14 October 2026

Dear

Complaint in respect of ATISN 27495 Caerau Remediation

Thank you for your correspondence of 24 September 2026 which requested an internal review following a request for information on 24 August 2026 regarding the Caerau Remediation Scheme; a response was sent on 22 September 2026.

This covers a request for the following information:

- The disclosure of the names, professional accreditation numbers, and Level 5 Certified Qualifications along with the Level 3 Award in the Energy Efficiency and Retrofit of Traditional Buildings of the specific Retrofit Coordinator and Retrofit Designer who supposedly authored and signed off on the uninsulated downgrade.
- The disclosure of all information, advice, email correspondence, meeting notes, telephone records, or written briefings received by the Welsh Government from Bridgend County Borough Council (BCBC), including communications involving Paul Smith or other officers, that informed our response.

The response of 22 September 2026 identified there was one recorded piece of information, which was provided at that time.

As advised in my acknowledgement letter of 28 September 2026 the internal review will look at whether the response you received complied with our duties under the Environment Information Regulations and whether the recorded information you requested in respect of ATISN 27495 is held. We may not always hold information you have requested.

I have set out below a table of the points raised in your correspondence of 24 September asking for an internal review.

Point raised	Comment
1. The Welsh Government does not hold the Retrofit Coordinator credentials. The ATISN 27495 response states: “I have established that the information you have requested is not held by Welsh Government.” The information requested was the names, accreditation numbers and Level 5 qualifications of the Retrofit Coordinator	I have undertaken a search of our document filing system (iShare) and could not find any records which meet your request. You may wish to contact Bridgend County Borough Council as contract holders for this work.

and Retrofit Designer who supposedly signed off on the “render-only” downgrade.	
2. BCBC and the Welsh Government authorised a leaflet that promised reinstallation. Warmworks’ *Caerau Wall Insulation Scheme – Key Information* leaflet (Enclosure BH) carries the logos of the Welsh Government, BCBC, Warmworks and the National Lottery Community Fund. It states that the scheme would “complete the reinstallation of internal and external wall insulation” and “install all-new, high-quality, eco-friendly wall insulation.”	This is not a request for recorded information. I have searched our records for the *Caerau Wall Insulation Scheme – Key Information* leaflet. The only copies we hold are those included in the correspondence you have sent to us. We do not hold records of any correspondence of this leaflet between the Welsh Government and Bridgend County Borough Council.
3. The meeting of 11 August 2026 was not minuted. The ATISN 27495 response confirms: “No notes were recorded.”	There is no note of this meeting on our document filing system nor in hard copy notebooks.
4. The award does not match the claim. Total awarded to BCBC (ATISN 22052): £2,650,000 Total claimed by BCBC (Alyson Francis): £3,316,555.25 Unexplained difference: £666,555.25 Total scheme funding: £4,171,555.25 Properties with EWI reinstated: 3, all detached Properties receiving render-only: 60	This is not a request for recorded information and was not requested in ATISN 27495. The response to ATISN 22025 in November 2024 notes £2,650,000 was awarded to Bridgend County Borough Council as it sets out funding which was awarded between 1 April 2022 and 31 March 2025. Further to your complaint, my letter to you dated 17 September 2026 includes the following: *The total awarded by the Welsh Government to Bridgend County Borough Council for 2023/24 and 2024/25 was £2,650,000.00 of which a total of £1,376,574.81 was claimed.* It also adds *For 2025/26, a total grant award of £1,940,000.00 was made of which £1,939,980.44 was claimed.* Further funding was awarded to (and claimed) following the response to ATISN 22025; more than £2.65m was

	awarded.
5. The costed line items not delivered. Drying-out contingency: £4,000 per property × 63 properties = £252,000 Internal decoration: £3,000 per property × 63 properties = £189,000 Total: £7,000 per property × 63 properties = £441,000	This is not a request for recorded information.
6. Nobody from the funding department has ever visited the scheme. There is no evidence that anyone from the Housing and Regeneration Department has ever visited the Caerau scheme to see for themselves what is being delivered.	This was not part of the request for ATISN 27495.
7. The roof works may breach Regulation 23 of the Welsh Building Regulations. The same roof treatment was applied across the scheme. Nobody checked.	This is a statement not a request for recorded information.
8. Paul Smith's own admission. In his Stage 1 response of 31 July 2026, Paul Smith stated: "If it was possible to carry out a PAS 2030 compliant installation then we would be very happy to do so." The RLB survey said EWI could be replaced ("YES"). It was not done.	This is a statement and not a request for recorded information.
9. The dichotomy. If everything is above board, the paperwork should be in the possession of BCBC and the Welsh Government, and it should be provided without delay. If everything is above board, then why: • If the Retrofit Coordinator exists, why does the Welsh Government not hold the credentials? • If the work is PAS 2035 compliant, why is there no TrustMark record? • If the roof works are compliant, why was Building Control not consulted?	This is a series of questions not a request for recorded information.

• If the scheme is delivering, why did only three homes receive EWI? • If the funding was used properly, why is there a £666,555.25 discrepancy? • If the drying out was done, why was no scaffolding retained? • If the internal decoration was done, why was it declared “out of scope”? • If the meetings were held, why were no notes recorded? • If the assurance was delivered, why did no contractor attend? • If the processes were followed, why is the Stage 2 response overdue? • If the EIR request was handled correctly, why was it refused under the wrong legal framework?	
10. The difference between then and now. The 2012–13 Arbed failures were discovered afterwards. The audit took nine years. By the time it was conducted, the trail was cold. This time, the failures are being discovered while the scheme is still on site. The documentation should still exist. The evidence can be secured now, before the site demobilises.	The Welsh Government does not hold detailed information about each of the works on site.

Your original request asked for the following, which is not specifically included in the list above

- The disclosure of all information, advice, email correspondence, meeting notes, telephone records, or written briefings received by the Welsh Government from Bridgend County Borough Council (BCBC), including communications involving Paul Smith or other officers, that informed our response.

I have undertaken a search of our document management system to identify any information, advice, emails, notes, telephone records or written briefings relating to your home in Blaencaerau Road and between the Welsh Government and Bridgend County Borough Council, including Paul Smith. I have also asked members of the team to undertake a search of their records, including emails, notebooks, notes and messages with Paul Smith.

I have found no further records which captured by this request.

I have considered your complaint in accordance with the procedure outlined in the Welsh Government's Practical Guide for Making Requests for Information which is

available by post on request or via the internet at: Requesting information from the Welsh Government [HTML] | GOV.WALES

If you remain dissatisfied with this response you have the right to complain to the Information Commissioner. The Information Commissioner can be contacted at:

Information Commissioner's Office,
Wycliffe House,
Water Lane,
Wilmslow,
Cheshire,
SK9 5AF.

Yours sincerely

Director of Housing and Regeneration