

**From:** Rugg, Ian (E&M - Landscapes, Nature & Forestry)

**Sent:** 20 October 2021 09:04

**To:** Martin Worsley [Redacted s.40]; 'Cate Barrow' [Redacted s.40]; 'ruth metcalfe' [Redacted s.40]

**Cc:** Reed, Eleanor [Redacted s.40]; Julie Holloway [Redacted s.40]; 'Shaw, Gill' [Redacted s.40]; Porter, Helen (E&M - Landscapes, Nature & Forestry) [Redacted s.40]; McCullough, Paul (E&M - Landscapes, Nature & Forestry) [Redacted s.40]

**Subject:** FW: Impact of solar PV sites on land and soil R&D - Version 2 comments from NE / WG

Hi Martin / Ruth

*(Cate and ccs for info)*

**FW: Impact of solar PV sites on land and soil R&D - Version 2 comments from NE / WG**

Please find attached the WP1 literature review (Version 2 attached) which includes comments from WG and those from Eleanor Reed in NE. The reviewers (Arwel, Eleanor and myself) are all happy with this version and think it has addressed the comments from Version 1. This is a good piece of work and my thanks to the authors. I look forward to seeing the next WPs. There are a few things that need addressing but none of these should take much time, mostly small edit suggestions.

General comments from myself and Arwel are:

- 1 The minerals section (3.4) is a bit thin and needs expanding in the way ADAS have done with Section 3.3 preceding. The ADAS experience information is really useful.
- 2 The Exec summary has changed quite a bit but I don't think this is a problem.
- 3 I think nearly all our initial comments have been addressed and there is a good reference section with links.
- 4 There is quite a bit of new material included, compared to Version 1, which is good.
- 5 There could be more mention about R&D on soil carbon changes during the lifespan of a site. This is mentioned but could be expanded (see comment in background – *“Useful to say if any R&D specific to solar PV has been undertaken and also if these benefits are greater than land use change alone – i.e. does solar have added benefit for carbon or the same benefit as simply changing land use?”*) I appreciate this may be covered in other WPs but a bit more in the lit review would be useful. Carbon benefits over the lifecycle of a site are a commonly quoted in developer documents, so this is an important area.
- 6 Linked to 5 (above) I'm not sure if the general issue the benefits of solar PV sites possibly being short lived is covered. A similar issue is could the benefits of solar PV sites be achieved through set aside or simple land use change. This is likely to be covered in other WPs though. Again, the benefits of solar PV on soil carbon, structure etc. are often quoted in developer documents but how long these benefits last after decommissioning is not really known I think?

Comments from Eleanor are below:

*“I have gone through the revised report and would agree that the majority of comments from the previous version have been considered and are reflected in this new version.*

*The report provides a good summary of the current understanding of the impact of solar PV on agricultural land and soils. The addition of personal experience from ADAS staff adds additional context to the report which is good to understand.*

*I would agree with your comments Ian, particularly regarding the need to expand the minerals section. My only additional comment would be the need for additional clarification in Section 3.1 (pg 6) and again in the Conclusions. The section needs to highlight that the ALC system is the same for England and Wales; but that the currently available mapping differs, so that at present, only the Provisional ALC mapping is available for England.”*

Many thanks

Ian

Ian Rugg M.I. Soil Sci.

[Sec 21 exemption - WP1 Report previously released under FOI release 15722: Soil Policy]

Sganiwyd y neges hon am bob feirws hysbys wrth iddi adael Llywodraeth Cymru. Mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn cymryd o ddifrif yr angen i ddiogelu eich data. Os cysylltwch â Llywodraeth Cymru, mae ein [hysbysiad preifatrwydd](#) yn esbonio sut rydym yn defnyddio eich gwybodaeth a sut rydym yn diogelu eich preifatrwydd. Rydym yn croesawu gohebiaeth yn Gymraeg. Byddwn yn anfon ateb yn Gymraeg i ohebiaeth a dderbynnir yn Gymraeg ac ni fydd gohebu yn Gymraeg yn arwain at oedi. On leaving the Welsh Government this email was scanned for all known viruses. The Welsh Government takes the protection of your data seriously. If you contact the Welsh Government then our [Privacy Notice](#) explains how we use your information and the ways in which we protect your privacy. We welcome receiving correspondence in Welsh. Any correspondence received in Welsh will be answered in Welsh and corresponding in Welsh will not lead to a delay in responding.

This message has been sent using TLS 1.2 This message has been sent using TLS 1.2 This email and any attachments is intended for the named recipient only. If you have received it in error you have no authority to use, disclose, store or copy any of its contents and you should destroy it and inform the sender. Whilst this email and associated attachments will have been checked for known viruses whilst within the Natural England systems, we can accept no responsibility once it has left our systems. Communications on Natural England systems may be monitored and/or recorded to secure the effective operation of the system and for other lawful purposes.