, the housing developments could have been assigned to each of the communities. However, this would have been an enormous task, certainly not possible within the timescale and the resources available, and it would have entailed each case file being accessed individually and assigned to an area. In addition, I am told that it is possible that information on some historical cases may no longer have been accessible/available.

The Council carefully considered its approach when developing its 2024 Electorate Projections. The provision, collation and assessment of data to be used to provide these projections involved a range of individuals and services and a considerable amount of effort to ensure that the Council made the best possible forecasts to support the Boundary Commission review. As we have previously informed you, there is no specific methodology prescribed by the Boundary Commission that the Council should have used. The projected data at ward level included the development proposal information for all 29 wards and the methodology used by the Council was applied consistently across the whole of the Council area. This provided the most accurate projections possible within the timescales required by the Boundary Commission. A copy of the methodology was included in several emails to the Boundary Commission. In terms of community projections, the Council confirmed to the Commission "that we utilised the same proportional breakdown methodology as undertaken in preparing the Electoral Ward forecast to obtain the estimate".

With the benefit of hindsight, this explanation of the methodology underpinning the community projections could have been clearer. However, Lee Clarke has confirmed to Paul and myself that he believes that at the time the best possible projections that could reasonably be expected were produced and submitted to the Boundary Commission. He has confirmed that he and Gary were only able to produce the second iteration of the Pontprennau and Old St Mellons projections which Gary provided to you on 27th November 2020 due to the way cases are coded within this ward, but this

could not have been applied across the whole of the Cardiff communities at the time Rhys submitted the projections to the Boundary Commission on 31st May 2019. The Council produced these more detailed projections for Old St Mellons and Pontprennau for you at your request to assist you in making further representations on the review.

I hope this helps you to understand the Council's position.

We agreed when we met that the Council would write to the Boundary commission to clarify how the original projections were drawn up, and to provide the subsequent more detailed projections for Old St Mellons and Pontprennau which were drawn up at your request. We will be confirming the contents of this email to them, and providing them with a copy of Gary Jones's email of 27th November early next week. As the Boundary Commission does not have a further role in the process unless the Minister refers anything back to them, we will also provide the same clarification to Welsh Government Officials for them to take into account if they wish.

Best wishes,

Davina